

# Challenges to the Movement Against the Illegal, International Market in Organs for Transplantation

Lindsey McKay

PhD Candidate  
Department of Sociology and Anthropology  
Institute of Political Economy  
Carleton University, Ottawa  
[lindseymck@gmail.com](mailto:lindseymck@gmail.com)

CITE ONLY WITH PERMISSION OF THE PRESENTER.

Cite only with permission of the presenter. Please contact me by e-mail at

[lindseymck@gmail.com](mailto:lindseymck@gmail.com)

# Planethospital.com



**\$45,000 to \$55,000 US**

<http://www.planethospital.com/185/Kidney+Transplant>

# Outline

---

1. The Illegal International Market
2. The Movement Against this Market
3. Analyzing the Movement: Prospects for Successful Global Governance

# The Illegal International Market

- Background and Typology
  - National Altruism: voluntary donation, equitable access (dead and live)
  - Individual Altruism: directed donations (live)
  - Commerce: bought/sold/financial gain
- Transplant Tourism

# Ethical Ramifications

- For Organ Sellers



Garwood WHO 2007

[www.cofs.org](http://www.cofs.org)

<http://www.organssos.com/>

# Ethical Ramifications

---

- For Transplant Candidates
- For Society

# Approaches to Curbing the Illegal Market in Organs

1. Decrease Illegitimate Supply
  - Legislation and Criminal Law Enforcement
2. Increase Legitimate Supply
  - Nation-State self-sufficiency (National Altruism)
  - Re-Direct supply from live to dead

# 1 Decrease Illegitimate Supply

## Major Initiatives

- 2010 Pakistani law; Egypt
- 2010 EU ban advertising, certification legal
- Criminal Prosecutions
- 2010 Report of WHO Global Surveillance
- 2009 Council of Europe/UN Report on Trafficking for Organ Transplantation
- 2008 Declaration of Istanbul
- 2006 Vancouver Consensus Statement
- 2004 Amsterdam Consensus Statement
- 2003 Council of Europe Treaty
  - Extra-territoriality
- Statements



# 1 Decrease Illegitimate Supply: Challenges

---

- Political Will
  - 2008 Canada: Bill C-500
- Reliance on the Nation-State

## 2 Increase Legitimate Supply: Challenges

- Approach #2 instead of #1
- Unintended Consequences of National Altruism
  - Donor – Recipient Imbalance
  - Failure
  - Demand

# Analyzing the Movement:

## Prospects for Successful Global Governance

- Efforts are Gaining Momentum
- Many Challenges

# Conclusion

---

Medical tourism should exclude  
transplant tourism

[lindseymck@gmail.com](mailto:lindseymck@gmail.com)