## 1 Supplementary Appendix

Appendix Table 1 reports sample means for our six groups of workers. There are few surprises here. Immigrants are much more likely to belong to a visible minority group than the Canadianborn. Roughly one quarter of sampled immigrants have been in Canada 10 years or less, and they are heavily concentrated in Census Metropolitan Areas and provinces with large cities. In comparison to the Canadian-born, the average immigrant worker is more likely to be male, has higher educational attainment, is more likely to be married and have children, more likely to be employed full time, less likely to belong to a union, and has fewer years of employer seniority.

Appendix Tables 2 through 6 report results of some alternate specifications of our wage regressions. These specifications allow us to assess the contribution of individual characteristics, geographic characteristics, job characteristics, and employer characteristics to wage outcomes. Individual, geographic, and job characteristics were reported in the main text. Employer characteristics include number of employees (4 categories), number of competitors (5 categories), industry (14 categories), the natural logarithm of revenue per worker, and indicators for a minority recruitment program, an employment equity program, a pay equity program, a formal grievance or complaint system, and for non-profit enterprises.

In each of the Appendix tables, we present unconditional estimates in column 1, and conditional estimates in columns 2-6. Column 2 introduces controls for individual characteristics. We add controls for region of residence in column 3 , job characteristics in column 4 , observed employer characteristics in column 5, and unobserved employer characteristics (firm effects) in column 6 . Columns 4 and 6 correspond to the specifications reported in the main text.

There are some surprisingly consistent patterns across specifications. Outcomes conditional on personal characteristics and region of residence are worse than unconditional outcomes, which indicates that adverse wage outcomes of immigrants and visible minorities are partly ameliorated by their personal characteristics and regional sorting. Outcomes are generally better conditional on job and employer characteristics, which indicates that the poor wage outcomes of immigrants are partly due to sorting into low-wage employers and into jobs with low-wage characteristics. As we have seen, the latter is largely the consequence of glass door effects. We note that controlling for observable employer characteristics (column 5) yields estimates that are very similar to the across-firm specifications reported in the main text (column 4 in the Appendix tables). Indeed, the disparity between these estimates and our within-firm estimates (column

6 in the Appendix tables) highlights that glass door effects are strongly related to unobserved employer characteristics.

## APPENDIX TABLE 1

 SAMPLE MEANS|  | Canadian born |  | Non-Recent Immigrants |  | Recent Immigrants |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | White | Visible Minority | White | Visible Minority | White | Visible Minority |
| Number of observations | 47,599 | 820 | 5,025 | 2,759 | 841 | 1,254 |
| $\log$ (hourly wage) | 2.90 | 2.86 | 2.96** | 2.86* | 2.86 | 2.65** |
| Personal Characteristics |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Male | 0.481 | 0.426 | 0.503 | 0.493 | 0.532* | 0.504 |
| Years of experience | 18.34 | 13.7** | 21.7** | 16.2** | 11.9** | 10.8** |
| Age | 41.54 | 35.5** | 46.4** | 43.0** | 37.8** | 38.3** |
| Highest educational attainment |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Ph.D., Master's, or M.D. | 0.038 | 0.045 | 0.072** | 0.071** | 0.146** | 0.088** |
| Other graduate degree | 0.021 | 0.031 | 0.030** | 0.026 | 0.070** | 0.026 |
| Bachelor's degree | 0.125 | 0.206** | 0.130 | 0.208** | 0.218** | 0.277** |
| Some university | 0.088 | 0.112 | 0.076 | 0.081 | 0.114 | 0.071 |
| Completed college | 0.201 | 0.198 | 0.206 | 0.234* | 0.144** | 0.180 |
| Some college or trade certificate | 0.248 | 0.156** | 0.223** | 0.166** | 0.140** | 0.177** |
| High school degree | 0.177 | 0.208 | 0.151** | 0.138** | 0.142 | 0.122** |
| Less than high school $\dagger$ | 0.103 | 0.044** | 0.112* | 0.077** | 0.027** | 0.059** |
| Marital Status |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Single $\dagger$ | 0.159 | 0.398** | 0.114** | 0.188** | 0.144 | 0.123** |
| Married | 0.585 | 0.453** | 0.698** | 0.695** | 0.707** | 0.807** |
| Common law | 0.153 | 0.084** | 0.087** | 0.037** | 0.093** | 0.021** |
| Separated | 0.031 | 0.033 | 0.036 | 0.023 | 0.016* | 0.014** |
| Divorced | 0.062 | 0.029** | 0.052 | 0.045* | 0.036** | 0.027** |
| Widowed | 0.010 | 0.002** | 0.013 | 0.012 | 0.005 | 0.008 |
| Number of Children |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Zero† | 0.421 | 0.578** | 0.392 | 0.296** | 0.440 | 0.313** |
| One | 0.226 | 0.186 | 0.233 | 0.241 | 0.227 | 0.314** |
| Two | 0.260 | 0.155** | 0.252 | 0.345** | 0.278 | 0.288 |
| Three | 0.074 | 0.071 | 0.094** | 0.089* | 0.044** | 0.067 |
| Four or more | 0.019 | 0.009** | 0.029* | 0.029 | 0.011** | 0.017 |
| Region |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Atlantic | 0.082 | 0.026** | 0.018** | 0.004** | 0.016** | 0.004** |
| Quebec | 0.276 | 0.137** | 0.138** | 0.108** | 0.166** | 0.083** |
| Ontario $\dagger$ | 0.353 | 0.439** | 0.569** | 0.596** | 0.563** | 0.580** |
| Manitoba | 0.038 | 0.022** | 0.033 | 0.031* | 0.026** | 0.026** |
| Saskatchewan | 0.034 | 0.013** | 0.008** | 0.007** | 0.001** | 0.010** |
| Alberta | 0.103 | 0.099 | 0.092 | 0.081** | 0.079* | 0.135 |
| British Columbia | 0.114 | 0.263** | 0.142** | 0.173** | 0.149* | 0.162** |
| Census Metropolitan Area (CMA) | 0.649 | 0.829** | 0.849** | 0.955** | 0.902** | 0.903** |

Notes: $\dagger$ indicates reference category for regressions. ** indicates difference from mean of Canadianborn white workers is statistically significant at $5 \%$ level, * indicates this difference is statistically
significant at $10 \%$ level.

APPENDIX TABLE 1, Continued

|  | Canadian born |  | Non-Recent Immigrants |  | Recent <br> Immigrants |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | Visible |  | Visible |  | Visible |
|  | White | Minority | White | Minority | White | Minority |
| Job Characteristics |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Fulltime | 0.698 | 0.718 | 0.756** | 0.779** | 0.776** | 0.812** |
| Member of Union or CBA | 0.297 | 0.213** | 0.276 | 0.225** | 0.167** | 0.121** |
| Years of seniority | 9.43 | 6.47** | 10.4** | 8.46** | 3.41** | 3.50** |
| Occupation |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Manager | 0.140 | 0.156 | 0.152 | 0.149 | 0.137 | 0.071** |
| Professional | 0.174 | 0.214 | 0.195* | 0.184 | 0.224* | 0.227* |
| Technical/Trades | 0.420 | 0.364 | 0.406 | 0.386 | 0.309** | 0.406 |
| Marketing/Sales | 0.062 | 0.067 | 0.043** | 0.075 | 0.117* | 0.062 |
| Clerical/Administrative | 0.146 | 0.150 | 0.123** | 0.111** | 0.134 | 0.151 |
| Production worker $\dagger$ | 0.058 | 0.049 | 0.082** | 0.094** | 0.079** | 0.083** |
| Employer Characteristics |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Number of employees |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 500 or more | 0.222 | 0.210 | 0.239 | 0.187 | 0.166* | 0.121** |
| 100-499 | 0.193 | 0.157 | 0.227** | 0.245** | 0.266** | 0.269** |
| 20-99 | 0.281 | 0.302 | 0.262 | 0.276 | 0.289 | 0.321 |
| Less than $20 \dagger$ | 0.304 | 0.331 | 0.272 | 0.291 | 0.279 | 0.290 |
| Number of competing firms |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Zero | 0.020 | 0.017 | 0.018 | 0.031 | 0.021 | 0.021 |
| 1-5 | 0.263 | 0.279 | 0.249 | 0.250 | 0.347** | 0.280 |
| 6-20 | 0.230 | 0.244 | 0.259** | 0.306** | 0.261 | 0.301 |
| More than $20 \dagger$ | 0.198 | 0.236** | 0.181 | 0.215 | 0.205 | 0.260** |
| Missing | 0.289 | 0.225** | 0.293 | 0.199** | 0.166** | 0.138** |
| Any employment equity program | 0.241 | 0.187** | 0.231 | 0.200** | 0.141** | 0.117** |
| Any pay equity program | 0.265 | 0.173** | 0.259 | 0.202** | 0.162** | $0.115^{* *}$ |
| Formal grievance or complaint system | 0.516 | 0.548 | 0.493* | 0.396** | 0.389** | 0.294** |
| Minority recruitment program | 0.059 | 0.115** | 0.069 | 0.115** | 0.082 | 0.091 |
| Non-profit enterprise | 0.231 | 0.179* | 0.239 | 0.143** | 0.128** | 0.086** |
| Industry |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Resource | 0.019 | 0.008* | 0.009** | 0.007** | 0.002** | 0.029 |
| Labour intensive tertiary manufacturing | 0.042 | 0.067 | 0.073** | 0.099** | 0.077* | 0.086** |
| Primary product manufacturing $\dagger$ | 0.040 | 0.015 | 0.031 | 0.025 | 0.033 | 0.021 |
| Secondary product manufacturing | 0.034 | 0.024 | 0.039 | 0.055* | 0.076** | 0.049 |
| Capital intensive tertiary manufacturing | 0.051 | 0.046 | 0.072** | 0.071** | 0.092** | 0.087** |
| Construction | 0.046 | 0.029* | 0.033** | 0.009** | 0.024** | 0.016** |
| Transportation, warehousing, wholesale | 0.113 | 0.085 | 0.095** | 0.070** | 0.098 | 0.084** |
| Communication and other utilities | 0.025 | 0.012** | 0.018** | 0.016** | 0.005** | 0.008 |
| Retail trade and consumer services | 0.196 | 0.287* | 0.169* | 0.253** | 0.173 | 0.212 |
| Finance and insurance | 0.051 | 0.082** | 0.037** | 0.069** | 0.030 | 0.059 |
| Real estate | 0.018 | 0.017 | 0.018 | 0.012* | 0.017 | 0.013 |
| Business services | 0.092 | 0.104 | 0.124** | 0.120** | 0.207** | 0.201** |
| Education and health services | 0.238 | 0.179 | 0.248 | 0.178** | 0.136** | 0.116** |
| Information and cultural industries | 0.035 | 0.046 | 0.033 | 0.016** | 0.030 | 0.018** |
| $\log$ (revenue per worker) | 11.79 | 11.71 | 11.84** | 11.73 | 11.83 | 11.67* |

Notes: $\dagger$ indicates reference category for regressions. ** indicates difference from mean of Canadianborn white workers is statistically significant at $5 \%$ level, * indicates this difference is statistically significant at $10 \%$ level.

## APPENDIX TABLE 2

ESTIMATES FOR CANADIAN-BORN VISIBLE MINORITIES

|  | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) | (6) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| MEN |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Mean wage differential | $\begin{aligned} & -0.009 \\ & (0.019) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0.020 \\ (0.017) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.018 \\ & (0.016) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.012 \\ & (0.019) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.038^{* *} \\ & (0.015) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.049^{* *} \\ & (0.012) \end{aligned}$ |
| Quantile differential |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 10th percentile | $\begin{gathered} 0.007 \\ (0.032) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0.015 \\ (0.047) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.016 \\ & (0.039) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.026 \\ & (0.023) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.042^{* *} \\ & (0.021) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.083^{* *} \\ & (0.025) \end{aligned}$ |
| Median | $\begin{gathered} 0.008 \\ (0.033) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0.044 \\ (0.046) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.012 \\ & (0.043) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.029 \\ & (0.034) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.050 * * \\ & (0.024) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.024 \\ & (0.039) \end{aligned}$ |
| 90th percentile | $\begin{aligned} & -0.016 \\ & (0.100) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0.007 \\ (0.021) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0.008 \\ (0.033) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0.079 \\ (0.060) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.080^{* *} \\ & (0.031) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} -0.028 \\ (0.033) \end{gathered}$ |
| Representation |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Below 10th percentile | $\begin{aligned} & 0.096^{* *} \\ & (0.000) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.074^{* *} \\ & (0.007) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0.090 \\ (0.008) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0.102 \\ (0.006) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0.107 \\ (0.028) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0.112 \\ (0.014) \end{gathered}$ |
| Below median | $\begin{gathered} 0.476 \\ (0.032) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.424^{* *} \\ & (0.009) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.445 * * \\ & (0.021) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0.491 \\ (0.006) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.526^{*} \\ & (0.015) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0.508 \\ (0.030) \end{gathered}$ |
| Above 90th percentile | $\begin{aligned} & 0.091 * * \\ & (0.001) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.111^{*} * \\ & (0.005) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.115 * * \\ & (0.006) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.145^{* *} \\ & (0.011) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.130 * * \\ & (0.004) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0.107 \\ (0.014) \end{gathered}$ |
| WOMEN |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Mean wage differential | $\begin{gathered} -0.034 \\ (0.023) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.039^{*} \\ & (0.020) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.090 * * \\ & (0.019) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.083^{* *} \\ & (0.021) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.033^{* *} \\ & (0.014) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.063 * * \\ & (0.019) \end{aligned}$ |
| Quantile differential |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 10th percentile | $\begin{aligned} & 0.090^{* *} \\ & (0.018) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} -0.030 \\ (0.061) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0.004 \\ (0.039) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0.012 \\ (0.048) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0.015 \\ (0.064) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.065 \\ & (0.067) \end{aligned}$ |
| Median | $\begin{aligned} & -0.105^{* *} \\ & (0.051) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0.017 \\ (0.017) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.043^{* *} \\ & (0.015) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.115^{* *} \\ & (0.038) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.049 * * \\ & (0.019) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.088^{* *} \\ & (0.025) \end{aligned}$ |
| 90th percentile | $\begin{aligned} & -0.069^{* *} \\ & (0.031) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.039 \\ & (0.076) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.118 * * \\ & (0.018) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.084^{* *} \\ & (0.018) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.067 * \\ & (0.036) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.022 \\ & (0.047) \end{aligned}$ |
| Representation |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Below 10th percentile | $\begin{aligned} & 0.069 * * \\ & (0.001) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.110 * * \\ & (0.002) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0.089 \\ (0.011) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.082^{* *} \\ & (0.000) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0.072 \\ (0.027) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0.114 \\ (0.021) \end{gathered}$ |
| Below median | $\begin{aligned} & 0.556^{* *} \\ & (0.006) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.458^{* *} \\ & (0.016) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0.469 \\ (0.177) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.604^{* *} \\ & (0.031) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.550^{*} \\ & (0.030) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.605^{* *} \\ & (0.037) \end{aligned}$ |
| Above 90th percentile | $\begin{aligned} & 0.078 * * \\ & (0.001) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.076 * * \\ & (0.003) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.076 * * \\ & (0.002) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.075^{* *} \\ & (0.004) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.080 * * \\ & (0.006) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0.116 \\ (0.021) \end{gathered}$ |
| Controls |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Year |  | YES | YES | YES | YES | YES |
| Personal characteristics |  | YES | YES | YES | YES | YES |
| Region |  |  | YES | YES | YES | YES |
| Job characteristics |  |  |  | YES | YES | YES |
| Employer characteristics |  |  |  |  | YES |  |
| Firm effects |  |  |  |  |  | YES |

[^0]
## APPENDIX TABLE 3

ESTIMATES FOR MALE IMMIGRANTS, > 10 YEARS SINCE IMMIGRATION

|  | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) | (6) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| WHITE |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Mean wage differential | $\begin{aligned} & 0.067 * * \\ & (0.009) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.014 \\ & (0.009) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.062^{* *} \\ & (0.008) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.067 * * \\ & (0.008) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.049 * * \\ & (0.007) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.047 * * \\ & (0.006) \end{aligned}$ |
| Quantile differential |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 10th percentile | $\begin{aligned} & 0.083^{*} \\ & (0.041) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.067 * * \\ & (0.025) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.065^{* *} \\ & (0.024) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.059 * * \\ & (0.022) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.038^{* *} \\ & (0.012) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.051^{* *} \\ & (0.014) \end{aligned}$ |
| Median | $\begin{aligned} & 0.077^{* *} \\ & (0.008) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.028^{* *} \\ & (0.012) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.069^{* *} \\ & (0.010) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.066^{* *} \\ & (0.008) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.038^{* *} \\ & (0.011) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.032^{*} \\ & (0.016) \end{aligned}$ |
| 90th percentile | $\begin{aligned} & 0.060^{* *} \\ & (0.021) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.024 \\ & (0.018) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.089 * * \\ & (0.015) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.075 * * \\ & (0.012) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.046^{* *} \\ & (0.013) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.033^{* *} \\ & (0.015) \end{aligned}$ |
| Representation (0.015) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Below 10th percentile | $\begin{aligned} & 0.075 * * \\ & (0.001) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0.099 \\ (0.006) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0.104 \\ (0.006) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0.105 \\ (0.006) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0.104 \\ (0.006) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0.109 \\ (0.015) \end{gathered}$ |
| Below median | $\begin{aligned} & 0.433^{* *} \\ & (0.004) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0.510 \\ (0.010) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.529^{* *} \\ & (0.013) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.530^{* *} \\ & (0.009) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.517^{*} \\ & (0.010) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0.508 \\ (0.010) \end{gathered}$ |
| Above 90th percentile | $\begin{aligned} & 0.116^{* *} \\ & (0.006) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0.094 \\ (0.006) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.084^{* *} \\ & (0.003) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.081^{* *} \\ & (0.003) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.084^{* *} \\ & (0.007) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0.096 \\ (0.005) \end{gathered}$ |
| VISIBLE MINORITY |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Mean wage differential | $\begin{aligned} & -0.087^{* *} \\ & (0.017) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.161^{* *} \\ & (0.012) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.219^{* *} \\ & (0.012) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.192^{* *} \\ & (0.010) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.141^{* *} \\ & (0.008) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.098^{* *} \\ & (0.007) \end{aligned}$ |
| Quantile differential |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 10th percentile | $\begin{aligned} & -0.128^{*} \\ & (0.077) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.229 * * \\ & (0.055) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.240^{* *} \\ & (0.022) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.112 * * \\ & (0.034) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.067^{* *} \\ & (0.014) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.080^{* *} \\ & (0.021) \end{aligned}$ |
| Median | $\begin{aligned} & -0.047^{*} \\ & (0.028) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.138^{* *} \\ & (0.013) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.209 * * \\ & (0.018) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.195 * * \\ & (0.015) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.165^{* *} \\ & (0.013) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.111^{* *} \\ & (0.022) \end{aligned}$ |
| 90th percentile | $\begin{aligned} & -0.050^{* *} \\ & (0.003) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.154^{* *} \\ & (0.028) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.221^{* *} \\ & (0.014) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.180^{* *} \\ & (0.017) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.130^{* *} \\ & (0.017) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.119^{* *} \\ & (0.027) \end{aligned}$ |
| Representation (0.027) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Below 10th percentile | $\begin{aligned} & 0.145 * * \\ & (0.006) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.145 * * \\ & (0.007) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.176^{* *} \\ & (0.013) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.135^{* *} \\ & (0.012) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0.112 \\ (0.009) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0.109 \\ (0.010) \end{gathered}$ |
| Below median | $\begin{aligned} & 0.531 * * \\ & (0.003) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.598^{* *} \\ & (0.008) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.638^{* *} \\ & (0.010) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.664^{* *} \\ & (0.010) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.639^{* *} \\ & (0.013) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.580^{* *} \\ & (0.015) \end{aligned}$ |
| Above 90th percentile | $\begin{aligned} & 0.061 * * \\ & (0.003) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.043^{* *} \\ & (0.002) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.037 * * \\ & (0.003) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.041^{* *} \\ & (0.002) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.054^{* *} \\ & (0.002) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.067 * * \\ & (0.008) \end{aligned}$ |
| Controls |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Year |  | YES | YES | YES | YES | YES |
| Personal characteristics |  | YES | YES | YES | YES | YES |
| Region |  |  | YES | YES | YES | YES |
| Job characteristics |  |  |  | YES | YES | YES |
| Employer characteristics |  |  |  |  | YES |  |
| Firm effects |  |  |  |  |  | YES |

[^1]
## APPENDIX TABLE 4

ESTIMATES FOR FEMALE IMMIGRANTS, > 10 YEARS SINCE IMMIGRATION

|  | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) | (6) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| WHITE |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Mean wage differential | $\begin{aligned} & 0.049 * * \\ & (0.011) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0.001 \\ (0.009) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.054^{* *} \\ & (0.009) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.039 * * \\ & (0.008) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.027 * * \\ & (0.007) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.019 * * \\ & (0.006) \end{aligned}$ |
| Quantile differential |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 10th percentile | $\begin{aligned} & 0.057^{* *} \\ & (0.000) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} -0.007 \\ (0.015) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.083^{* *} \\ & (0.019) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.058^{* *} \\ & (0.015) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.031^{*} \\ & (0.019) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.036 \\ & (0.029) \end{aligned}$ |
| Median | $\begin{aligned} & 0.036^{* *} \\ & (0.013) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} -0.002 \\ (0.010) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.059^{* *} \\ & (0.013) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.041 * * \\ & (0.010) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.022^{* *} \\ & (0.009) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.027^{*} \\ & (0.009) \end{aligned}$ |
| 90th percentile | $\begin{aligned} & 0.065 * * \\ & (0.012) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0.006 \\ (0.018) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.030 \\ & (0.020) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.038^{* *} \\ & (0.013) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.015 \\ & (0.017) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.011 \\ & (0.021) \end{aligned}$ |
| Representation |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Below 10th percentile | $\begin{aligned} & 0.072^{* *} \\ & (0.008) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0.097 \\ (0.006) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.124^{* *} \\ & (0.006) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0.113 \\ (0.012) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0.112 \\ (0.018) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0.104 \\ (0.006) \end{gathered}$ |
| Below median | $\begin{aligned} & 0.448^{* *} \\ & (0.008) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0.491 \\ (0.010) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.516^{* *} \\ & (0.007) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0.513 \\ (0.008) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0.498 \\ (0.013) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.520^{* *} \\ & (0.009) \end{aligned}$ |
| Above 90th percentile | $\begin{aligned} & 0.122^{* *} \\ & (0.003) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0.104 \\ (0.003) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0.097 \\ (0.003) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.081^{*} \\ & (0.011) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0.083 \\ (0.011) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0.094 \\ (0.007) \end{gathered}$ |
| VISIBLE MINORITY |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Mean wage differential | $\begin{aligned} & -0.002 \\ & (0.017) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.066^{* *} \\ & (0.010) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.141^{* *} \\ & (0.010) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.101^{* *} \\ & (0.009) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.074^{* *} \\ & (0.009) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.051^{* *} \\ & (0.010) \end{aligned}$ |
| Quantile differential |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 10th percentile | $\begin{gathered} 0.029 \\ (0.039) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.057^{* *} \\ & (0.023) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.153 * * \\ & (0.035) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.107 * * \\ & (0.017) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.082^{* *} \\ & (0.015) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.046^{* *} \\ & (0.013) \end{aligned}$ |
| Median | $\begin{gathered} -0.027 \\ (0.019) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.061^{* *} \\ & (0.015) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.120^{* *} \\ & (0.014) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.092^{* *} \\ & (0.010) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.085^{* *} \\ & (0.014) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.050^{* *} \\ & (0.014) \end{aligned}$ |
| 90th percentile | $\begin{aligned} & 0.069^{*} \\ & (0.041) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.061^{* *} \\ & (0.019) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.139 * * \\ & (0.024) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.109 * * \\ & (0.016) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.026 \\ & (0.048) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.040 \\ & (0.048) \end{aligned}$ |
| Representation |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Below 10th percentile | $\begin{aligned} & 0.092^{*} \\ & (0.004) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0.115 \\ (0.010) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.143^{*} \\ & (0.023) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.128^{* *} \\ & (0.008) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.126^{* *} \\ & (0.006) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0.103 \\ (0.007) \end{gathered}$ |
| Below median | $\begin{aligned} & 0.509 * * \\ & (0.003) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.547 * * \\ & (0.005) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.604^{* *} \\ & (0.015) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.588^{* *} \\ & (0.014) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.563^{* *} \\ & (0.007) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0.518 \\ (0.014) \end{gathered}$ |
| Above 90th percentile | $\begin{aligned} & 0.119 * * \\ & (0.002) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.073 * * \\ & (0.005) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.059 * * \\ & (0.004) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.068^{* *} \\ & (0.008) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0.092 \\ (0.011) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0.095 \\ (0.008) \end{gathered}$ |
| Controls |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Year |  | YES | YES | YES | YES | YES |
| Personal characteristics |  | YES | YES | YES | YES | YES |
| Region |  |  | YES | YES | YES | YES |
| Job characteristics |  |  |  | YES | YES | YES |
| Employer characteristics |  |  |  |  | YES |  |
| Firm effects |  |  |  |  |  | YES |

[^2]APPENDIX TABLE 5
ESTIMATES FOR MALE IMMIGRANTS, $\leq 10$ YEARS SINCE IMMIGRATION

|  | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) | (6) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| WHITE |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Mean wage differential | $\begin{gathered} 0.009 \\ (0.020) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.084^{* *} \\ & (0.015) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.134^{* *} \\ & (0.015) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.068^{* *} \\ & (0.015) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.066^{* *} \\ & (0.015) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.028^{* *} \\ & (0.014) \end{aligned}$ |
| Quantile differential |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 10th percentile | $\begin{aligned} & -0.003 \\ & (0.110) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.051^{*} \\ & (0.027) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.082^{* *} \\ & (0.023) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.085^{* *} \\ & (0.035) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.075^{* *} \\ & (0.021) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.089^{* *} \\ & (0.025) \end{aligned}$ |
| Median | $\begin{aligned} & -0.007 \\ & (0.049) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.065^{*} * \\ & (0.012) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.156^{* *} \\ & (0.012) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.114 * * \\ & (0.017) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.039^{*} \\ & (0.022) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.045 \\ & (0.033) \end{aligned}$ |
| 90th percentile | $\begin{gathered} 0.022 \\ (0.035) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.061^{*} \\ & (0.019) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.090 \\ & (0.030) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.054 \\ & (0.040) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.067^{* *} \\ & (0.030) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.056^{* *} \\ & (0.028) \end{aligned}$ |
| Representation |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Below 10th percentile | $\begin{aligned} & 0.093^{* *} \\ & (0.003) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0.105 \\ (0.012) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.110^{* *} \\ & (0.004) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0.102 \\ (0.007) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0.116 \\ (0.010) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0.114 \\ (0.012) \end{gathered}$ |
| Below median | $\begin{gathered} 0.499 \\ (0.022) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.558^{* *} \\ & (0.025) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.588^{* *} \\ & (0.003) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.557^{* *} \\ & (0.014) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.483^{* *} \\ & (0.008) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0.495 \\ (0.023) \end{gathered}$ |
| Above 90th percentile | $\begin{aligned} & 0.107^{*} \\ & (0.005) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0.085 \\ (0.017) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.081^{* *} \\ & (0.004) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0.095 \\ (0.008) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.088^{* *} \\ & (0.003) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.081 \text { * } \\ & (0.010) \end{aligned}$ |
| VISIBLE MINORITY |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Mean wage differential | $\begin{aligned} & -0.298^{* *} \\ & (0.018) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.354^{* *} \\ & (0.014) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.417^{* *} \\ & (0.015) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.312^{* *} \\ & (0.014) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.283^{* *} \\ & (0.013) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.179 * * \\ & (0.011) \end{aligned}$ |
| Quantile differential |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 10th percentile | $\begin{aligned} & -0.201 * * \\ & (0.039) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.316^{* *} \\ & (0.033) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.392 * * \\ & (0.025) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.317^{* *} \\ & (0.025) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.232^{* *} \\ & (0.019) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.200 * * \\ & (0.048) \end{aligned}$ |
| Median | $\begin{aligned} & -0.344^{* *} \\ & (0.029) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.365^{* *} \\ & (0.012) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.430^{* *} \\ & (0.017) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.350^{* *} \\ & (0.020) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.287^{* *} \\ & (0.028) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.174 * * \\ & (0.043) \end{aligned}$ |
| 90th percentile | $\begin{aligned} & -0.333^{* *} \\ & (0.067) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.318^{* *} \\ & (0.053) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.382^{* *} \\ & (0.063) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.253^{* *} \\ & (0.038) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.224^{* *} \\ & (0.048) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.193^{* *} \\ & (0.044) \end{aligned}$ |
| Representation |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Below 10th percentile | $\begin{aligned} & 0.174^{* *} \\ & (0.001) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.274 * * \\ & (0.010) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.310^{* *} \\ & (0.020) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.289^{* *} \\ & (0.024) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.268^{* *} \\ & (0.013) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.205^{* *} \\ & (0.014) \end{aligned}$ |
| Below median | $\begin{aligned} & 0.750^{* *} \\ & (0.001) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.774^{* *} \\ & (0.002) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.807^{* *} \\ & (0.011) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.756^{* *} \\ & (0.010) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.778^{* *} \\ & (0.008) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.647^{* *} \\ & (0.021) \end{aligned}$ |
| Above 90th percentile | $\begin{aligned} & 0.026^{* *} \\ & (0.003) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.019^{* *} \\ & (0.002) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.019^{* *} \\ & (0.003) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.026^{* *} \\ & (0.005) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.028^{* *} \\ & (0.012) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.051 * * \\ & (0.006) \end{aligned}$ |
| Controls |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Year |  | YES | YES | YES | YES | YES |
| Personal characteristics |  | YES | YES | YES | YES | YES |
| Region |  |  | YES | YES | YES | YES |
| Job characteristics |  |  |  | YES | YES | YES |
| Employer characteristics |  |  |  |  | YES |  |
| Firm effects |  |  |  |  |  | YES |

[^3]APPENDIX TABLE 6
ESTIMATES FOR FEMALE IMMIGRANTS, $\leq 10$ YEARS SINCE IMMIGRATION

|  | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) | (6) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| WHITE |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Mean wage differential | $\begin{aligned} & -0.114^{* *} \\ & (0.021) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.170^{* *} \\ & (0.022) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.235^{* *} \\ & (0.022) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.096^{* *} \\ & (0.018) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.102^{* *} \\ & (0.018) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.060^{* *} \\ & (0.017) \end{aligned}$ |
| Quantile differential |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 10th percentile | $\begin{aligned} & -0.053^{* *} \\ & (0.004) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} -0.097 \\ (0.210) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.197 \\ & (0.134) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.147^{* *} \\ & (0.026) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.147 * * \\ & (0.029) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.055^{*} \\ & (0.031) \end{aligned}$ |
| Median | $\begin{aligned} & -0.141^{* *} \\ & (0.040) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.201 * * \\ & (0.030) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.225^{* *} \\ & (0.013) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.106^{* *} \\ & (0.024) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.071^{* *} \\ & (0.013) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.052^{* *} \\ & (0.015) \end{aligned}$ |
| 90th percentile | $\begin{aligned} & -0.056 \\ & (0.109) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.107^{* *} \\ & (0.012) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.174^{* *} \\ & (0.017) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} -0.047 \\ (0.076) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} -0.032 \\ (0.054) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.020 \\ & (0.122) \end{aligned}$ |
| Representation |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Below 10th percentile | $\begin{gathered} 0.134 \\ (0.021) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.183^{* *} \\ & (0.016) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.199 * * \\ & (0.028) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.143^{* *} \\ & (0.004) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.147^{* *} \\ & (0.010) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0.111 \\ (0.014) \end{gathered}$ |
| Below median | $\begin{aligned} & 0.620^{* *} \\ & (0.011) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.634^{* *} \\ & (0.009) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.654^{* *} \\ & (0.015) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.580^{* *} \\ & (0.009) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.639^{* *} \\ & (0.042) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0.537 \\ (0.025) \end{gathered}$ |
| Above 90th percentile | $\begin{aligned} & 0.074^{* *} \\ & (0.000) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.072^{* *} \\ & (0.000) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.057^{*} \\ & (0.012) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0.103 \\ (0.009) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0.094 \\ (0.006) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0.099 \\ (0.015) \end{gathered}$ |
| VISIBLE MINORITY |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Mean wage differential | $\begin{aligned} & -0.202^{* *} \\ & (0.012) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.232 * * \\ & (0.015) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.293 * * \\ & (0.016) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.220^{* *} \\ & (0.014) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.190^{* *} \\ & (0.017) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.162^{* *} \\ & (0.013) \end{aligned}$ |
| Quantile differential |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 10th percentile | $\begin{aligned} & -0.061^{* *} \\ & (0.029) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.136^{* *} \\ & (0.033) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.186^{* *} \\ & (0.024) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.136^{* *} \\ & (0.019) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.116^{* *} \\ & (0.023) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.144^{* *} \\ & (0.043) \end{aligned}$ |
| Median | $\begin{aligned} & -0.196 * * \\ & (0.037) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.192^{* *} \\ & (0.014) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.252^{* *} \\ & (0.024) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.263^{* *} \\ & (0.013) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.206 * * \\ & (0.027) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.152^{* *} \\ & (0.022) \end{aligned}$ |
| 90th percentile | $\begin{aligned} & -0.307^{* *} \\ & (0.027) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.268^{* *} \\ & (0.013) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.336^{* *} \\ & (0.018) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.223 * * \\ & (0.048) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.154^{* *} \\ & (0.037) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -0.158^{* *} \\ & (0.034) \end{aligned}$ |
| Representation |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Below 10th percentile | $\begin{aligned} & 0.131 * \\ & (0.016) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.147 * \\ & (0.028) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.179^{* *} \\ & (0.023) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.151^{* *} \\ & (0.011) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.144^{* *} \\ & (0.008) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.181^{* *} \\ & (0.016) \end{aligned}$ |
| Below median | $\begin{aligned} & 0.711^{* *} \\ & (0.001) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.760 * * \\ & (0.023) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.798^{* *} \\ & (0.020) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.726^{* *} \\ & (0.009) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.673^{* *} \\ & (0.011) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.635 * * \\ & (0.025) \end{aligned}$ |
| Above 90th percentile | $\begin{aligned} & 0.016^{* *} \\ & (0.000) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.030^{* *} \\ & (0.003) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.027 * * \\ & (0.004) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.033^{* *} \\ & (0.010) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.024 * * \\ & (0.010) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 0.041 * * \\ & (0.009) \end{aligned}$ |
| Controls |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Year |  | YES | YES | YES | YES | YES |
| Personal characteristics |  | YES | YES | YES | YES | YES |
| Region |  |  | YES | YES | YES | YES |
| Job characteristics |  |  |  | YES | YES | YES |
| Employer characteristics |  |  |  |  | YES |  |
| Firm effects |  |  |  |  |  | YES |

[^4]
[^0]:    Notes: Standard errors are in parentheses. Reference category for differentials is Canadian born, white. For differentials, ** indicates statistically significant at $5 \%$ level and *indicates statistically significant at $10 \%$ level. For representation, ${ }^{* *}$ indicates difference from population quantile is statistically significant at $5 \%$ level and *indicates this difference is statistically significant at $10 \%$ level. Columns (2)-(5) are based on separate regressions for 32,898 men and 25,400 women. Column (6) is based on pooled regressions for men and women, with all controls except firm effects interacted with sex, averaged over 50 random samples of 1,500 firms with at least 2 employees. Mean number of observations in the 50 random samples is 17,906 .

[^1]:    Notes: Standard errors are in parentheses. Reference category for differentials is Canadian born, white. For differentials,
    ** indicates statistically significant at $5 \%$ level and * indicates statistically significant at $10 \%$ level. For representation, ** indicates difference from population quantile is statistically significant at $5 \%$ level and * indicates this difference is statistically significant at $10 \%$ level. Columns (2)-(5) are based on separate regressions for 32,898 men and 25,400 women. Column (6) is based on pooled regressions for men and women, with all controls except firm effects interacted with sex, averaged over 50 random samples of 1,500 firms with at least 2 employees. Mean number of observations in the 50 random samples is 17,906 .

[^2]:    Notes: Standard errors are in parentheses. Reference category for differentials is Canadian born, white. For differentials,
    ** indicates statistically significant at $5 \%$ level and * indicates statistically significant at $10 \%$ level. For representation, ** indicates difference from population quantile is statistically significant at $5 \%$ level and * indicates this difference is statistically significant at $10 \%$ level. Columns (2)-(5) are based on separate regressions for 32,898 men and 25,400 women. Column (6) is based on pooled regressions for men and women, with all controls except firm effects interacted with sex, averaged over 50 random samples of 1,500 firms with at least 2 employees. Mean number of observations in the 50 random samples is 17,906 .

[^3]:    Notes: Standard errors are in parentheses. Reference category for differentials is Canadian born, white. For differentials,
    ** indicates statistically significant at $5 \%$ level and * indicates statistically significant at $10 \%$ level. For representation, ** indicates difference from population quantile is statistically significant at $5 \%$ level and * indicates this difference is statistically significant at $10 \%$ level. Columns (2)-(5) are based on separate regressions for 32,898 men and 25,400 women. Column (6) is based on pooled regressions for men and women, with all controls except firm effects interacted with sex, averaged over 50 random samples of 1,500 firms with at least 2 employees. Mean number of observations in the 50 random samples is 17,906 .

[^4]:    Notes: Standard errors are in parentheses. Reference category for differentials is Canadian born, white. For differentials,
    ** indicates statistically significant at $5 \%$ level and * indicates statistically significant at $10 \%$ level. For representation, ** indicates difference from population quantile is statistically significant at $5 \%$ level and * indicates this difference is statistically significant at $10 \%$ level. Columns (2)-(5) are based on separate regressions for 32,898 men and 25,400 women. Column (6) is based on pooled regressions for men and women, with all controls except firm effects interacted with sex, averaged over 50 random samples of 1,500 firms with at least 2 employees. Mean number of observations in the 50 random samples is 17,906 .

