



METROPOLIS BRITISH COLUMBIA

Centre of Excellence for Research on Immigration and Diversity

Working Paper Series

No. 13-02

March 2013

Pathways to Immigrant Employment in the Port-Logistics Sector

**Peter Hall with Alireza Farahani,
Kaleigh Johnston, and Choo Ming-
Yeak**

Series editor: Linda Sheldon, SFU;
Krishna Pendakur, SFU and Daniel Hiebert, UBC, Co-directors

Metropolis British Columbia

Centre of Excellence for Research on Immigration and Diversity

MBC is supported as part of the Metropolis Project, a national strategic initiative funded by SSHRC and the following organizations of the federal government:

- Atlantic Canada Opportunities Agency (ACOA)
- Canada Border Services Agency
- Canada Economic Development for the Regions of Quebec (CED-Q)
- Canada Mortgage and Housing Corporation (CMHC)
- Canadian Heritage (PCH)
- Citizenship and Immigration Canada (CIC)
- Federal Economic Development Initiative for Northern Ontario (FedNor)
- Human Resources and Social Development Canada (HRSD)
- Department of Justice Canada
- Public Health Agency of Canada (PHAC)
- Public Safety Canada (PSC)
- Royal Canadian Mounted Police (RCMP)
- The Rural Secretariat of Agriculture and Agri-Food Canada (Rural Sec't)
- Statistics Canada (Stats Can)

Metropolis BC also receives funding from the Ministry of Jobs, Tourism, and Innovation (JTI). Grants from Simon Fraser University, the University of British Columbia and the University of Victoria provide additional support to the Centre.

Views expressed in this manuscript are those of the author(s) alone. For more information, contact the Co-directors of the Centre, Krishna Pendakur, Department of Economics, SFU (pendakur@sfu.ca) and Daniel Hiebert, Department of Geography, UBC (daniel.hiebert@ubc.ca).

TABLE OF CONTENTS

1. INTRODUCTION	5
1.1 PORT-LOGISTICS AS A NETWORK	6
1.2 AKSHAT	8
1.3 QUESTIONS ABOUT IMMIGRANTS AND PORT-LOGISTICS IN THE BC LOWER MAINLAND	12
2. AN ANALYTICAL FRAMEWORK	15
2.1 DEMAND	16
2.2 SUPPLY	18
2.3 INTERMEDIATION	19
3. DATA AND METHODS	21
4. CHARACTERISTICS OF IMMIGRANT PORT-LOGISTICS WORKERS	22
4.1 OCCUPATIONS	22
4.2 EMPLOYMENT STABILITY	23
4.3 HIGHEST EDUCATION LEVEL	24
4.4 LABOUR MARKET ENTRY COHORT	30
4.5 DIVERSE CHARACTERISTICS: WORKPLACE, GENDER, MARITAL STATUS, VISIBLE MINORITY STATUS	30
4.6 ETHNIC ORIGIN	35
4.7 ANNUAL EARNINGS	35
4.8 YEARS OF EDUCATION	36
4.9 AGE AND AGE AT IMMIGRATION	36
4.10 WEEKS WORKED AND HOURS WORKED PER WEEK	37
5. PATHWAYS TO EMPLOYMENT IN PORT-LOGISTICS SUBSECTORS	37
5.1 PORT	38
5.1.1 HAN	41
5.1.2 LUKE	43
5.2 TRUCKING	44
5.2.1 CHETANA	47
5.2.2 JALAL	49
5.2.3 KASSIM	50
5.2.4 MARCUS	51
5.2.5 PARRY	53
5.2.6 RAY	54
5.2.7 RON	56
5.3 WAREHOUSING	56
5.3.1 AMY	59
5.3.2 JOE	60
5.3.3 YU	61
5.3.4 ISABEL	63
5.4 FTA	64
5.4.1 JOHN	66
5.4.2 SALLY	67
5.4.3 SAM	68
5.4.4 MARY	69
6. CONCLUSIONS	70
REFERENCES	73
APPENDIX A: METHODS	77



METROPOLIS BRITISH COLUMBIA

Centre of Excellence for Research on Immigration and Diversity

Working Paper Series

PATHWAYS TO IMMIGRANT EMPLOYMENT IN THE PORT- LOGISTICS SECTOR

**Peter Hall with Alireza Farahani, Kaleigh Johnston,
and Choo Ming-Yeak**

Simon Fraser University

1 Introduction

The port-logistics sector consists of a network of activities that begin at the waterfront and extend to suburban distribution centres. In the process, jobs are created in traditional transportation industries, such as stevedoring, trucking, warehousing, forwarding and brokerage, as well as in information technology-rich activities from data entry to logistics planning. Since the late 1980s, British Columbia (BC)'s Lower Mainland port-logistics industry has undergone rapid growth and profound transformation (Hall and Clarke 2010). Vancouver has long been a major port for the export of commodities and still is, but since the early 1990s, container imports and exports have grown rapidly. Imports of manufactured goods are increasingly transloaded from marine into domestic containers in Vancouver-area warehouses for further distribution across North America. Some of the resulting empty marine containers are filled with raw materials for export. Between 1990 and 2005 Vancouver's container throughput grew by 458%: more than double the rate for all North American Pacific coast ports. This further consolidated Vancouver's position as Canada's most important (container) port.

This massive increase in cargo throughput was achieved through productivity enhancements; but, while the expansion generated a great deal of change in the labour market, there was not substantial growth in jobs. Employment in Canada's port-logistics sector grew between the 1991 and 2006 population censuses; however, in BC's Lower Mainland port-logistics employment growth was essentially stable. But the aggregate figures mask considerable change within the subsectors: employment grew especially in the warehousing and freight transport arrangement (FTA) subsectors. And, immigrant employment increased relative to non-immigrant employment in all subsectors. Although still under-represented relative to the immigrant share of overall employment in the BC Lower Mainland, between 1991 and 2006 the share of immigrants increased from one-fifth to one-third of all port-logistics workers. Furthermore, different immigrant populations are concentrated in specific industry and occupational segments: three-fifths of the immigrants in the trucking subsector are of South Asian origin, three-fifths of the immigrants in the FTA subsector are of East Asian origin.

This paper explores the diverse pathways that have resulted in the differential employment of immigrants in the port-logistics sector in the BC Lower Mainland. We have chosen to look at the port-logistics sector as a whole because it is so important to the regional and national economy. The port – often taken in public discourse to mean the waterfront and marine terminals – alone cannot operate efficiently without connecting infrastructure, warehouses, trucks, and workers. Examining how immigrants find employment in the various segments of a single but diverse sector can add to our overall understanding of immigrant labour market outcomes. How do immigrants find work in the subsectors that comprise port-logistics in the BC Lower Mainland? How do pathways to employment differ by industry subsector and occupation? What are the implications of this differentiation for immigrant labour market outcomes and policy?

We focus on how patterns of immigrant employment in the port-logistics sector are related to the pathways by which people are recruited into the sector. The industry-focused and process-oriented approach adopted here aims to provide insights into the workings of the labour market that can guide the design of recruitment, training, and retention strategies that support immigrants in finding positions that provide stable and career-building employment for the long-term. We combined quantitative and qualitative analysis. Analysis of census microdata from 1991 to 2006 identified immigrant employment patterns and outcomes. Employment life-histories of immigrants in various subsectors, as well as interviews with employers, unions, training and immigrant service organizations uncovered the processes behind the census numbers.

Our definition of the port-logistics sector consists of the following four subsectors:

- (1) Port: we focus on traditional longshore / stevedoring work, which is the job of moving cargo between land- and ocean-based transportation modes, but this subsector also includes port and terminal management, the operation of ships, tugs and other vessels, and the provision of services to support these activities.
- (2) Trucking: we focus on port truckers hired to move containers between marine terminals, warehouses, and railyards; the census statistics we use do not differentiate port truckers from other local or long-haul truckers.
- (3) Warehousing: we focus on transloading warehouses, container freight stations, and other facilities directly linked to the port; but, as with trucking, our statistical data refers to the warehouse subsector more generally.
- (4) Freight Transport Arrangement (FTA): a broad and rapidly changing subsector that includes customs brokers, freight forwarders, shipping agents, packing and crating.

When we report statistics for the whole port-logistics sector, we also include the rail subsector with the four listed above; however, the rail subsector is too small to report separately.

1.1 Port-logistics as a network

A ‘network’ is an apt metaphor for describing the port-logistics sector, because it highlights an interconnected and intricate system of actors, activities, and relationships that help move goods between remote locations, as well as through the city-region. A network, like a chain, is only as strong as its weakest link. The biggest, most modern port terminal in the world will not be efficient if there are not warehouses to handle the goods, if road and rail transport

connections within the region and to the wider hinterland are inadequate, or if the accompanying paperwork and information is not correctly handled. People make these processes of movement possible; they are the ones who operate the machinery that lifts and carries the goods; and, equally important, they exchange the information that makes any physical movement intelligible.

However, the network metaphor is better than the chain metaphor because, unlike a chain, a weak link in a network can be bypassed. If a route becomes congested, too expensive or unreliable, a quicker, cheaper or more reliable route may be found. Such processes of bypass occur at a variety of spatial scales (Graham and Marvin 2001). For example, continentally, the newly expanded Panama Canal may make transporting goods via ports on the east coast of North America cheaper relative to west coast ports; at a very different scale, land price differentials and the absence of appropriate regulations encourage logistics sprawl away from core urban locations to the metropolitan periphery (Hesse 2006). Furthermore, actors in logistics networks do not simply accept these conditions as given; they attempt to reshape their operating environment through demand and re-regulation, infrastructure investments, and other strategic actions.

Likewise, there are powerful incentives for shippers and carriers to structure their activities to seek out, establish, and maintain the most favourable balance of labour market skills and costs. Despite the outward appearance of seamless movement, it should not surprise us that labour market conditions differ greatly within the logistics network. This means that high wages and employment protections exist alongside low wages and contingent working conditions in the same activity network (Talley 2004; Hall 2009). Furthermore, unequal employment conditions may affect immigrants more intensely; one reason for this is that the newest labour market entrants are concentrated in those logistics chain segments with low barriers to entry. For example, across the United States, immigrants are over-represented in a port-trucking industry in which most workers are regarded as independent contractors and, hence, do not enjoy basic employment protections (Bonacich and Wilson 2008). These conditions have been described as a 'race to the bottom', characterized by falling earnings, long work hours, unsafe driving practices, and lack of investment in new equipment and maintenance. Similar problems in the BC Lower Mainland led to strikes by truckers in 1999 and 2005. However, regulatory responses by the courts, federal government, and port authority have been designed to halt the race to the bottom; these have had mixed success in stabilizing rates in the industry.

In part thus, the story of immigrants in the port-logistics sector in the BC Lower Mainland is also a story about how the industry has changed in relation to changing social character and strategic actions of those doing the work (see Herod 2001). The key point is that the structure, operation, and efficiency of the port-logistics networks are differentiated based on who is doing the work, how they are recruited and retained in the industry, and how they communicate with each other. And in turn, because the port-logistics industry is important to the Greater Vancouver economy, employment outcomes in this sector make a difference to wider social condi-

tions in the region.

1.2 Akshat

A specific example can illustrate how profound these changes in employment have been in the port-logistics sector. Akshat's work-life story, along with those of seventeen other immigrants we interviewed, can be found in the text boxes interspersed through the text.

Akshat was born and grew up in the city of Chandigarh in India. Like many other immigrants to Canada, he is well educated by the standards of the country he has left, and he is now juggling two jobs that provide a combination of sufficient income and job stability to support his family. He holds a Bachelor of Science degree, and he worked in the transcription industry. When he first came to Canada in 2004, he continued to work in this industry, but facing cutbacks, he took a security guard course. When we interviewed him, he was working two jobs as a guard. One job provides regular hours guarding offices, but the pay is low, with no benefits. In his second job, Akshat works in a casual position for a unionized employer. While this job provides irregular hours, the pay is higher and in the long run, the position offers the potential for the stability and benefits that come with seniority. His job entails guarding various sites, including a warehouse. It is here that we take up the interview:

Q: What is involved in security at a warehouse?

A: At a warehouse, we have, like, different sets of works. At one place, guards work at gatehouse. Gatehouse is a place where you control incoming and outgoing traffic of trucks. So if you are working there, you have to know everything that goes in, every truck that goes in. Basically trucks carry with them what they have, trailers or containers. So we have to note everything that the trailer and container and truck on a sheet of paper. We have to note everything, and then you have to control the access. So close the gate when there is no one, and then open...those who are allowed to go in. We have to open the gate for them.

Q: And so when you're working at the gate, when you're controlling the gate, do you speak to the driver?

A: Yes, we have to. We have to ask him... whatever. Some things we have to note from the driver.

Q: Do you have to enter anything into a computer?

A: It's only on... not every time. When you are working on Sundays, then you have to enter, otherwise not... 'cause they have... there is a guy from the warehouse. So he is working with us. So that on weekdays, he works with us. He enters the data.

Q: And so when you speak to the driver, what language do you speak to them?

A: Their language, like, Punjabi.

Q: And when they're hiring you for this job, do they always put the Indian guys on these security jobs?

A: Yes, most of... yeah, they put most of the...because they know the location where... which kind of people are coming, right. So they naturally place the guys... of course they place Indian guys. But there are some Caucasian, too, but mostly it's the Indian guys.

Q: And what about the guy from the warehouse who's entering the data?

A: Oh, he is... the one which I worked with, he was a Filipino guy.

Q: Filipino guy. Can he speak Punjabi?

A: No, that's... he is not talking to any driver. It's me who is talking. I am getting the data from the driver, and I am noting here. So what that guy does is, the Filipino guy, I note it and then I give to him, or he will say it, ok, this, this, and then he will enter it, that's it. He doesn't need to talk to the driver.

Functionally, the guarding job, which Akshat is performing at the warehouse, is quite simple; it entails an information exchange at an important point in the port-logistics network. The shipper wants to be able to track their goods as they move from the ship to the dock, to the truck, to the transloading facility and into the domestic container, to the railway, and eventually to the inland warehouse or distribution centre. The efficiency of that movement depends on a lot of people, including Akshat, who is assigned to this job precisely because he speaks the language of many of the drivers.

We had not expected to interview someone like Akshat; in the narrowest sense, he works in the security sector, not in the port-logistics sector. And he has no intention of taking a job in a warehouse or in trucking. Later in the interview he told us so:

Q: What do you think of the warehousing job?

A: I cannot do that much hard labour.

Q: What about truck driving?

A: I told you I am from Chandigarh. So, I am not that hard kind of guy. The guys who drive trucks, they are from villages; they are, like, strong guys.

This brief exchange speaks volumes about the structure and organization of the Vancouver port-logistics industry, and the particular positions that immigrants occupy in it. For employers in the industry, and for many of us observing the sector, it has become natural to assume that most port truckers are Punjabi-speaking immigrants. For Akshat, lines of occupational segmentation are drawn even more finely. All across the port-logistics network, language and other forms of communication, as well as a variety of social relationships, exert an influence on who gets hired, by whom, to do what.

Akshat (warehouse security guard)

Akshat came from the city of Chandigarh in India. He holds a Bachelor of Science. After his graduation, he worked in the transcription industry before filing for immigration. His desire to emigrate originated from his schooling days; a teacher told him about the good life abroad and encouraged him to emigrate. He chose transcription since he knew the job would earn him sufficient points to qualify for immigration.

In 2004, Akshat moved by himself to Canada under the skilled immigrant category. He stayed in Toronto for three weeks with a distant relative whom he had never met before. As his relative was very busy at work, he arranged for a friend to accompany Akshat to apply for a Social Insurance Number. Upon learning of Akshat's education and work experience, the friend suggested introducing him to a manager in the transcription industry. This manager turned out to

be Akshat's ex-supervisor from India. The company, based in California, had a branch in Surrey and so upon securing the job, Akshat moved. He worked for four years at the Surrey office before turning home-based for one year. It was during this time that he obtained his Canadian citizenship.

The transcription starting pay was \$8 per hour, and his last rate of pay was \$10 per hour. His colleagues were also mostly Indians. The company wanted to recruit local Canadians but their recruitment drive was not strong. After five years of work, he told his company that he had to go back to India to attend to family matters. On his return to Canada, Akshat was expecting to return to his transcription job, but his company said he was away for too long and had already hired someone to replace him. He said he had a limited social circle, as he does not belong to any social, religious, or sports groups. His small group of friends were all ex-colleagues from his transcription work. One of them went into the security work industry when he discovered that the transcription company was in financial difficulties.

So Akshat "took a clue" from this friend and signed up for a security course. With his Justice Institute of BC certificate in hand, he started looking for a security job. He applied to a few companies, and he asked his friends for contacts. He did not have much success at first. Then someone told him about a company in Vancouver which was offering a part-time security job. So he started working for a security company ('Company A') and was given 4, 6, or 8 hours of work per day. In a week, his working hours range from 28 to 32. The pay was \$11-12 per hour. He was with company A for a few months when he learned from a friend who was working at another security company ('Company B') that his company had a full-time position. The job was also less tiring; unlike company A, he would be able to sit while working. So he moved to company B and was assigned to do security at a pharmaceutical company. He lost this posting when the pharmaceutical company closed.

He started his job search again and joined another security company ('Company C'), which had contracts in warehouses. He applied for this job online from the company's website without any referral from friends or connections. He had to answer a few questions, and he also sent in his resume online. He was interviewed by one person, and the interview was not tough. The interviewer did not ask him many questions except to inform him about what the company does.

Presently he holds three jobs. He continues to work as a security guard for Company C; he has resumed guarding for Company B; and he still does some transcription work at home. Company B pays him \$12 per hour without medical/dental benefits but he is assigned to one fixed location. He sits down at his job. Company C assigns him to different locations, and his pay varies from \$11 to \$13 per hour depending on the locations. He is not provided medical and dental benefits, as he is not full-time staff.

At the warehouse, Akshat said he is either assigned to guard work at the gatehouse (standing) or security work at the front office (sitting). At the gatehouse he controls truck access to the warehouse, recording moves on a data sheet. The information he records must be 100% accurate ('perfect'). He has to speak to the truckers and check the paper work. A warehouseman co-ordinator will be beside him on weekdays and Saturdays to enter details into the computer. The security guard keys in the data if it is a Sunday. He speaks Punjabi to the Indian truckers; most are Indians though some are 'whites'. Company C has a policy to hire people from diverse ethnic background, and they schedule security personnel to match language requirements. The guard at the gatehouse also needs to know how to speak English. Akshat said he plays a "mediator" role in this position. The warehouseman Akshat works with at the guardhouse is Filipino. He does not need to converse with the truckers.

At the front office the guard acts as a Loss Prevention Officer, checking the bags of all incoming and outgoing personnel. Even though the workload is heavier at the guardhouse, the pay at the front office/desk pay is higher (\$14 versus

12 MBC: *Pathways to Immigrant Employment*

\$12.70 per hour). The reason could be because the former work scope required Occupational First Aid Level 2 (OFA2) certification, which he obtained in 2011. However this OFA2 would not help him obtain full-time hours at company C as it all boils down to seniority.

Akshat wants to work permanently and full-time for company C, which is unionized and employees are offered full-time hours based on seniority, usually after ten to fifteen years. Initially he was working on a full-time 40-hour week basis for two months as he was temporarily replacing someone (also an Indian) who was on a two-month vacation. Since then he has been working on a part-time basis 18 to 32 hours a week. Hence he still holds two other jobs.

Akshat does not know much about the warehouse operations, but he commented that there are many immigrants working as warehousemen. They come from India, Philippines, China and South America. Their medium of communication is English, though when two immigrants from the same country communicate, they may speak their mother tongue language. Still, warehousemen need to understand English. He knows warehouse work is a stable job, but he said he cannot do hard labour (due to a bad back) so he excludes the possibility of working as a warehouseman.

When asked if he will stay in the security industry, he said his career decision is not just dependent on himself as he needed to continue working in order to send money back to his father in India, and he has a wife. Given a choice, he would want to take up a longer-term education in Canada, but at the moment he can only afford (both time and financially) to attend short courses. He did once apply for a warehouseman co-ordinator position after seeing a job posting. The pay was good at \$15 per hour; and he was willing to do the job, which involved sitting down at a computer and talking to people in the warehouse via radio. But the warehouse company only wanted to place people who had worked inside the warehouse. As a result, Akshat stopped looking at job postings at the warehouse since they were all internal postings.

When asked if he had considered truck driving, he adamantly said no as he said he is not a “hard guy”. He is a “city guy” and his perception is that people who drive trucks are from villages and farms. Also, he does not want to lose his strong academic skills honed from his years of transcription experience. He knows truckers earn good incomes as he encounters and talks to them at his work. What Akshat earns in two weeks, a trucker can earn in one to two days. But he knows he will not be suitable for trucking.

1.3 Questions about Immigrants and Port-Logistics in the BC Lower Mainland

The port-logistics sector is of fundamental importance to the economy of British Columbia, and especially the Lower Mainland, as recognized in the Provincial and Federal Governments’ respective Gateway policies. One small but important element of these policies is training designed to address an anticipated shortage of skilled workers in a variety of cargo-related occupations (British Columbia and Canada 2006). Immigrants occupy a growing share of employment in the sector; a trend that is likely to continue given projected rates of retirement.

The various subsectors that comprise the port-logistic sector are subject to different regulations, entry-level skill requirements, training systems, employer preferences, recruitment strategies, patterns of union organization, as well as social conventions, which contribute to

actual employment patterns. We know that labour market segmentation is one piece of the puzzle to understanding the lagging outcomes for immigrants in Canada, but standard segmentation theories have not provided satisfactory explanations of the observed patterns (Hiebert 1999; Hall and Khan 2008). A policy concern is that in meeting anticipated labour demand, the port-logistics industry could become segmented and racialized as has occurred in parts of the United States (Bonacich and Wilson 2008).

In the BC Lower Mainland, employment overall in the port-logistics sector was relatively stable between 1991 and 2006. The population census-based statistics used in this study show a decline (-12.6%) in employment (see Table 1). It is likely that the extent of the decline is overstated due to problems with the measurement of trucking subsector employment (-22.2% between 1991 and 2006, according to our census-based numbers). More importantly, some subsectors declined while others grew. The decline was greatest in the port subsector (-21.7%). In contrast, there was growth in the warehousing subsector (+44.5%), and substantial growth in the FTA subsector (+117.2%). Hence, we found decline in two subsectors, and growth in two.

By way of comparison, BC Statistics (2012) provide a time series of employment counts based on Canadian Business Patterns data that confirm that aggregate employment in port-logistics did not grow. The figures provided do not differentiate subsectors at the metropolitan level, but over the period 1991 to 2006, at the provincial level they show a decline in the water transportation sector (-5%), and growth in trucking (+36%) and warehousing (+78%). It is not possible to separately identify the FTA subsector in the BC Statistics data. The rail transport sector, which we include in our definition of the port-logistics sector but which we have not otherwise analysed separately, also experienced decline of 58% according to the census-based numbers, and of 67% according to the BC Statistics business patterns-based numbers.

Between 1991 and 2006, the share of jobs in all other sectors in the Lower Mainland held by immigrants expanded from 31.5 to 38.7%. This should not surprise us, given what we know about the settlement patterns of immigrants in this period (Hiebert 2000). In the port-logistics sector overall, the share increased from 22.0 to 33.3%; hence, the gap between the immigrant share in port-logistics and in all other sectors of the economy narrowed, although the share of immigrant employment in the port-logistics employment does still lag behind all other sectors.

In each of the four subsectors, the share of jobs held by immigrants grew between 1991 and 2006. However, the share of jobs held by immigrants in each subsector in 2006 varies considerably: from 26.8% in warehousing to 41.7% in freight transport arrangement. Furthermore, there are important differences between the subsectors in patterns and outcomes of immigrant employment (these are discussed in further detail below).

Table 1 Immigrant share of selected sectors, BC Lower Mainland, 1991-2006

	Port	Truck	Warehouse	FTA	Port-logistics	All Other Sectors
Percent Immigrant						
1991	25.6%	18.2%	22.4%	30.0%	22.0%	31.5%
1996	30.4%	25.5%	21.7%	33.5%	26.7%	34.6%
2001	28.5%	31.8%	21.1%	40.7%	29.2%	36.5%
2006	30.2%	36.8%	26.8%	41.7%	33.3%	38.7%
Change in share, 1991-2006	4.6%	18.6%	4.4%	11.7%	11.3%	7.3%
Absolute Growth, 1991-2006						
Immigrant	-7.6%	57.7%	72.9%	201.9%	32.4%	43.3%
Non-immigrant	-26.5%	-39.9%	36.3%	81.0%	-25.2%	4.0%
All	-21.7%	-22.2%	44.5%	117.2%	-12.6%	16.3%

Source: Authors analysis of 20% (long-form) Population Census microdata, provided by Statistics Canada and accessed via the SFU Research Data Center. Includes only those who were aged 15 years and older and who were in the labour force (employed or unemployed) in the week prior to the census. Excludes institutional residents, as well as those who earned less than \$500 or more than \$500,000 in the previous year.

This raises a series of questions: Why did the share of immigrants overall increase in what was a declining or stable employment sector: port-logistics? How can we explain why the immigrant share increased most in one growing subsector (FTA) and one declining/stable subsector (trucking)? At the same time the immigrant share also increased least in one subsector that was declining (port) and one that was growing (warehousing). In other words, differential subsector growth alone does not explain the differential share held by immigrants. Finally, how can we explain the differential social and occupational patterns of immigrant employment within subsectors?

2 An analytical framework

We use an analytical framework which views labour market outcomes as resulting from the interaction of labour demand and supply mediated by the formal and informal social institutions that regulate the labour market and guide the practices and behaviour of labour market actors. All of these elements – demand, supply, and intermediation – are shaped by the strategic actions of labour market actors, and they vary in time and across geographic space (Peck 1996). Hence, concentrations of immigrants in particular occupational or industry segments are not only a result of patterns and demand and supply, but also how employers and employees are ‘selectively’ matched in particular settings. The term ‘selective’ here does not necessarily mean that any one actor consciously chose the outcome; strategic actions are typically constrained and can lead to unintended outcomes.

We are not presenting this framework as a formal theory of the labour market, and we attach no particular priority to any one of the elements; rather, we regard labour market outcomes in particular places and times as the result of their interaction. Furthermore, the boundaries between these analytical categories are always dynamic; for example, challenging supply or demand conditions may lead some actors to strategic activity re-shaping the social institutions that regulate employment relationships. Hence, demand, supply, and intermediation conditions are themselves changed, over time, by the practices and strategies of a variety of actors (e.g., through immigration policy, employer practices, investments in education and training, union membership drives, etc.).

Mata and Pendakur (1999) examined the formation of ethnic niches in industrial sectors in the three largest Canadian cities among immigrants who arrived in Canada in the 1960s. They found that immigrants did form niches over the period 1971 to 1991 in some industries requiring low levels of education. Typically these were declining sectors; they argued that immigrants filled these niches as non-immigrants moved on to more promising alternatives. While Mata and Pendakur did separately identify ‘distribution services’, a sector that encompasses port-logistics, in their study, they note that this sector requires moderate levels of schooling and that “jobs in this sector are a mixed bag with a range of both skills and wages” (p. 19). They found some evidence of immigrants from the 1960s entry cohort clustering in self-employment in distribution services, but non-immigrants maintained their position in wage employment in this sector. With respect to trucking, Hiebert and Pendakur (2003) report similar findings in relation to ‘truck and taxi transportation’, which they identify as one of several immigrant niche sectors. These niches are characterized by “relatively high rates of self-employment, employ relatively high numbers of immigrants, and pay relatively poorly” (p. 11).

Our results with respect to the dominant share of immigrant employment in the trucking

subsector and the displacement of non-immigrants by immigrants in the warehousing subsector broadly confirm these findings. However, it is important to stress that the port-logistics sector as we have defined it covers a broad and diverse range of activities. While there are indications of an ethnic niche forming in the FTA subsector, this is not because of low education, but rather appears to be related to changing trade patterns.

It is also important to emphasise that demand, supply, and intermediation processes play out within geographic space at local as well as metropolitan scales. Ellis, Wright and Parks (2007) have convincingly argued that immigrant niches in the metropolitan economy are a local rather than metropolitan-wide phenomena. They came to this conclusion by showing that immigrant groups are more likely to form employment niches in an industry when that industry is located close to their settlement locations. This pattern may be less strong if there are competing groups residing nearby. Iskander, Riordan and Lowe (2012) provide some important evidence of how these localized niches could emerge over time through long-term ethnographic research with Mexican immigrants in Philadelphia. Their research shows how immigrants use localized informal employment to gain skills for upward occupational mobility.

Our research amongst truckers revealed strong indications of this kind of employment niching and upward mobility in Surrey. From the outside, trucking appears to be an industry characterised by low barriers to entry; however, for those with limited alternatives, and especially since the regularization of port trucking, this has become a less accessible but more attractive occupation. Immigrants working in this sector described a relatively long process of acquiring the skills (including knowledge of routes), connections (such as where to acquire second hand trucks and get them reliably repaired), certification (such as a clean Canadian driving abstract), and capital required to operate in the sector. Many of these resources were found in their immediate residential neighbourhood. The interaction of demand, supply, and intermediation in particular places and times leads to a diversity of labour market outcomes; we now discuss each in further detail.

2.1 Demand

Demand refers to the characteristics of the jobs that are offered by employers, which are shaped by a variety of factors including: recruitment practices such as the extent to which hiring occurs internally through job ladders, work process and technology, workplace organization, operating times, requirements for general and specific skills, and the underlying nature of the demand for the product or service being produced.

The last factor – transportation’s final demand - is especially relevant to understanding demand for workers in the port-logistics sector, because demand for transportation itself is derived from the economic sector purchasing the transportation services. The port-logistics industry is subject to highly variable final demand, which translates into variable demand for workers, and hence a desire on the part of employers for labour market flexibility. For example, since the retail sector sells most goods towards the end of the year, transportation demand related to import containers is heavily seasonal, peaking in the North American fall. Some staples exports are also subject to seasonal variations. Hence, seasonal demand variations are especially salient in occupations that involve direct materials handling and movement, including longshore work, trucking, and warehouse operations. Work hours can also have particular daily and weekly variations in the port-logistics sector: port activities vary weekly according to ship call rotations, while warehouses will often work overnight to prepare loads for delivery to customers that are themselves only open during daytime hours.

Building on Atkinson’s (1985) conception of flexibility, Holmes (1997) identifies five routes that employers may use to achieve greater flexibility in the use of labour: (1) Numerical flexibility, expanding or contracting the number of workers in response to fluctuating demand; (2) Functional flexibility, involving multi-skilling of workers across jobs; (3) Financial flexibility, involving some form of performance-linked payment structure; (4) Distancing or externalization, involving the use of contracted-out workers; and (5) Work time flexibility by re-organizing workers shifts. Each of these strategies has different consequences for employment demand, the type, number, and nature of job opportunities that are created.

We observed instances of all these flexibility strategies in our research, although they were used differently in the subsectors. The widespread use of owner-operated trucking, and labour brokers in some parts of the warehousing subsector, implies distancing / externalization to achieve flexibility. The warehousing subsector also makes use of numerical and work time flexibility to meet seasonal demand fluctuations. In the port subsector, numerical flexibility from the perspective of the individual worksite is achieved by the collective labour pool; job seniority rules determine how the available work is distributed amongst the workers. The FTA subsector was the only one in which we heard of financial (annual bonuses) flexibility.

Several jobs in the port-logistics sector demand job-specific skills and knowledge that cannot be easily replicated without on-the-job experience. In particular, jobs that involve some dimension of supply chain co-ordination (especially those in the FTA subsector) require a complex mix of job-specific knowledge and the ability to communicate effectively with the different supply chain actors. These demands create the need for multi-skilled, functionally flexible, employees. However, at the extreme, job-specific skill demands render functional flexibility a non-viable strategy (i.e., it is not reasonable to expect others to know the job-specific skill requirements).

Most jobs in the port-logistics sector have been subject to new technologies and capital-intensification in recent years, resulting in additional demands for general and specific skills. For example, this is visible in container ports where demand for general technical skills (equipment maintenance and repair) and specific equipment operating skills has increased, and in the warehouse subsector in information technology related to automation. In some segments, the demand for job-specific skills is addressed through internal job hiring (seen especially in the FTA subsector) or pooled hiring (seen especially in the port subsector).

2.2 Supply

Supply refers to the characteristics of those seeking work, including such factors as age, family circumstances, work experience, education, access to financial capital, life course, language, and expectations and aspirations. Immigration policy exerts a direct influence on supply, since this is what influences who is selected for settlement in Canada. Immigrant flows are of course diverse: who is available for selection varies considerably, and not all immigrant flows are subject to the same selection criteria. However, in very general terms, we can say that most immigrants to Canada during the study period (since the late 1960s and until recently) have been selected because they, or a close family member, are relatively well educated, have some work experience, and are able to speak one of the official languages of Canada. Hence, in comparison to non-immigrants, immigrants to Canada tend to be older, are more skilled in terms of formal education and more likely to have white collar job experience, and they often have dependants.

These supply-side factors imply that many immigrants are not well-matched to the labour demands of the port-logistics sector. This is especially the case in the port and warehouse subsectors where numerical and work time flexibility strategies are common. Immigrants with limited financial resources and/or dependants to support find it difficult to accept entry-level positions which do not provide some measure of income and work hour stability. At the same time, however, port trucking as compared to long distance trucking is a desirable occupation for those with families since port truckers get to be at home every night.

Much of the literature on the plight of immigrants to Canada in recent years has focused on the challenges resulting from the lack of recognition of foreign credentials and experience (Bauder 2003; Aydemir and Skuterud 2005; Guo and DeVoretz 2005; Hall and Sadouzai 2010), language deficiencies (Chiswick and Miller 2000; Ferrer, Green and Riddell 2006) and other supply side factors. This research did uncover some instances where immigrants who aspire to work in the port-logistics sector have the skills needed but couldn't effectively signal to employers that they do. For example, we spoke to immigrants who had obtained experience in the transportation sector of developing nations which are organized differently from Canada. However, it more often appeared to be the case that immigrants who were unable to find jobs that matched their

education and experience in other sectors, accepted work in the port-logistics sector on a survival or transitional basis.

The language requirements of the port-logistics sector are considerable. Those without a strong command of colloquial English would find it difficult to enter the port, FTA, and even some parts of the warehousing subsector. In contrast, however, there are advantages in the trucking subsector to being able to speak Punjabi. In this subsector, dispatchers often act as interpreters to aid drivers when they need to communicate with other logistics actors. Knowledge of (non-English) trading languages can be essential in some FTA positions.

The employment of Temporary Foreign Workers (TFWs) in the transportation and warehousing sector does not appear to be significant, although this bears watching. None of the immigrants we interviewed had come to Canada as TFWs, indeed this category of worker was not mentioned in any of our interviews. Canada-wide, the Transportation and Warehousing sector accounted for between 2.2 and 3.4% of annual TFWs between 2008 and 2011 (HRSDC 2012). This pattern is replicated in British Columbia; here Transportation and Warehousing accounted for between 1.7 and 3.3% of TFWs (570 to 750 people) in 2008, 2009, and 2011. However 2010 was an exception, when the proportion jumped to 8.6% (1,820 TFWs). The 2010 anomaly is probably explained by the influx of transit, ground, and air passenger transportation workers related to the Vancouver Winter Olympics.

2.3 Intermediation

Intermediation refers to the formal and informal social institutions which regulate labour markets and shape the pathways by which employers and employees are connected. We include here immigrant services agencies, training institutions, formal and informal job search networks, and labour market regulations. A primary analytical distinction we adopt comes from Mark Granovetter's work on the role of social networks in the pathways to employment (see Matthews, Pendakur and Young 2009). Granovetter (1974) observed that many people do not find work through formal job search methods – sending out resumes, requesting informational interviews, responding to advertisements. These approaches do not work if hiring occurs predominantly through internal labour markets, and they also may not work in isolation from social relationships.

Instead, Granovetter (1973) asserted that weak ties – infrequent social interactions that may occur at work, in the community, and in a range of organizations and associations - were especially important in finding work because they provide access to diverse information about the labour market. Weak ties are contrasted with strong ties, which refer to close personal and family relationships that are more useful in providing financial and other material resources. Immigrants

used formal job search, as well as strong and weak ties in their pathways to employment of port-logistics workers, but these vary by subsector.

Another kind of intermediating factor which shapes labour supply, concerns the knowledge, expectations and cultural practices of immigrants with regards to work in particular sectors. Applying the concept of habitus, Bauder (2005) has argued that a variety of cultural differences profoundly affect employment outcomes by shaping how work-seekers go about mobilizing resources required to find work. Especially in those subsectors in which immigrants rely upon strong social ties to find work (trucking and port), we heard assertions about the cultural value and status associated with working in these subsectors. For example, truck driving seems to provide a venue in which the Punjabi drivers we interviewed could perform their masculine identity (see Gill 2012). Trucking is also a site for enacting group solidarity; Punjabi drivers, mechanics, dispatchers, and owners may help each other because they are “apna”, which can be roughly translated as “one of us” (Behl 2013). In contrast, the social value of working in the FTA subsector was expressed in individualistic terms (e.g., as striving to meet personal goals); and it was barely expressed at all in the warehousing subsector.

With the exception of South Asian immigrants in the trucking subsector, immigrants often appear to lack informal social networks through which to learn about port-logistics jobs. Immigrant service agencies thus have an important role in shaping how workers come to learn (or not) about which potential employment matches exist. Yet, our interviews highlighted that immigrant services agencies also lack deep connections and knowledge of the port-logistics sector, especially the port subsector. This is not surprising; this is not a subsector in which large numbers of immigrants have found employment in the past, and it highlights a kind of vicious cycle dilemma for the service agencies. Immigrant services agencies, which are typically oriented towards finding work for skilled immigrants, also tend to regard port-logistics jobs – especially those in warehousing – as short-term, survival, or transition jobs.

Nevertheless, at least one immigrant services agency had strong warehousing connections in their job-finding club; and immigrants can easily obtain basic training and entry level certification for warehousing and related activities. Such actions of labour market intermediaries can, over time, shape patterns of labour demand and supply. Employers may come to regard immigrant services agencies as a desirable recruitment site. Indeed, one employer mentioned that immigrant services agency job finding clubs were a far more desirable and higher paid source of workers than ‘day labour’ agencies. And, it is also conceivable that immigrants may accept the premise that port-logistics jobs are temporary, so further shaping their expectations and behaviour of work in those positions.

We used the categories of demand, supply, and intermediation to structure our data collection and analysis.

3 Data and Methods

This research combined quantitative and qualitative data, building on ongoing research into the port-logistics sector in the BC Lower Mainland. Quantitative analysis provided insights about immigrant employment patterns and outcomes in the sector, including comparison of immigrant and native-born earnings and identification of patterns of ethnic segmentation in specific occupations and subsectors. However, the core activity of this project was the recruitment of immigrants working in port-logistics for interviews that focused on the pathways by which they found work in the sector. Immigrants were recruited through a combination of sources, including key informant interviews, existing contacts, and snowball sampling. The best eighteen of these interviews (in terms of clarity, detail, richness, and insight) were redacted for readability and to protect respondent confidentiality and reported as work life-histories to exemplify the following processes:

- What are the pathways by which immigrants find employment in the port-logistics sector?
- Do these pathways differ for each of the four key subsectors that comprise the sector?
- How do immigrants prepare for entering the sector; what role do training, pre-immigration experience, family and community connections play?
- Where and how do employers in this sector recruit?
- What is the role of training institutions, unions, and labour market intermediaries?

Although not all of the immigrants we interviewed have jobs in port-logistics, we admit a potential observational bias in our interview recruitment method: namely that we know rather little about those immigrants who might have sought jobs in port-logistics and failed. For this reason three of the eighteen stories are of immigrants not working in the sector. We also give some prominence to the often slow, difficult, and ‘full of false starts’ pathways followed by those immigrants who eventually secured employment in the sector.

The immigrant interviews were complemented by document review and key informant interviews with actors who shape the port-logistics labour market, including immigrant services agencies, training organizations, unions, and employers. The goal of these interviews was to identify employment practices (recruitment, training, careers, etc.) in the sector, and to probe how these practices may shape patterns of immigrant employment.

For further details on the research methods used, please see Appendix A.

4 Characteristics of immigrant port-logistic workers

The census data allows us to compare the social, demographic, and other characteristics of immigrants and non-immigrants in the port-logistics sector and the four subsectors, as well as all other sectors, and to explore how these have changed over time. In Tables 2, 3, and 4 we show the percentage of immigrant and non-immigrant workers in various social categories in 1991 and 2006 in a way that allows a series of bivariate comparisons. For example, the sex distribution of immigrants in one industry in one year can be compared to immigrants in the same industry in another year, or to non-immigrants in the same industry, or to those immigrants employed in some other industry. The following general patterns can be observed.

4.1 Occupations

A primary objective of this study was to determine whether immigrants were concentrated or segmented in particular occupational groupings in the port-logistics sector. This variable is created by aggregating occupational classes into six broad groupings that are comparable from one census year to the next: (a) Managerial, (b) Professional, (c) Technical, Trades or Mechanical, (d) Administrative, (e) Retail or Service, and (f) Transport or Manual.

In general (i.e., in “all other sectors”), immigrants had a stable occupational profile relative to non-immigrants between 1991 and 2006; they remained more likely to be employed in technical, retail/service, and transport/manual occupations, and less likely to be employed in managerial and administrative occupations. However, a small gap favouring non-immigrants in professional occupations opened up between 1991 and 2006.

When it comes to the port-logistics sector, there has been a greater shift away from technical occupations and towards administrative occupations amongst immigrants (21.1 to 10.3%) than amongst non-immigrants (18.5 to 14.9%). The proportion of immigrants in transport and manual occupations stayed roughly the same (40.4 to 41.7%), while it declined for non-immigrants (45.2 to 40.6%). The aggregate trends reflect differential changes within the subsectors.

First, there has been a relative decline in immigrants in technical occupations in the port (from 25.9 to 22.2% versus an increase of 23.4 to 25.0% non-immigrants) and trucking (from 14.1 to 2.0% versus 9.2 to 3.4% for non-immigrants) subsectors. Second, there has been a relative increase in the proportion of immigrants in administrative occupations in FTA (from 50.0 to 54.1% versus a decrease of 46.7 to 43.5% for non-immigrants). Immigrants are also over-

represented in management occupations (19.5% versus 14.4% for non-immigrants) in the FTA subsector. Third, the share of transport and manual occupations decreased for all groups except immigrants in trucking (from 61.5 to 65.6%), immigrants (39.0 to 52.9%), and non-immigrants (41.7 to 47.1%) in warehousing.

In summary, a different gap has opened between the occupational profile of immigrants and non-immigrants in each of the subsectors. The net effect of these changes is best characterised as a differential process of immigrant segmentation. In trucking, immigrants have become relatively concentrated in transportation and manual occupations. This has also happened in warehousing; more rapidly for immigrants, but also for non-immigrants. There is evidence of immigrant specialization towards administration in FTA. In the port subsector, the occupational distribution between immigrants and non-immigrants is most even, although there are indications of a small shift towards immigrants in the share of managerial and administrative occupations, and away from technical and transport/manual occupations.

4.2 Employment stability

This variable was constructed from a series of census variables to create three mutually exclusive categories for all those who worked in the year previous to the census:

1. Full-time Full Year (FTFY): Those who were employed in the week prior to the census, who generally worked 30 hours per week or more, and who were employed 49 or more weeks in the previous year (including time on vacation, leave, or in training).
2. Contingent: Those who were employed in the week prior to the census, who generally worked fewer than 30 hours per week and/or who were employed 48 or fewer weeks in the previous year.
3. Other: Those who were self-employed, unemployed or no longer in the labour force in the week before the census.

Between 1991 and 2006, in all other sectors besides port-logistics, there was a small shift to more FTFY employment amongst both immigrants (42.9 to 43.2%) and non-immigrants (45.9 to 47.8%), but also a slightly larger increase in contingent employment amongst immigrants (31.3 to 34.9%) than non-immigrants (32.4 to 33.2%).

A more noticeable divergence occurred amongst port-logistics workers. The proportion of immigrants in FTFY employment fell (53.0 to 49.5%), while those in contingent employment

increased (27.2 to 32.5%). At the same time, the share of non-immigrants in FTFY employment actually increased (53.7 to 59.1%). A small fraction of this divergence could be explained by a higher proportion of immigrants having entered the labour market in the year prior to the census, but overall this suggests a relative deterioration in the stability of immigrant employment. Most of these changes in the relative stability of immigrant employment in the port-logistics sector are explained by changes in the relative stability of immigrants in the trucking subsector.

The employment stability of immigrants in the trucking subsector shifted decisively towards less FTFY (39.3 to 35.8%) and more contingent employment (25.1 to 37.9%), while for non-immigrants, there was a shift towards more FTFY employment (46.7 to 54.6%). It is also noteworthy that these figures do not indicate a shift towards self-employment, which was down for both immigrants and non-immigrants (in contrast to what has been observed in trucking in port cities in the United States; see Peoples and Talley 2004). This suggests that the growing numbers of immigrants in this subsector experienced reduced labour market stability relative to non-immigrants. This finding is consistent with what immigrant respondents told us about their pathways of entry into trucking employment, as well as the low level of recent labour entry (and, hence, the aging) of non-immigrant truckers relative to immigrants (see Table 4 below).

In the port subsector, immigrants were more likely than non-immigrants (58.9 versus 49.9%) to work FTFY in 1991. By 2006 the difference between immigrants and non-immigrants had essentially evaporated (50.0 versus 51.3%). This could reflect the relative aging of non-immigrant port workers (see Labour market entry cohort, below). Both immigrants and non-immigrants experienced increasing FTFY status in the warehousing subsector. Immigrants are still less likely than non-immigrants to be FTFY (54.9 versus 61.9%) and are more likely to be contingent (32.4 versus 24.5%). In the FTA subsector, immigrants were less likely than non-immigrants to work FTFY in 1991 (55.6 versus 62.7%), but by 2006, the figures have converged (64.0 versus 64.9%).

Again we have a differential pattern: immigrants are less likely to be employed FTFY in trucking and warehousing, but there is little difference in the port and FTA subsectors. The gap has widened noticeably in trucking.

4.3 Highest education level

This is based on the census variable that captures the highest level of education obtained. We convert this into 'years of education' using a standard conversion scale for the purposes of calculating average years of education (below); but here we report on three mutually exclusive

highest education levels obtained: (1) high school or less, (2) trade or apprenticeship, and (3) college or university.

Overall, the Vancouver labour force has experienced a decline in the proportion of workers with high school or less and with trade/apprenticeships, and a rise in those with college and university education. Consistent with what we know about immigrant streams to Canada over several decades since the introduction of the points system, immigrant workers are now more likely than non-immigrants to have college/university education (59.1 versus 52.0%).

Amongst all port-logistics workers, the pattern is similar, albeit at a lower overall level of academic education: the proportion of those with high school or less has declined substantially, and trade/apprenticeship has also declined (but more so amongst immigrants than non-immigrants). Half (50.7%) of all immigrants in port-logistics have college/university education, while just over a quarter (27.7%) of non-immigrants do.

In 1991 immigrants in all subsectors were, and still are in 2006, more likely to have college/university education. A general rule of thumb is that the proportion of immigrants and non-immigrants with college/university education alike doubled between 1991 and 2006 (for example, in the port subsector, immigrants with college/university education went from 32.3 to 64.2%, amongst non-immigrants the proportion rose from 18.4 to 36.3%). Amongst the four subsectors, FTA attracts the highest proportion of college/university educated workers, doubling the trucking subsector (72.0 versus 35.2% amongst immigrants, and 41.2 versus 19.0% amongst non-immigrants in 2006).

Immigrants in the sector were, and have become even more likely, to have college/university education. In the context of their relative occupational profile, this provides some indication that immigrants in the port-logistics sector experience a lack of recognition of educational qualifications, although we cannot say whether this occurs before they reach the port-logistics sector and/or within it.

Table 2 Characteristics of Port-Logistics and All Other Workers, BC Lower Mainland, 1991-2006 by Immigrant Status

	Port-Logistics						All Other Sectors					
	1991			2006			1991			2006		
	Immigrant	Non Immigrant		Immigrant	Non Immigrant		Immigrant	Non Immigrant		Immigrant	Non Immigrant	
Occupation												
Managerial	7.9%	7.3%		10.2%	9.6%		10.9%	10.7%		10.8%	11.8%	
Professional	2.5%	2.0%		4.4%	3.2%		15.5%	16.9%		21.6%	25.0%	
Technical	21.1%	18.5%		10.3%	14.9%		13.7%	12.1%		11.3%	10.6%	
Administrative	19.0%	20.5%		27.0%	24.5%		16.7%	21.2%		15.5%	19.0%	
Retail/Service	9.0%	6.4%		6.4%	7.2%		27.9%	27.0%		28.2%	25.1%	
Transport/Manual	40.4%	45.2%		41.7%	40.6%		15.3%	12.2%		12.6%	8.5%	
Employment Stability												
Full-time/Full year	53.0%	53.7%		49.5%	59.1%		42.9%	45.9%		43.2%	47.8%	
Contingent	27.2%	26.2%		32.5%	26.6%		31.3%	32.4%		34.9%	33.2%	
Other (Self Employed, Unemployed, NILF)	19.8%	20.1%		18.0%	14.4%		25.8%	21.7%		21.9%	19.0%	
Highest Education Level												
High school or less	55.6%	68.7%		39.6%	57.1%		49.1%	53.7%		32.9%	39.0%	
Trade/Apprentice	18.9%	16.3%		9.7%	15.2%		13.9%	12.1%		8.0%	9.0%	
College/University	25.5%	15.0%		50.7%	27.7%		36.9%	34.2%		59.1%	52.0%	

Table 2 Characteristics of Port-Logistics and All Other Workers, BC Lower Mainland, 1991-2006 by Immigrant Status

	Port-Logistics						All Other Sectors					
	1991			2006			1991			2006		
	Immigrant	Non Immigrant		Immigrant	Non Immigrant		Immigrant	Non Immigrant		Immigrant	Non Immigrant	
Labour Market Entry Cohort												
Before 1971	41.2%	45.9%		6.7%	24.2%		30.5%	35.6%		6.7%	14.4%	
1971-75	19.0%	15.8%		8.5%	12.9%		17.1%	14.4%		7.7%	10.1%	
1976-80	15.4%	17.0%		7.4%	14.3%		15.0%	16.9%		7.7%	11.9%	
1981-85	13.1%	12.6%		8.0%	12.5%		15.6%	16.9%		8.0%	11.9%	
1986-90	11.4%	8.7%		11.9%	10.2%		21.8%	16.2%		12.1%	11.2%	
1991-95	-	-		17.4%	8.0%		-	-		17.2%	13.0%	
1996-00	-	-		19.4%	9.2%		-	-		19.8%	12.9%	
2001-05	-	-		20.6%	8.8%		-	-		20.7%	14.6%	
Diverse Characteristics												
No Usual Work Place	7.9%	6.9%		5.9%	6.0%		8.1%	7.6%		8.7%	8.3%	
Female	17.3%	17.9%		25.8%	24.0%		46.8%	47.7%		52.1%	52.2%	
Married	78.1%	65.9%		77.5%	60.9%		71.1%	56.6%		70.1%	55.0%	
Visible Minority	40.5%	3.2%		75.9%	8.0%		51.4%	6.1%		71.6%	12.3%	
British Origin	27.9%	68.1%		9.8%	58.9%		24.5%	65.9%		12.6%	57.4%	
European (non-French) Origin	35.7%	40.3%		18.8%	42.7%		28.9%	42.1%		21.1%	45.9%	
South Asian Origin	18.2%	0.8%		35.4%	3.0%		13.6%	0.8%		17.1%	3.7%	
East Asian Origin	17.6%	1.6%		33.2%	4.2%		31.8%	4.4%		46.7%	8.1%	

Source: Authors analysis of 20% (long-form) Population Census microdata, provided by Statistics Canada and accessed via the SFU Research Data Center. Includes only those who were aged 15 years and older and who were in the labour force (employed or unemployed) in the week prior to the census. Excludes institutional residents, as well as those who earned less than \$500, or more than \$500,000 in the previous year. All percentages are relative to the column total (i.e., in 1991, 17.6% of immigrant Port-Logistics workers were of East Asian Origin). Empty cells are due to Statistics Canada data suppression guidelines for small cell-counts.

Table 3 Characteristics of Port, Truck, Warehouse, and FTA workers, BC Lower Mainland, 1991-2006 by Immigrant Status

	Port						Truck						Warehouse						Freight Transport Arrangement							
	1991			2006			1991			2006			1991			2006			1991			2006				
	Immig	Non-I		Immig	Non-I		Immig	Non-I		Immig	Non-I		Immig	Non-I		Immig	Non-I		Immig	Non-I		Immig	Non-I			
Occupation																										
Managerial	10.2%	6.1%	14.4%	14.4%	8.5%	8.5%	5.2%	7.4%	7.4%	6.1%	9.5%	9.5%	6.8%	7.4%	7.4%	7.8%	7.2%	7.2%	16.7%	14.3%	14.3%	19.5%	19.5%	14.4%		
Professional	-	-	11.3%	11.3%	5.2%	5.2%	-	-	-	3.2%	2.7%	2.7%	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	4.7%	4.7%	2.9%		
Technical	25.9%	23.4%	22.2%	22.2%	25.0%	25.0%	14.1%	9.2%	9.2%	2.0%	3.4%	3.4%	-	-	-	4.9%	7.9%	7.9%	-	-	-	2.2%	2.2%	5.7%		
Administrative	19.3%	15.4%	21.6%	21.6%	14.6%	14.6%	13.1%	19.5%	19.5%	19.8%	24.7%	24.7%	23.7%	29.9%	29.9%	23.5%	32.0%	32.0%	50.0%	46.8%	46.8%	54.1%	54.1%	43.5%		
Retail/Service	11.7%	10.6%	8.2%	8.2%	10.8%	10.8%	4.2%	2.9%	2.9%	3.2%	5.0%	5.0%	23.7%	10.3%	10.3%	8.8%	5.0%	5.0%	-	-	-	9.4%	9.4%	10.4%		
Transport/Manual	31.0%	42.2%	22.2%	22.2%	35.8%	35.8%	61.5%	60.5%	60.5%	65.6%	54.6%	54.6%	39.0%	41.7%	41.7%	52.9%	47.1%	47.1%	20.4%	29.4%	29.4%	10.1%	10.1%	23.1%		
Employment Stability																										
Full-time/Full year	58.9%	49.9%	50.0%	50.0%	51.3%	51.3%	39.3%	46.7%	46.7%	35.8%	54.6%	54.6%	50.8%	57.8%	57.8%	54.9%	61.9%	61.9%	55.6%	62.7%	62.7%	64.0%	64.0%	64.9%		
Contingent	28.4%	36.3%	38.5%	38.5%	35.6%	35.6%	25.1%	24.3%	24.3%	37.9%	24.3%	24.3%	30.5%	24.5%	24.5%	32.4%	24.5%	24.5%	31.5%	21.4%	21.4%	21.7%	21.7%	25.0%		
Other (Self Employed, Unemployed, NILF)	12.7%	13.8%	10.4%	10.4%	7.1%	7.1%	35.5%	29.1%	29.1%	26.3%	21.1%	21.1%	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	14.3%	14.3%	10.1%		
Highest Education Level																										
High school or less	41.9%	60.1%	26.4%	26.4%	42.9%	42.9%	70.1%	77.2%	77.2%	56.3%	68.4%	68.4%	62.7%	72.1%	72.1%	42.7%	65.1%	65.1%	55.6%	65.9%	65.9%	24.2%	24.2%	51.8%		
Trade/Apprentice	25.8%	21.5%	9.3%	9.3%	20.8%	20.8%	13.6%	12.0%	12.0%	8.6%	12.6%	12.6%	15.3%	13.2%	13.2%	17.5%	11.4%	11.4%	11.1%	15.9%	15.9%	3.7%	3.7%	7.0%		
College/University	32.3%	18.4%	64.2%	64.2%	36.3%	36.3%	16.4%	10.8%	10.8%	35.2%	19.0%	19.0%	-	-	-	39.8%	23.5%	23.5%	33.3%	18.3%	18.3%	72.0%	72.0%	41.2%		

Table 3 Characteristics of Port, Truck, Warehouse, and FTA workers, BC Lower Mainland, 1991-2006 by Immigrant Status

	Port						Truck						Warehouse						Freight Transport Arrangement					
	1991		2006		1991		2006		1991		2006		1991		2006		1991		2006		1991		2006	
	Immig	Non-I	Immig	Non-I	Immig	Non-I	Immig	Non-I	Immig	Non-I	Immig	Non-I	Immig	Non-I										
Labour Market Entry Cohort																								
Before 1971	50.0%	52.6%	13.3%	26.3%	37.6%	46.3%	4.9%	30.0%	35.8%	41.3%	4.8%	17.4%	32.7%	35.3%	3.0%	15.7%								
1971-75	18.8%	13.8%	11.4%	12.7%	16.7%	16.7%	4.9%	13.3%	17.0%	16.4%	9.6%	10.2%	13.5%	14.3%	7.1%	9.7%								
1976-80	11.5%	16.0%	9.0%	14.6%	18.6%	16.0%	6.7%	14.0%	9.4%	16.4%	8.7%	11.4%	19.2%	16.8%	3.6%	12.0%								
1981-85	10.4%	9.9%	11.4%	13.6%	15.2%	12.9%	8.4%	9.9%	18.9%	13.2%	8.7%	13.3%	15.4%	17.6%	3.0%	13.0%								
1986-90	9.4%	7.7%	16.3%	13.6%	11.9%	8.1%	11.3%	8.6%	18.9%	12.7%	10.6%	9.1%	19.2%	16.0%	13.1%	13.0%								
1991-95	-	-	16.3%	6.2%	-	-	18.8%	7.7%	-	-	12.5%	10.6%	-	-	19.6%	10.2%								
1996-00	-	-	12.0%	6.7%	-	-	24.6%	8.3%	-	-	16.3%	12.5%	-	-	21.4%	14.8%								
2001-05	-	-	10.2%	6.2%	-	-	20.3%	8.1%	-	-	28.8%	15.5%	-	-	29.2%	11.6%								
Diverse Characteristics																								
No Usual Work Place	3.5%	3.5%	2.2%	2.4%	17.8%	12.6%	11.4%	13.6%	-	-	-	-	-	-	4.9%	2.2%								
Female	18.3%	17.3%	31.6%	21.7%	13.1%	17.0%	18.8%	25.8%	23.7%	20.6%	21.6%	20.2%	40.7%	33.3%	46.6%	36.1%								
Married	79.2%	62.0%	70.8%	61.8%	77.9%	69.9%	82.4%	63.8%	62.1%	60.8%	68.9%	50.9%	79.6%	61.1%	74.4%	63.3%								
Visible Minority	32.0%	4.2%	59.1%	6.9%	46.5%	3.0%	81.2%	8.5%	34.5%	2.9%	75.5%	10.1%	38.9%	3.2%	83.6%	10.4%								
British Origin	36.0%	70.8%	18.8%	65.3%	21.6%	65.7%	6.5%	54.8%	36.2%	65.7%	7.8%	52.1%	29.6%	71.4%	6.7%	66.5%								
European (non-French) Origin	36.0%	38.6%	27.8%	41.5%	36.6%	40.8%	13.9%	43.5%	30.5%	38.7%	26.0%	45.5%	35.2%	44.4%	14.7%	42.2%								
South Asian Origin	-	-	15.5%	1.7%	30.0%	1.4%	60.1%	5.3%	-	-	19.4%	2.5%	-	-	22.5%	2.6%								
East Asian Origin	21.3%	3.0%	37.0%	4.8%	10.3%	1.0%	16.1%	2.1%	20.3%	2.0%	41.6%	6.8%	-	-	57.8%	7.5%								

Source: Authors analysis of 20% (long-form) Population Census microdata, provided by Statistics Canada and accessed via the SFU Research Data Center. Includes only those who were aged 15 years and older and who were in the labour force (employed or unemployed) in the week prior to the census. Excludes institutional residents, as well as those who earned less than \$500, or more than \$500,000 in the previous year. All percentages are relative to the column total (i.e., in 1991, 21.3% of immigrant Port workers were of East Asian Origin). Empty cells are due to Statistics Canada data suppression guidelines for small cell-counts.

4.4 Labour market entry cohort

This variable is calculated by estimating the number of years since the individual entered the labour market, derived from the smaller of “age minus years of education minus six,” or “age minus age at immigration”. There is evidence of considerable aging amongst non-immigrants in the port-logistics sector relative to all other sectors: in 2006, one-quarter (24.2%) of all non-immigrant port-logistics workers entered the labour market before 1971.

The entry cohort profile of immigrants in port-logistics resembles that of immigrants in all sectors, and the entry cohort profiles of the subsectors is consistent with what we know about growth in each sector. In the declining port subsector, there is evidence of aging amongst non-immigrants, but not amongst immigrants. In 1991, 50.0% of immigrants (and 52.6% of non-immigrants) had joined the labour market 20 years ago or more (before 1971). In 2006, 45.0% of immigrants (and 67.2% of non-immigrants) had joined 20 years ago or more (before 1986). In the trucking subsector, there is considerable aging amongst non-immigrants, and a relatively recent (since 1991, and especially in the late 1990s) expansion in the entry of immigrants. The (growing) warehousing subsector shows recent entry by both immigrants and non-immigrants. The FTA subsector also shows recent entry, especially amongst immigrants: in 2006, half (50.6%) of all immigrants in the FTA subsector had only entered the labour market after 1996.

4.5 Diverse characteristics

Usual place of work: This variable reveals little of note in the port-logistics sector; however, the proportion of truckers reporting no usual place of work fell amongst immigrants (from 17.8 to 11.4%) while it rose slightly (12.6 to 13.6%) for non-immigrants. This is consistent with the entry of immigrants into local port trucking (which is associated with a more regular place of work) reported in our qualitative interviews.

Gender: The port-logistics was a male-dominated industry, and for the most part remains so despite a small shift. Between 1991 and 2006, female representation (for both immigrants and non-immigrants) increased in all subsectors except for warehouse. Relative to non-immigrants, female immigrants are slightly over-represented in the port and FTA subsectors.

Marital status: Immigrants are more likely than non-immigrants to be married. In the trucking and warehouse subsectors, the proportion of immigrants who are married actually increased, while it declined amongst non-immigrants. This is consistent with the in-depth interview data which

showed that immigrants entering these sectors relied on spouses for resources such as family-based financial capital to purchase trucks, and shared child-care for those taking warehouse jobs with overnight or irregular shifts.

Visible minority status: Overall, immigrants are more likely to be of visible minority status; in 2006, 71.6% of immigrants in all other sectors were visible minorities. However, between 1991 and 2006 the proportion of non-immigrants who were of visible minority status doubled to 12.3%. Amongst immigrants in the port-logistics sector, over three-quarters were visible minorities (75.9%). This level also holds in the trucking, warehouse, and FTA subsectors. In contrast, only 59.1% of immigrant port workers are from visible minorities.

Table 4 Immigrants and Non-immigrants in the Lower Mainland, 1991 to 2006, Continuous Variable Indicators

	1991		2006		Growth, 1991-2006		Ratio: Immigrant/Non-immigrant	
	Immigrant	Non-Immigrant	Immigrant	Non-Immigrant	Immigrant	Non-Immigrant	1991	2006
Annual Earnings (1)								
Port-logistics	\$ 46,177	\$ 46,819	\$ 41,523	\$ 50,804	-10.1%	8.5%	0.99	0.82
Port	\$ 59,244	\$ 56,281	\$ 61,380	\$ 66,684	3.6%	18.5%	1.05	0.92
Truck	\$ 38,049	\$ 41,086	\$ 29,933	\$ 39,227	-21.3%	-4.5%	0.93	0.76
Warehouse	\$ 36,530	\$ 42,998	\$ 37,835	\$ 39,353	3.6%	-8.5%	0.85	0.96
FTA	\$ 37,428	\$ 40,202	\$ 42,039	\$ 54,365	12.3%	35.2%	0.93	0.77
All Other Sectors	\$ 34,975	\$ 36,045	\$ 35,042	\$ 40,962	0.2%	13.6%	0.97	0.86
Years Of Education (2)								
Port-logistics	12.78	12.55	12.96	11.43	1.4%	-8.9%	1.02	1.13
Port	13.19	12.74	13.61	12.37	3.2%	-2.9%	1.04	1.10
Truck	12.40	12.07	12.05	10.21	-2.8%	-15.4%	1.03	1.18
Warehouse	12.79	12.75	12.70	11.51	-0.8%	-9.7%	1.00	1.10
FTA	13.03	13.10	14.44	12.33	10.8%	-5.8%	0.99	1.17
All Other Sectors	13.21	13.55	13.39	13.17	1.4%	-2.8%	0.98	1.02
Age In Years								
Port-logistics	42.69	38.90	42.25	42.21	-1.0%	8.5%	1.10	1.00
Port	45.31	40.94	46.08	44.28	1.7%	8.1%	1.11	1.04
Truck	40.60	38.63	40.00	42.99	-1.5%	11.3%	1.05	0.93
Warehouse	40.21	37.66	41.19	38.04	2.4%	1.0%	1.07	1.08
FTA	41.35	35.64	41.20	39.19	-0.4%	10.0%	1.16	1.05
All Other Sectors	40.87	35.53	42.63	38.66	4.3%	8.8%	1.15	1.10

Table 4 Immigrants and Non-immigrants in the Lower Mainland, 1991 to 2006, Continuous Variable Indicators

	1991		2006		Growth, 1991-2006		Ratio: Immigrant/Non-immigrant	
	Immigrant	Non-Immigrant	Immigrant	Non-Immigrant	Immigrant	Non-Immigrant	1991	2006
Age At Immigration (3)								
Port-logistics	20.43	-	23.75	-	16.3%	-	-	-
Port	21.29	-	23.16	-	8.8%	-	-	-
Truck	18.68	-	23.51	-	25.9%	-	-	-
Warehouse	20.09	-	21.96	-	9.3%	-	-	-
FTA	21.89	-	25.44	-	16.2%	-	-	-
All Other Sectors	22.58	-	23.97	-	6.2%	-	-	-
Weeks Worked (4)								
Port-logistics	44.26	44.93	45.71	45.90	3.3%	2.2%	0.99	1.00
Port	44.55	43.42	44.92	43.84	0.8%	1.0%	1.03	1.02
Truck	43.89	44.97	44.56	46.13	1.5%	2.6%	0.98	0.97
Warehouse	41.05	44.98	45.93	45.92	11.9%	2.1%	0.91	1.00
FTA	45.44	46.07	47.05	47.30	3.5%	2.7%	0.99	0.99
All Other Sectors	42.58	42.60	43.65	44.31	2.5%	4.0%	1.00	0.99
Hours Worked Per Week (5)								
Port-logistics	41.72	42.37	43.26	43.75	3.7%	3.3%	0.98	0.99
Port	42.44	41.84	43.61	43.67	2.8%	4.4%	1.01	1.00
Truck	42.41	43.24	43.95	44.14	3.6%	2.1%	0.98	1.00

Table 4 Immigrants and Non-immigrants in the Lower Mainland, 1991 to 2006, Continuous Variable Indicators

	1991		2006		Growth, 1991-2006		Ratio: Immigrant/Non-immigrant	
	Immigrant	Non-Immigrant	Immigrant	Non-Immigrant	Immigrant	Non-Immigrant	1991	2006
Warehouse	39.07	40.09	41.34	42.25	5.8%	5.4%	0.97	0.98
FTA	38.06	39.59	41.88	42.91	10.0%	8.4%	0.96	0.98
All Other Sectors	38.58	37.57	38.97	38.02	1.0%	1.2%	1.03	1.02

Source: Authors analysis of 20% (long-form) Population Census microdata, provided by Statistics Canada and accessed via the SFU Research Data Center. Includes only those who were aged 15 years and older and who were in the labour force (employed or unemployed) in the week prior to the census. Excludes institutional residents, as well as those who earned less than \$500, or more than \$500,000 in the previous year.

Notes:

1. Refers to earnings in the year prior to the census. Inflated to 2005 using the All Items CPI for British Columbia, 2002=100.
2. Estimated based on self-reported highest level of schooling..Age at which an immigrant first obtained landed immigrant status.
3. Weeks worked for pay or self-employment, including paid leaves, in the year prior to the census.
4. Hours worked for pay or self-employment in the week prior to the census.

4.6 Ethnic origin

The wording of this question in the Population Census, as well as the number of discrete descriptions captured for an individual, changed between 1991 and 2006. However, the basic structuring principle of this question remained consistent, namely that an individual could indicate more than one ethnic origin. We used this question to identify five distinct non-exclusive groupings (although we do not report the Quebecois/French ethnic origin here because this is such a small group in the BC Lower Mainland, especially amongst immigrants). The data provides clear evidence of ethnic niching in two subsectors.

First, 60.1% of all immigrant truck drivers are of South Asian origin. This proportion has doubled from the already large proportion in 1991. This group is so large that overall in the port-logistics sector, 35.4% of immigrants are of South Asian origin, compared to 17.1% in all other sectors. Second, 57.8% of immigrants in FTA are of East Asian origin in 2006. Data suppression does not permit us to report the change since 1991 for this subsector, but this is higher than the proportion of immigrants of East Asian origin in all other sectors in the BC Lower Mainland (46.7%).

4.7 Annual earnings

Table 4 shows that on average immigrants and non-immigrants in port-logistics respectively earned more than immigrants and non-immigrants in all other sectors in both 1990 and 2005. [Annual earnings recorded in the census refer to the previous year; we inflated earnings to 2005.] However, this positive overall finding masks large differences between the subsectors and, with the exception of warehousing, a trend towards greater divergence between immigrant and non-immigrant earnings similar to that seen more generally in the Canadian labour market.

The high average earnings in port-logistics are driven by the port and FTA subsectors in which both immigrants and non-immigrants earn substantially more than those in all other sectors. For non-immigrants, average earnings in the truck and warehouse subsectors were above those received in all other sectors in 1990, but declined between 1990 and 2005. Average immigrant earnings in warehousing were similar to those of immigrants in all other sectors.

However, average annual earnings of immigrant truckers were well below those of immigrants in all other sectors in 2005, having fallen 21.3% in real terms since 1990. Some of this divergence is explained by the port trucker's strike of 2005, but this does not explain why non-immigrant annual earnings fell only 4.5% between 1990 and 2005. The other subsector which

also saw a large gap open up between immigrant and non-immigrant earnings, FTA, was also a sector which saw immigrants increase their share of employment.

Hence, trucking and FTA, and to a lesser extent, the port subsector were responsible for a growing gap between immigrants and non-immigrants average annual earnings in the port-logistics sector overall. The gap in the port-logistics sector between immigrants and non-immigrants grew more rapidly than that for all other sectors, driven in part by the decline in real average annual earnings for immigrants in port-logistics from about \$46,200 to \$41,500. The exception to this trend was the warehousing subsector, in which immigrant average annual earnings rose slightly, while for non-immigrants they declined, so narrowing the gap between them.

4.8 Years of education

As noted above, the port-logistics sector employs people with lower than average education compared to all other sectors. Immigrants were and still are more educated than non-immigrants in the port-logistics sector, and the gap is widening (in all other sectors it is also widening). In particular, over the 15-year period (1991-2006), immigrants in the port and FTA subsectors become on average more highly educated. This is consistent with other evidence showing that pathways to employment in these subsectors favour immigrants with formal education (trades/apprenticeships in the case of port work, university/college qualifications, and certification in the case of FTA).

It is noticeable that non-immigrants' years of education has declined so drastically for the port-logistics sector, at a much higher rate (-8.9%) than in all other sectors (-2.8%). There was a particularly dramatic decline in average years of education of non-immigrant truck drivers. This is consistent with relative decline of earnings in the subsector: lower wages in the sector appear to be related to the withdrawal of more educated locals. However, this alone does not explain the large difference in earnings between non-immigrant and immigrant truck-drivers in 2005.

4.9 Age and age at immigration

In 1991, immigrants in port-logistics were on average slightly older than non-immigrants, but by 2006, this gap had disappeared due to the rapid aging (+8.5%) of the non-immigrant workforce. Non-immigrants in the port and trucking subsectors are now considerably older on average than those in all other sectors. The only port-logistics subsector where non-immigrants are not older than employees in all other sectors is warehousing. Within port-logistics, the immigrant average age has actually decreased slightly, and is down in the two growing sectors, truck-

ing (-1.5%) and FTA (-0.4%). Nevertheless, trucking is now the only sector in which immigrants are younger on average than non-immigrants in the same subsector.

Average age at immigration has increased overall between 1991 and 2006. This is probably a reflection of previous changes to the immigration system (the 1967 points system and 1976 immigrant classes), which favoured the selection of older immigrants, working their way through age cohorts. The biggest change is that the average age at immigration of truckers has converged to the sector average. This probably reflects the rapid entry of immigrants into this industry in the past two decades.

4.10 Weeks worked and hours worked per week

Workers in the port-logistics sector work more weeks and hours on average than those in all other sectors. On average, truckers work the most. However, there are no major differences between immigrants and non-immigrants within the sector and within the subsectors, with the exception that weeks worked by immigrants in warehousing have converged upwards to match the average for non-immigrants.

5 Pathways to employment in port-logistics subsectors

The statistical data describes differential employment outcomes of immigrants in the four port-logistics subsectors. In general, there is more evidence of ethnic niching, occupational segmentation, and lower relative earnings for immigrants in the trucking and FTA subsectors. These are the two subsectors in which the immigrant share of employment increased most rapidly; in trucking this is because immigrants replaced non-immigrants, in FTA this is because immigrants claimed a larger share of the subsector's growth. Immigrant and non-immigrant outcomes are more equal in the two subsectors in which immigrants did not substantially increase their share, but for very different reasons. The differences between immigrants and non-immigrants remained smallest in the declining port subsector. However, in the growing warehouse subsector, the statistical data suggests that immigrant and non-immigrant earnings converged downwards, though at the same time, employment stability improved.

In this section we discuss the pathways to employment in each of the subsectors to understand what lies behind the statistical data reported above. Where appropriate, we make reference to the eighteen individual work-life stories to illustrate the general points.

5.1 Port

The most significant urban employment component of water transportation is marine cargo handling. Marine cargo handling takes many forms according to the type of cargo handled: containers, autos, forest products, liquid, dry bulk, and palletized cargo. Many activities in this industry are highly specialized in terms of skills and equipment, and work is undertaken by stevedoring companies at terminals specially designed for each commodity. Container terminals, in particular, are highly capital-intensive, and only a few terminals are engaged in this activity. Longshore work includes working aboard ships and barges, in the hold, on deck, or on the dock. It may involve: hand-handling and lifting of sacks, cartons, pallets, boxes, and crates; lashing of boxes, containers, logs; opening and closing hatches; cleaning holds of ships; and rigging cargo. This type of work is done outdoors in all types of weather and is considered “safety sensitive” as the work is dangerous, strenuous, and requires full situational and cognitive awareness.

The port industry has traditionally faced large seasonal and cyclical swings due to the nature of global demand, seasonality of some export commodities, and peak import seasons. Hence both employers and employees have market power at low and high demand times, respectively. The variable demand for labour creates additional problems for the stability of the workers in the industry, for training, and productivity. The current system of labour relations in BC ports developed to ensure that port workers would have an incentive to stay in the industry long enough, despite the ups and downs in employment, to gain skills, and to create mechanisms so that employers can share training, pensions and other indirect employment costs.

Everyone who works for BC ports in marine terminal operations, in the grain elevators and in some function of the port authority, fall under the two collective agreements: between International Longshore and Warehouse Union (ILWU) and Canada and the British Columbia Maritime Employers Association (BCMEA). This discussion concerns only the collective agreement for longshore (port) workers since the other contract is for foremen who are typically selected from amongst the longshore union ranks.

The labour relations system involves collective representation on both sides: the BCMEA represents employers, handles paperwork, pay and training, and ensures that one employer cannot outbid another, while the ILWU represents employees, handles the allocation of work, and ensures that one employee cannot undercut another one. Employers who have shifting needs for workers gain access to a work pool without incurring the same costs that they would if they had their own a full-time permanent workforce. Employees gain absolute predictability in the amount they will be paid per hour. As they gain seniority, they gain increasing predictability in how often they will work.

The BCMEA-ILWU system today provides a mixture of jobs that range from more to less permanent work, and from more to less skilled, hence providing a high degree of numerical flexibility to employers. The range is hierarchical, going from ‘regulars’ who work at a single worksite for at least one year at a time to ‘members’ who enjoy a certain degree of stability and benefits (i.e., some of the costs of employing them are fixed) to casuals whose employment is a completely variable cost for employers.

The current system has both critics and supporters; for example, there is an important debate about whether job rotations and collective training increase or undermine productivity. For the most part, the system seems to work well, and in 2011 the BCMEA and ILWU concluded an eight-year labour agreement. At the same time, the system creates barriers to entry for the typical profile of immigrants to Canada: that is, middle-aged, degreed professionals from developing countries, often with dependents, and without personal networks in this industry. It is difficult to initially gain access to port jobs, and once one has access to the jobs, it takes a considerable amount of time to accumulate enough seniority to be able to guarantee a good income. There are important exceptions to this general rule: immigrants with specific technical and trade skills that are in high demand do have more success in joining the industry.

Hiring occurs through the dispatch hall based on seniority. The dispatch hall is an institution that can be traced back to the days when hiring was based exclusively on informal relationships that were open to abuse. To end this kind of hiring, the dispatch hall is based on a system of ‘boards’, essentially lists of available workers in a series of categories that reflect union or casual status (subdivided as identified above) and skill level. The union manages the number of people in the different boards with some influence from the employer.

An important way employers can influence supply is through the amount of training they offer for the specialized skills. Much of the training is industry-specific, and outside training is not recognized. This applies to skills in container crane and yard equipment (bulldozer, rubber-tired gantries, forklifts, etc.) operation, and cargo checking. Other skills, typically acquired through recognized trade apprenticeships (e.g., welding, carpentry, millwright, heavy duty mechanic, electrician, etc.) are recognized from outside the industry. The decision about who receives training is also based on seniority.

The only way to enter the industry is as a casual, and the only ways to become a casual are either to be nominated by a union member, or through application as a skilled tradesperson. Casuals are further subdivided into ‘boards’ or categories (from A to H in the case of the New Westminster local, and from A to T in the case of the Vancouver local), which imply an increasing number of hours of work, and progression towards full union membership. Casuals only get allocation work once all those union members who wish to work have been placed, and casu-

als on higher boards get work before those on lower boards. The A board casuals – those to be selected first after the members – are called ‘welfare casuals’ because they qualify for some employer-paid benefits. There is an even further casualised group of people who have applied to work in the industry, who have undergone safety training and industry orientation, but are still waiting for an opening in the H and T ‘boards’ respectively.

The employer, via the BCMEA, communicates how many workers of different skill types will be needed for the next shift. These jobs are then offered to the workers according to the order in which their names appear, starting with the union member board, then going down to the top casual board, all the way down to the T and H boards. Each time a worker gets a job for a shift, they are moved to the bottom of the list, so that everyone on the same ‘boards’ has the same chance of getting work over time. However, if a worker is offered a shift and they do not take it, they are also moved to the bottom of the list, and for casuals, if they work too few hours they can be shifted down the boards, and eventually even off of the T and H boards. In practice this means that they have to be available for work every morning – because they are more likely to get one of the shifts that pay the base pay rate – but they won’t necessarily get work every day.

A small number of workers are part of a ‘regular’ workforce which means that they go to the same worksite every day. For example, some terminals like to have mechanics and other skilled workers regularly attached to them who become knowledgeable about specific equipment, commodities, or procedures. Once a year, these positions are advertised to everyone in the union and the most senior person with the required skills gets the job for the next year. The benefit to the employee is a set number of paid hours with a guaranteed income and no need to go through the dispatch hall.

Even though Luke, profiled below, had a skilled trade, he still had to work his way up the boards. When the port is busy, and there is no shortage of work, this is okay; but in the 2008/9 downturn, even with his Canadian qualifications he found himself shifted from a regular position to a casual position. His story illustrates the investment required to gain sufficient seniority to work reliably in the longshore industry; although a rewarding investment, it is one made with some risks.

According to the 2011 BCMEA Annual Report, there were 1,977 union members and 2,496 casuals (718 welfare casuals and 1,778 casuals) in the industry. Of these, 130 union members worked 1-10 hours per week, earning an average of \$15,421. A significant proportion of these would have retired at some point in the year, or been on sick or some other form of extended leave. Very few, if any, would have been forced to take so few hours. In contrast, 676 casuals worked 1-10 hours per week, earning on average \$9,941. Roughly speaking, this translates into a little less than one day of work per week at the base rate of pay. With about one-quarter of casu-

als working 1-10 hours, and with it taking about 10 years to move up through the casual boards to full union membership, it is safe to assume that most casuals in their first and second years are in this category, earning on average less than \$10,000 per year.

These conditions apply to all port workers, but what does this mean in practice for immigrants? Anyone who wants to work in this industry first has to be accepted onto the lowest casual board. Then they have to show up for work every day, but will only get work perhaps one day a week. If they do not show, they run the risk of being pushed out of the system. If they have recognized external trade/apprenticeship skills, they will much more easily accumulate hours and move up the boards. Casuals without skills will only qualify for training that allows them to increase their chances of being hired as they accumulate hours.

The people who negotiate this system best are children and relatives of members who can rely upon strong ties to those already working in the industry. They are the ones who may be nominated whenever casuals are being accepted. They can drive to the dispatch hall with the member, and perhaps even know which days they are likely to be hired, and which days they can safely take a chance and make an alternative plan to earn some money later in the day. We also observed groups of casuals travelling to the Hiring Hall together to save money on gas; some would work that day, some would return home. This is not a system for someone with a family who needs a survival job immediately.

Han was able to secure longshore work because he was qualified as a mechanic, and he is now a member of the union. But as his story describes, getting there was a long hard slog. At first he did not get enough work to support his family. He also described facing some discrimination from co-workers, as one might expect when newcomers try to join a tightly knit group of workers. However, he was able to resolve these problems by turning to the union. He would like his sons to be working on the waterfront, and he described trying to use strong ties to achieve this, even though it has not happened.

5.1.1 Han (port)

Han was born in a village in China in the early 1950s, but spent his teenage years in a city. His first job, at age 13, was as a “clean up boy” at a small pharmacy store. When he turned 18, his father suggested he take up an apprenticeship in the automotive repair trade. He worked for a European car dealership for seven years, becoming a tradesman. His apprenticeship was provided by a new government-funded trade program, and he obtained a certificate on completion. Han said this certificate was recognised in Canada under the Red Seal program.

Han’s extended family has many immigrants in Australia and Canada. The pattern started in his village in the 1800s,

and it was normal and expected that young people would emigrate. His grandfather was in Australia for thirty years, and his mother's relatives are in Victoria, BC. When his aunt offered to sponsor Han to come to Canada, he "jumped" at the opportunity even though he did not know what was in store for him. His father encouraged him to go.

He landed in 1976 and stayed in Victoria for a year with his aunt, paying her room and board. With help from his relatives, he found work as a packer for six months while still actively searching for automotive jobs. His cousin taught him that in order to find jobs he had to go to companies face-to-face to ask. Through this method, he found work at a European car dealer in Victoria, but he was sacked after only a month because he was "not fast enough". Han also lacked specialized tools; he only had hand tools as he could not yet afford the more expensive tools. Back home, the dealership supplied mechanics with specialised tools.

Then Han went from one odd job to another; restaurants, delivery, kitchen helper, farm helper. He was not making good wages. Unable to find a stable mechanic job in Victoria after a year, he ventured to Vancouver to look for work. Each time he was in Vancouver, he stayed with his father's distant relatives. In Vancouver, Han looked for car repair jobs. Again, his lack of specialised tools was a problem, as was communication; back then, there were not many Cantonese speakers driving European cars. Indeed, although many of the mechanics were also immigrants, they often spoke a second European language which fit the customer profile. He also sought work in small repair shops at gas stations. He was again unsuccessful as he was unfamiliar with the North American car models, and because he was not fluent in English. The communication issue was especially important in small dealerships and repair shops; one had to be able to communicate with customers because they did not have reception staff.

Eventually, Han found a job as a fleet mechanic with a trucking company (company A). He found this job through his Vancouver relative's neighbour, also a Chinese immigrant who was working part-time as a mechanic at the company. The neighbour introduced Han to the owner. At this job, he only had to communicate with the dispatcher, manager, and drivers. Company A owned different sizes and types of trucks. They obtained delivery contracts from warehouses and retail companies. When Han started working there, one other Chinese person worked in the accounting department. After a few months a Chinese driver joined them, but most drivers were "local boys just step out of high school". It was quite easy to get along with his colleagues, especially the young drivers. Han left in 1994 after working there for 16 years. Although he resigned, he felt he was pushed to after increasing conflict with his manager.

Han went back to his job searching. He worked at a few small repair shops, and also for a few months for an established trucking company (company B). Han described company B as a good company and they were unionized, but he quit working in late 1994 when he registered to work as a longshoreman. He said he had become aware of this option many years back. Some of the company A truck drivers were working part-time as longshoremen. He also had a close immigrant mechanic friend from company A, who had worked as a longshoreman. He suggested that Han register as a longshoreman, and this friend's advice seems to have been a key factor in influencing him. Han said that during his time, a tradesman could just go to the union hall and say he wanted a registration number, as they had a shortage of tradesman. Non-tradesman had to wait for the first Monday of every month to register.

It was not easy at first to get regular and reliable hours of work. Han got his first longshoreman job (a night shift) after five to six visits to the Hall. He got his second shift after another three weeks. Due to the infrequency and unpredictability of getting work as a longshoreman, he depended on his savings and line of credit. At that time, he had a wife, two children, and a mortgage to pay. His wife was working part-time and life was quite tough for them. They relied on Unemployment Insurance (UI), although securing two shifts in a week would provide sufficient earnings to disqualify him from UI. He also did some home-based and part-time mechanic work to supplement his longshoreman wage. It took him eight months to reach stability in his career as a longshoreman, which meant reliably receiving an average of one to two shifts per week. This eight-month period was the last time he searched for jobs. He was 44 years old.

After eleven years, Han became a member of the International Longshore and Warehouse Union (ILWU). He said some 'lucky' ones get into the union within six to eight years, but on average, it takes nine to ten years to enter the union. He felt that he took longer than the average and attributed it to the shipping cycles. Some of his contemporaries did not even make it to the union – and so did not qualify for a pension – as they were too old when they first started working as a longshoreman. Many of these men had lost their jobs during the recession when sawmills and other companies closed down. The common saying amongst longshoremen is that only one out of ten who start as casuals make it to the union.

Now that he is a union member, he can work seven days a week if he wants to. Currently, Han likes to work on cruise

ships; hence he has to turn up at the Hall if he wants to work. He started working on cruise ships just before he made it to union membership. However, as a casual and low on seniority, the jobs assigned to him were more manual (moving luggage). As he moved up to the higher boards and eventually the union, he got better jobs. This year, he got a good position providing passenger services.

As a longshoreman, he also worked as a mechanic, but he asked the union to withdraw this mechanic rating recently because he prefers to work at the cruise terminal. If he had a mechanic rating, he would have to serve this rating first if the mechanic job is assigned to him first. Han also used to hold a regular position as a mechanic, but stopped that when he wanted to drop this mechanic rating.

Han spoke about his experience as an immigrant in the waterfront industry. He said he gets along well with longshoremen who started at the same time with him, however, “racism is there”. Han said that as he moved up the board, he started to fight back by complaining to the union. Han did qualify that most of the people who discriminated against him would later try to befriend him, and they would reconcile.

Han tried to help his two sons to become longshoremen. After he became an ILWU member, he qualified to sponsor his elder son when the Hall opened its doors for registration five years ago. His elder son passed the exams, registered, and was placed on the waiting list, but he was never called to work. He also managed to get a fellow longshoreman to sponsor his younger son, but he failed the exams.

5.1.2 Luke (port)

Luke was born in China and is currently about 40 years old. He studied X-ray technology in university, and thereafter worked as an X-ray technician for ten years in a hospital. This was the only job he ever held prior to immigrating. He was certified as an electrician in China. He first started contemplating immigration to Canada in 1997 after a policy change allowed independent migration from Mainland China. A friend advised him to apply to Canada as they needed people with technical skills. He first tried enquiring with an agency, but they charged an expensive fee eight times his monthly salary. So he completed the application himself online using an English dictionary.

After one year of processing, during which time he passed an interview, his application was approved. He waited for another year, because his wife was pregnant, before finally immigrating in 2000. He arrived alone at first (followed a little later by his wife and daughter). He stayed with a friend of his sister, and it was this friend who suggested Vancouver when the immigration authorities asked him to name a city of destination. After two days, he rented a place in Burnaby.

His job search at first was very hard due to language problems. His first job was as a labourer with a Chinese-owned landscaping firm. The work was very tough as it was all weather and 8 hours per day at \$7 per hour. When his wife arrived, she found a job in a factory assembling swimming goggles. He and his friend had gone to the factory looking for work, but they only wanted women workers.

So whilst his wife worked at the factory to support him, Luke tried to improve his English at a high school; they didn't want him to be stuck in the landscaping job for ever. Through his wife, Luke got a job as a utility worker at the factory where she was working. This job required a lot of lifting and carrying around the factory cum warehouse. After one year, they were both laid off. His wife qualified for Employment Insurance (EI) and was able to get English training followed by a nursing course; she is now close to graduating from a health care college. During this time they sent their daughter back to China to stay with his parents-in-law so that both of them could focus on their studies and work.

After being laid off, Luke was unemployed for six months but was able to continue studying English. He did not qualify for EI as he had not worked long enough at the factory. His next opportunity came when his friend found a job at a Cantonese-owned injection molding firm. After two months, this friend introduced him to the manager, as they still needed packers. He enjoyed his work and all of his co-workers were Chinese speakers.

In 2003, he got his next break when the company brought in some machines from Hong Kong. He managed to convince the manager that he could do the job of maintaining them as an electrician, based on his work and training experience in China. However, the company continued to pay him the same labourer pay since he did not have Canadian electrician certification and experience. So he went to the Industry Training Authority (ITA) and was told that he could not get a certification unless he clocked 2,000 to 3,000 hours of Canadian experience. On their advice, he went to BCIT and was able to do an accelerated/renewal course; instead of one year of classes plus four years apprenticeship, he was able to write the exam to be certified as an electrician after three years.

By 2006 he had obtained his Canadian electrician certification, but when he asked for a pay raise he was refused, as the company was planning to shift their operations to Toronto in half a year's time. So he started making a series of online job applications, including one to the BCMEA as an electrician. After three weeks, he got a job as an electrician at a food factory. At \$24 per hour, the pay was better given his Canadian certification. Though the factory environment was noisy and hot due to the ovens and fryers, he had a very good supervisor. It was also a very good environment for learning English – besides his native English-speaking supervisor, his other co-workers were immigrants who spoke clearly and slowly and did not rush him to understand. He was in this job for two years, and he still works there part-time now when needed.

A year after applying, the BCMEA called him to offer him a test, which he passed. After another day of safety training, he was eligible to work via the dispatch Hall. At first he worked only on the weekends, perhaps eight days (80 hours) per half year. He held on to his food factory job during this time.

In 2008, he applied for and obtained a one-year regular position as an electrician at a marine terminal. This meant regular hours, five days a week. He described this as lucky as he applied at the right time when he was just a casual worker with no seniority. He finally quit his job at the food factory. After one year as a regular, the economy dipped, and so when the regular position was advertised again, he was replaced by a member of the union with more seniority. He had to start going to the Hall like the other casuals.

Since 2009, he has only been able to get an average of about 1,000 hours per year. He earned about \$40,000 that year, which is half of what he made as a regular in 2008. For a few years, the family was living on a combination of port work, part-time work at the food factory, EI, and some income from his wife. As a casual he had to wake up at 5am on work days, and wait at the hall till 9am. When there was no job, for him, this was time lost. In addition, he had to pay \$200 per month for gas to travel from home to the hiring hall.

In 2012, he moved up the boards and expects that he will now get more hours. Ideally, he hopes to secure more regular positions in order to moving up the boards. He also commented that regular electrician positions tend to be easier, i.e., the electrician is on standby in support of huge/expensive machines. In contrast, casual electrician positions tend to be positions for maintenance, which means 8 full hours of work.

He expects that he will now move up the boards more regularly, but that it will still take him ten to fifteen years to become a union member due to the slow economy. He says he does not really need a union membership; since he is now on the Trades board and he can expect more regular work. In this sense he is unlike the labourers, who earn much more in longshore than they would outside the industry. He thinks this is why the union members are so particular about bringing in new casuals from their family and relatives. Still, he would not leave this job now as he has invested six years to get to where he is today.

5.2 Trucking

The truck subsector includes local and long-distance general freight, bulk liquid, dry bulk, forestry products, truck terminals, vehicle towing, and support activities for trucking. The trucking subsector involved in port-logistics is also known as the drayage industry. In 2005 there were an estimated 1,200 so-called “port-truckers” in Vancouver. So, it is important to highlight that trucking, as defined here and as measured in the census data, includes a substantial num-

ber of employees that are not directly involved in port-related operations. However, there is a relatively high degree of individual and equipment mobility between specializations within the industry. A further distinction is whether the driver is an employee of a trucking firm, or an “owner-operator”, an individual who owns and drives their own truck and hauls trailers for other carriers or directly for a cargo owner (known also as a shipper). The combination of owner-operation and mobility between trucking industry segments creates a labour market characterized by numerical and externalization flexibility.

In intermodal freight transport, drayage is the transportation of containerized cargo by specialized trucking companies between container terminals (namely, in the Lower Mainland, Vanterm, Centerm, Deltaport and Fraser Surrey Docks), rail ramps (principally the Surrey and Port Coquitlam yards of CN and CP respectively), and warehouses or distribution centers; and repositioning of empty containers. Although a majority of containers leave the Lower Mainland by rail directly from the marine terminals, as many as two-fifths of the over 2.5 million container units handled by Vancouver’s ports are transported within the region by truck for transloading or delivery. There is also a small north-south movement of containers across the United States border.

The port trucking industry in Greater Vancouver has been subject to various regulatory efforts in the past decade. A “Truck Licensing System” (TLS) licence is required in order to visit a terminal of Port Metro Vancouver for the purposes of container drayage. This system was established in 2005 following a second strike (technically a withdrawal of service, since most port truck drivers were not employees) by port truckers. The TLS system has since been combined with efforts to reduce emissions by port trucking, and to stabilize the rates for port drayage. Related to this regulatory apparatus, the Port has attempted to use the issuing of TLS licences to encourage drivers to become employees, although in practice this has had limited success.

This regulatory apparatus is currently under review and revision; concerns have been raised about the effectiveness and costs of the regulations, as well as the incidence of these costs. Our interview data suggest that the TLS does constitute a small barrier to entry into port trucking, as intended, and so has stabilized rates, making port trucking relatively more attractive than long-haul trucking. Whether this will continue to be the case remains to be seen.

Furthermore, our interviews revealed that immigrants seeking to enter the trucking industry face significant barriers to entry, albeit barriers which large numbers of Punjabi immigrants to the BC Lower Mainland successfully overcome. To enter the port trucking industry, a driver requires a commercial drivers or Class 1 licence for semi-trailers (sometimes referred to as Class A by our respondents; this is borrowed from Ontario and the United States). The driver will also typically require an air brakes endorsement, which requires further training (an approved course)

and certification.

According to ICBC, the criteria to take the Class 1 test in British Columbia are as follows:

- Hold a full-privilege B.C. driver's licence (Class 5 or 6) or an out-of-province equivalent.
- Have and provide an acceptable driving record with less than four penalty point incidents in the past two years and no motor vehicle-related criminal convictions within the past three years.
- Be at least 19 if applying for a Class 1, 2, or 4 licence.
- Be at least 18 if applying for a Class 3 licence or for a heavy trailer endorsement.

Meeting these minimum criteria can take an immigrant three years after arriving in Canada; that is, to establish a clean Canadian driving record. For example, Chetana could not get proof of his clean driving record from India, and so had to wait three years to secure the clean Canadian driving record required to take the Class 1 driving test. But this was not all, Chetana also relied on a combination of strong and weak ties to find his successive driving jobs; his story in particular illustrates that there are barriers to entry to trucking in general, and port trucking in particular, for immigrants.

Acquiring a drivers' licence is only the first step towards securing a driving job. Several respondents related how they had to enter a co-driving position in order to learn how to drive in a cost-effective manner: and as much as anything, this was about establishing credibility with potential employers through the assistance of the driving mentor. Several stories illustrate the importance of these mentoring relationships. Chetana, for example, returned to his driving mentor for advice on purchasing a truck. Marcus' story illustrates the importance of co-ethnic weak ties in learning about the industry, and in finding his way into port trucking. We also interviewed a long-haul driver from Toronto – Parry – whose story reveals the lengths which drivers have to go to enter the industry. Parry took an unpaid 'job' as a co-driver in order to establish a foothold in the industry.

Strong ties also play an important role in the industry, primarily in allowing truckers to purchase their own rigs. However, they are also important in allowing some immigrants to move between trucking industry segments, a choice which many drivers like to have when business on one route is down, or if they want to change their schedule to suit changing family circumstances. Jalal's story illustrates this mobility between port, short, and long-haul trucking. In Jalal's case, family financial resources – namely, proceeds of property investments and his wife's earn-

ings - made it possible for him to take lower-paying jobs, which gave him more family time.

Likewise, Ray's story is one of a port trucker who has worked in several other segments of the trucking industry – he has worked as a company driver, made light deliveries, as well as been an owner-operator in port trucking. His story reveals a combination of formal job search strategies, such as responding to newspaper advertisements, but also reliance upon family supports (strong ties) for financial capital.

In popular discourse and much academic research, the port trucking industry is characterized as having low barriers to entry. This is seen as the primary explanation for the low earnings and hard working conditions of port truckers. Our research does not question this general characterization of the trucking labour market; for example, our statistical data shows that truckers, on average, have the lowest earnings and longest hours. However, our qualitative data show that entering the trucking industry is not a simple matter for immigrants. It requires investment and social connections, and most importantly, it takes time. This would lead us to qualify the 'low barriers to entry' hypothesis: barriers to movement between the different segments of the trucking industry are low and these act to keep down earnings, but barriers to entry into the sector writ large are not necessarily low.

Our interviews revealed that Vancouver's immigrant port truckers have a rather strong attachment to the industry. It is not only that they have invested heavily in time and financial resources to work in the industry, and hence that they have 'high barriers to exit'. They also revealed a certain cultural and familial attachment to the industry. Ron and Kassim's stories illustrate the importance of these dynamics: Ron's father had driven trucks in India before immigrating, while Kassim's father introduced him directly to the industry. Both of these respondents, who share a deep and long attachment to the industry, spoke about the decline of the best (most stable and high-paying) local trucking jobs. This sentiment was echoed by the union member and official we interviewed who expressed concern that the gains made by port truckers after the 1999 and 2005 industrial action were eroding. It is likely that this will reinforce the trend for (port) trucking as an ethnic niche for South Asian immigrants, and for non-immigrants to exit the industry.

5.2.1 Chetana (trucking)

Chetana is a 33-year-old immigrant from Punjab, India. He immigrated in 2007 after receiving a bachelor's degree in English and pursuing a four-year career in a telecommunication company as a customer service provider. He immigrated via the marriage stream after his wife (and her family) had immigrated a year before him. Chetana's in-laws had prepared a job for him in Canada in a construction company. Within a few days of entering Canada he started his training period on a construction site. Unfortunately on the fourth day of work, he had a serious accident and broke his foot. This made him stay at home for about six months. He was covered by Employment Insurance during this period.

After recovery he did not go back to construction and instead, through an internet search (Craigslist), he found a pizza delivery job. Although this job required walking, the East-Indian employer agreed to give him a chance. This was a part-time evening job. Chetana also took advantage of his time to take a two-week flag-person course. With this certificate he found work through a placement agency in New Westminster. The job started from 6 a.m. and ended at 4 p.m.; and after that he had to go to the pizza delivery job and work until 11:30 on weekdays, and until 1am on weekends. He was getting \$15 per hour for the flag job and about \$12 on average (\$9 + tips) for the pizza delivery job.

After six to seven months, being frustrated with the hard work and considering the advice and introductions provided by some relatives, Chetana went to a forklift training course to upgrade his resume. When he was done with the four-day forklift training (it cost him \$200), he went for an interview at a newly opened vegetable warehouse and was offered a full-time contract after a two-day test. He was employed as a logistics supervisor to load and unload vegetables. He left his flag-person job and reduced his delivery job to weekends only. He was paid \$16 per hour in his new job.

At the end of 2008 he was told that he would be laid-off for at least four months. But Chetana wanted to sponsor his parents to come to Canada, and a four-month on-leave status would make him ineligible. So he quit the warehouse job and started working with his father-in-law in the construction industry. While working with his father-in-law, he applied for jobs in the warehouse industry and finally found another one through Craigslist. After a five-minute interview, he was hired for a similar position to the one he had held a few months before. After five months, he was told that he would again be laid-off temporarily, so he made the decision to resign and went back to work for his father-in-law again.

Chetana's new round of search (focused on Craigslist) led him to a position in a vehicle towing company. In this new job he worked from 10 a.m. to 8 p.m. for a year and a half, for \$15-16 hourly pay. He finally left his pizza delivery job when he started this new job.

Chetana had wanted to enter the trucking industry soon after arriving in Canada because he knew truckers were well paid. However he could not obtain an official copy of his Indian driving record; instead, he had to wait to create a three-year Canadian clean-driving record. In October 2010, he finally received his commercial Class 1 licence and started driving as a trainee with one of the drivers he had met at the parking lot of the towing company. He learned how to drive with this guy in two months. They drove four to five trips each month to California and Texas and back. He was paid the basic pay (around \$1000-1500 per month). He looked at this pay as a transition and investment period.

Chetana's two-month experience was not enough for him to qualify as a full-time owner-operator, so with the help of the same truck driver who had trained him, he found a four-month job as a co-driver. He was paid \$4,000 to \$4,500 per month during this period. Once he completed the required six months of learning and co-driving, he was hired as an owner-operator. He bought a second-hand truck from the United States by borrowing from his in-laws and his sister and paid them off with the help of his friends and his own income. Chetana worked for this company until early 2012.

Chetana thought of changing his driving work from California to local routes. This would enable him to spend more time with his family, as his older son was four, and his wife was expecting another baby. Through an introduction by his friend (the trucker who taught him driving) he went to a transport company that serves Western Canada, which had a local port trucking job opening. His friend was connected to this company via the gym that he and some drivers in that company frequented. They were hiring owner-operators to go to ports in Vancouver and Seattle. Chetana could not get a Vancouver port licence, but he managed to obtain a TWIC (Transport Worker Identification Card, issued by US Homeland Security) card. His job is to haul containers between the Port of Seattle and Vancouver locations. The job also includes some local deliveries in Metro Vancouver. He has just started working in this company, and he expects to be paid around \$5,000 per month.

5.2.2 Jalal (trucking)

Jalal is a truck driver who emigrated from Punjab, India, when he was 25 years old. Before immigration he had worked as a math teacher after his bachelor's degree in agricultural sciences. Jalal immigrated to Canada because he had heard of better employment opportunities and living standards from an uncle who lived in Canada. He immigrated to Canada after marrying his wife who had immigrated before him. Upon entering Canada, he was recruited into his uncle's video store. Soon he became the lead service provider in this store which had about 900 customers per week. He was paid \$500 per month but this was for personal expenses; living expenses were paid by his uncle. His English was not good, but because many of the video store customers were Indians he did not have communication problems.

After fifteen months in the video store and in search of a new job, Jalal obtained first aid and truck driving licences with the goal of becoming an ambulance driver. But soon he changed his decision because he had learned that he could be sent to work in a remote location for a long time. However, the certificates provided him the opportunity to enter long-haul truck driving.

Jalal's driving instructor introduced him to a small trucking company with three to four trucks working in long haul. He started as a co-driver to an owner-operator who trained him. In this job Jalal was paid 12 cents per mile, his pay increased to 15 cents after five months. However the owner-operator who hired Jalal went bankrupt, and did not pay part of his salary. Subsequently, the company went bankrupt. Jalal heard from one of his colleagues about a job opportunity in another company that had just received a contract with a big retailer, and so he moved to this company as a co-driver.

He applied formally and was hired to work on the California route. He worked there for five to six months as an employee driver. Jalal was trained by a co-driver for this new job because the retail company needed special skills for backing up in very tight places in LA and San Diego. He was paid 15 cents per mile. Jalal made about \$3,500 per month by working as much as he could.

With this job, Jalal had the opportunity to get enough experience and saved enough money to buy his own truck. He wanted to become an owner-operator because owner-operators on the same route were making \$6,000 to \$7,000 per month. Jalal found out about an owner-operator job by talking on the radio to other drivers on the California route. A bank agreed to finance his truck based on the letter of employment he had received from the hiring company.

In this new position he worked on many routes in North America. He worked about 60 hours per week and he did not have a co-driver because he was not going very far. He had trainees, which he enjoyed; he trained ten to fifteen people, and they are now all successful owner-operators.

A turning point in Jalal's life came in 2000. While he had been working for sixteen months in the same company and was making good money, his truck was getting old and costing him a lot in maintenance. He realised he had to change it if he wanted to continue being an owner-operator. He was also facing many family problems at this time, and he got divorced. He sold his truck, quit the owner-operator job and started working as a bus driver for a company that carried farm workers during the harvest season. After four or five months, he was laid off. However, he was single at the time and he did not need much money to live on. After he was laid off, he collected Employment Insurance (EI), and he also received his citizenship in that year.

After a few months on EI, with the invitation of his roommate, he started long haul driving again. He was getting 20 cents for each mile at that time, and depending on how hard he worked he received between \$3,000 and \$4,000 per month. He usually went on the Vancouver-LA-Toronto route. With this work secured, he went to India for three months and re-married there. He could not bring his wife and child from India to Canada until 2003 (because of the immigration procedure), so he came back alone and continued working on long haul routes. However, when his wife and child came to Canada, he quit the long haul job and started a short-haul job, going to Tacoma and coming back the same day or the next day. He worked in this company and another one from 2003-2007, on the same route. He found this job through his landlord, someone who had previously been one of his trainees. While working in this company, Jalal again decided to be an owner-operator in a similar process to what he had experienced a few years before. His monthly pay was between \$6,000 and \$7,000.

Jalal changed his truck in 2005 and he also invested in a property in that year. This investment turned into a big profit for him so he quit the short-haul job to Tacoma and started a port job in the city because he did not need much money. He was recruited into a company that is owned by a Chinese person that is honest and distributes the work between drivers fairly. Jalal says that the company is small, but is doing a good job. He worked for this company in 2007 for five to six months, but because he needed more money (he had a second kid and had bought a new house) and this port job was not providing enough, he went back to the long haul driving for four years.

Jalal made another profitable property investment in 2007. Because of this he was able to receive a second loan which has allowed him to return to port driving. He is now able to be with his family more and enjoys helping his son with school work. His wife has started working, and this has also provided some room for him to quit the long haul job. Switching back from long haul to port trucking job in 2012 meant a \$4,000 per month loss of income. Coming back to the port trucking job was easy; the Chinese guy liked Jalal's work and invited him back.

5.2.3 Kassim (trucking)

Kassim was born in India and came to Canada when he was 17 years old. He completed his studies at a local Canadian secondary school and graduated as a straight-A student. His father had come to Montreal in 1994 and started working as a truck driver. He did not have any trucking experience prior to moving to Canada. He moved to Vancouver a year or so later with the help of relatives who themselves had been in Vancouver for over a decade.

Kassim was introduced to the trucking industry through helping his father to move and hook up trailers. He used to drop his father off for work and started 'falling in love' with trucking. In those days, he was allowed to take an Air Brake course before turning 19. He passed it, and straight after his nineteenth birthday, he took professional truck driving classes and obtained a licence. With help from his father, he started driving a truck in that year.

His first trucking job was linked to his previous work at a fast food restaurant where he had the opportunity to meet many trucker patrons. One regular trucker customer, who came by three days a week, connected him with a local trucking company to do yard work at a big distribution centre (company A). Kassim worked there for seven to eight months. His starting wage was \$12.42 per hour. After three months, he earned a \$1.50 per hour bonus for a no-accident record. Soon after he started work at company A, ICBC started taking over the road testing and the Air Brake course from professional truck-driving schools. They also implemented a graduated licence programme, all with English as the only medium of communication. He learned that many people failed the trucking test, as they are ESL speakers. Professional truck driving schools were able to offer instruction in the native-language of the immigrants. He believes these changes led to trucker shortages.

His second trucking job opportunity came to him at the yard when he was approached by a driver who told him about another yard job opening at a local transport company (company B) located in Burnaby. If he made the move, Company B would give him a brand new truck, let him stay in the yard, and give him a higher wage at \$18 per hour. In the trucking industry, when companies are looking to hire, they pay existing employees a commission (a few hundred dollars) for a good recommendation, provided the new hire stays for at least six months.

Kassim did not know the driver who recommended the job to him; he was just someone who dropped loads at the distribution centre. He felt this job opportunity came to him due to his experience, as he described his truck backing work as 'top skill job, really tight to get into the doors'.

So Kassim moved on to work for company B as a yard worker. He was moving trailers from one door to another. He worked every day from 5 a.m. till 3 p.m., five days a week. He had ten guaranteed hours of work per day, with his pay rising to \$20 per hour. Kassim worked for company B for over nine years. For the first five years, he worked in the yard. In late 2004, he bought his own truck and started driving on the roads because his company needed another skilled driver to pull two trailers called Super Bs. Pulling Super Bs requires more skill than driving a regular single trailer.

His motivation for buying a truck then was that he believed he would earn more as an owner-operator. By switching to pulling Super Bs, he was paid \$42 per hour plus 10% fuel surcharge (\$4.20). Diesel was cheap then, at 70 cents per litre. He felt lucky that he could pull steel on Super Bs, as the wage for regular trailer-loads was \$32 per hour. He also knew it would be high-stress, high-risk work since he had to pay for the fuel and maintenance. He did his math and made the switch.

He paid \$30,000 cash for his first pre-owned truck. This money was from his savings from his yard-worker days. When asked why he did not buy a truck earlier, he said he was earning 'good enough' money as a yard worker, plus he was given 2 hours of overtime per day.

As a truck owner driver, he initially did only local routes, with nothing on the highway. On a typical day, he would be delivering BC liquor loads in the morning, then he would pull steel on Super Bs locally from Burnaby to Surrey or Langley; once in a while he would deliver steel to Chilliwack. Most steel came by rail. This job with company B is no longer as lucrative. Back in 2004, they paid him \$46.20 per hour, now they will pay only \$41.50 per hour. Added to the lower wage, the fuel price has doubled, and insurance is up 30%. He felt the wages fell due to overseas competition. For instance, Canadian steel was unable to compete with cheaper overseas steel.

As a result of overseas competition, company B was unable to give Kassim enough delivery jobs, so he did not have enough work for a few months. He left company B and started doing highway routes for a port drayage company (company C). He got this highway job through a friend who knew the hirer, who was looking for a driver with a clean driver's abstract. He ran the Seattle route which would take a day to do a round trip. He also did other day trips to Kelowna or Kamloops. He worked for over a year and was earning \$2,500 to \$3,000 a month, with 9 to 11 hours of work a day. He felt he was burning too much expensive fuel and was not making good money for the time he put in.

So he moved on to a job with a local transport company (company D), but after three months he was not getting enough hours again and was staying home two out of five days in a week. As company D had some trucking services at another company (company E), they gave Kassim jobs with company E and that placed him four out of five days with work to do.

Kassim also tried to get into port trucking but was unable to, as he is not registered with the ports.

Summing up his trucking career, Kassim said that in the initial years trucking as a career was good. It helped him to buy his own house. Now, however, he has difficulties paying his monthly bills (e.g. hydro, insurance for car), with a \$35,000 annual income coupled with a family of two children to feed. He became a Canadian citizen in 2000, got married in 2007, and his two children were born in 2008 and 2010.

Given the current situation, he would not recommend the trucking industry to anybody. At most, he would suggest driving for a company and not being an owner-operator: "With a company, you are paid, say, \$20 per hour for 40 hours a week. The pay is guaranteed, no risk."

5.2.4 Marcus (trucking)

Marcus was born in 1972 in Punjab, India. After secondary school he went to college for a while but did not finish his Bachelor of Arts because he had to get married. The marriage was arranged, and his wife had come to Canada in 1990 with her family four years before Marcus arrived. When Marcus landed in Canada, he was only 22 years old, and his wife was working as a cleaner.

Marcus said that the job market was bad when he first arrived and it did not help that he did not have work experience. The minimum wage then was about \$6 per hour. He had no car and was staying in his parents-in-law's basement. His wife was earning \$12-13 per hour. Still, they were able to get by. Marcus recalled how he used to walk the streets of Surrey asking for work. He also followed his wife's advice and attended ESL classes. After a while, Marcus obtained a driving licence, and from his wife's savings they were able to buy a car.

His first work experience was volunteering at a printing shop for a few months. The shop did not need extra people, but because the boss was a family friend, he welcomed Marcus to learn how to operate the machine. It did not work out for Marcus. Then he moved on to helping his brother-in-law in his small 'drywall' business. He started work in Dec 1994. The job did not require any training as he was just helping out by passing mud. Unfortunately, after just one month on the job, he fell from scaffolding and broke his right elbow. He stayed at a Surrey hospital for a week, followed by three surgeries to improve his right elbow joint. He was able to claim through Workers Compensation Board (WCB) 75% of his monthly salary.

Marcus said WCB was very diligent in following up with his recovery so that he could go back to work as soon as possible. WCB also offered him other alternative programs, for instance classes in resume writing and interview skills. Marcus did not find them useful. After a year and a half, WCB assessed that his accident had inflicted permanent damage to part of his body. Based on this assessment, WCB decided to pay him a small life-time pension. Years later, Marcus took advantage of a WCB program to receive his compensation as a lump-sum payout, which he used as down-payment for purchasing a house.

Marcus said that prior to his accident, he was an aggressive and ambitious person who always wanted to achieve something significant in life and earn lots of money through hard work. He felt he had not achieved much since coming to Canada and was still living in his in-laws' basement. He weighed his options and knew his injury would preclude him from working in certain industries, such as construction or heavy industry. He also knew he was not interested in going back to school. His wife wanted him to finish his Grade 12 equivalent program and then obtain a diploma. But he was not interested in school. WCB also did not offer any trades certificate during his recovery process.

His interest in truck driving originated from his wife's cousin, who was a long-haul trucker. With his help, Marcus got a truck licence and teamed up with him as a co-driver in 1997. Marcus felt it was easy for him to enter this job as he had support from his wife's cousin. His wife and in-laws were not in favour of his decision because of the time away from home. Indeed, his Vancouver-California-Toronto-Vancouver route entailed a cycle of seven to eight days on the road followed by two to three days at home. Despite family objections, Marcus persisted as he was finally starting to earn a decent income, typically around \$3,000 a month.

In 1998, Marcus had his first son. He started to miss seeing his son whilst at work and so he quit long haul driving in 1999, bought his own truck and started plying the California-Vancouver route. With this 'mid-haul' route, he would be on the road for three to four days followed by three to four days at home. He was able to move into this job because he understood the options as a trucker, and because he had saved enough money for the \$15,000 down-payment for his first truck.

He described the work as good, but very hard in terms of long hours. It was also tough on him mentally and emotionally as he was alone much of the time. Truckers rely heavily on short-range CB radio networks for information when they drive. He described a typical way of getting to know other truckers; when waiting at the border, Punjabi-speaking truckers would chat and get to know who is heading the same direction. For the next few days, they would travel together and get to know one another and constantly update one another with road conditions, police speed traps, amongst other things. Marcus said that truckers survive on 'gossip talk' on the radio, learning for instance, how much each trucker earns.

With his own truck, he was earning \$1,400 for a one-way trip from Vancouver to California by carrying cargo such as paper rolls or lumber. From California back to Vancouver, he was paid US \$1,700 to \$1,800 for bringing produce to Safeway or Superstore. Payment was based per load, and the exchange rate worked in his favour. He drove this route till 2002.

In late 2002, he decided to work with the ports so that he could see his family every day. Prior to making this decision, he checked about the conditions at the ports with a fellow trucker he had met on the long haul radio network that had recently switched to port trucking. Marcus understood that it is not difficult to work at the ports, but he had to accept a pay-cut of 30% compared to his mid-haul job.

Since his decision to move to the ports, Marcus has been working in the city. At first there was no need for a licence to ply the ports, and no barrier to entry. Marcus just enquired with a local transport company (company A), and they dispatched him to the ports. No questions were asked about his experience or credentials. The company had sixty drivers, of which fifty-five were owner-operators. A typical day for him started at 7 a.m. till 4 p.m. He did three to four

loads per day, with a maximum of five. He was paid \$60 a load for carrying a load from Surrey to downtown. After deducting business expenses, he pocketed \$3,000 to \$3,500 a month. It was “not a great amount” but he was happy, and both he and his wife could be home in the evening to play with their son. He has now been working the ports for ten years. It has been stable for him, although he did complain that if longshoremen wanted to delay the cargo loading for some reason, the truckers cannot do anything.

Marcus participated in the second truckers strike in 2005. The reasons for this strike were because truck line-ups were very long due to ‘slow’ longshoremen, and rates were too low at \$60 a move. Truckers had to pay their own fuel and maintenance, while brokers and middlemen were getting the bulk of the money.

One follow-up to the strike was the Truck Licensing System (TLS) implemented by the Port. Marcus said that any trucker with a TLS permit is in demand now as companies are desperate for port truckers. He thinks he (as an owner-operator with TLS permit) is paid more than a company driver (with TLS permit). But also thinks he earns more than an owner-operator without a TLS permit; but, he qualified that he knows a family friend who does not go to the ports and just moves loads from one warehouse to another earning about the same amount. Marcus does not track his hours, but he thinks he works longer hours than company drivers, perhaps as much as 15 to 16 hours a day.

Recently Marcus left company A for another established company (company B). He made the move as he heard that company B has a better system; they offer a fuel subsidy and pay truckers for waiting time at the pick-up or delivery points. The downside is they pay less per load but overall, it works out better for Marcus in terms of take-home pay. Company B has 100 owner-operated truckers, all having a TLS permit. They do deliveries from rail and port terminals to warehouses.

Marcus said truckers like him would “queue up” to join company B. Company B’s recruitment requirement is that truckers must have a clean driving abstract, that is, no tickets or accidents in the last five years. Marcus had a couple of tickets in the past, but once his record was clean he applied to work in company B. He did not depend on any familial ties in clinching this job as it was entirely based on a good reference from company A and his driving record. Marcus said the only disadvantage on this job is he has to work on weekends, with Tuesdays and Wednesdays off.

Marcus concluded that he would not recommend trucking to anyone unless the person had no education. He would not want his children to drive a truck. But he had some nephews from Punjab, with no education and a farming background, and he did suggest to them that trucking might be an option.

5.2.5 Parry (trucking)

Parry is presently 35 years old, from Punjab, India. He married in 1998 and has two children now. Parry immigrated to Canada when he was 14 years old under the sponsorship of his uncle. When he first landed, his uncle provided him support by letting him stay in his house in Toronto and in return he had to contribute financially to the family by working. His uncle was self-employed and had a small furniture manufacturing company.

Parry obtained his Canadian citizenship ten years after he landed in Canada. He is still living in Toronto, but was in Vancouver for work purposes when we interviewed him. Parry has minimal Canadian education; after attending only two years of school in Canada, he left school with Grade 10. He thinks this contributed to his difficulties finding a job initially.

He worked as a welder for ten years, but in 2003, Parry became a truck driver. He quit his former welding job as he said it was giving him “too much headache, smokes and I got asthma, I quit”. His welding job’s starting pay was \$12 per hour, rising to \$18 per hour before he quit. He said he decided to go into trucking because he loved driving and he heard that there were more jobs in trucking.

But in reality it was not that easy for him to get a trucking job after he obtained his truck licence. Getting a truck driv-

ing licence is time-consuming; one must have a clean car licence, go to truck driving school and pass the tests, and only then is one ready to seek practical experience under the guidance of an experienced driver. He said that there was no professional driver who would train him so that he could start receiving paid jobs. Established companies were looking for professional drivers with Canadian experience. In order to clinch a co-driver position with a company, he agreed to work without pay. In this job, he worked alongside a driver (another immigrant), learning to drive in a “professional manner”.

Parry shared that it can take a few months to a year before a trucker becomes a professional. A professional is able to reverse backwards into a dock. He must also be good with mountain (uphill and downhill) driving. All drivers have to go through a period of being a co-driver before they can pass a company’s pre-employment test.

Parry thinks half of port truck drivers own their tractors and about half are driving trucks that are owned by companies and brokers. Generally, all loads and trailers are provided by companies. Parry bought his first tractor, used, for \$89,000 after working for one year as a co-driver. He said a brand new tractor would have cost him \$120,000. Drivers who own their trucks have to cover their own maintenance, insurance, and fuel. Companies cover all of these when a trucker drives his company-owned truck.

Parry bought his second, current tractor four years ago under a “lease to own” contract with the bank, which offers a range of three to five years of contract periods. The lease on Parry’s first tractor was paid off when it was in an accident. The accident happened when his co-driver, whom he was training, was at the wheel. His insurance paid the book value, but it was a very small portion of the tractor’s value. His co-driver also received a ticket (fine) for the accident but still allowed to drive.

Parry described his life as a long-haul trucker; “you do not stay at home, I’m here for three days and if you count these hours, I do not make even one dollar in a day.” Parry is usually at home for only four days each month. He would usually take a load from Toronto to Vancouver, and then he usually travels empty (without any load) from Vancouver to California, and finally he will return to Toronto with a load. The post-Christmas months of January and February are the slow months. Parry does not pick up loads directly from the ports but from one warehouse to another. He does not have any desire to do any port pick-ups because it would require him to buy a different and newer tractor.

Parry observed that rates have stayed the same for almost twenty years. With rising diesel prices, his profits have eroded over time. This could be why he thinks that “making money is not easy in this country”. Yet, he feels the income he earns as a trucker is good. His average annual earnings are between \$80,000 and \$100,000 before tax, after paying for fuel, maintenance, and all business expenses, including paying his co-driver. Overall, Parry is quite satisfied with his present income and is likely to stay in this industry as a long haul driver.

5.2.6 Ray (trucking)

Ray attended a private high school in New Delhi, India. This school was established by a British man, and all courses were taught in English. Ray then obtained his Bachelor of Arts followed by a six-month course in hotel management. After this course, Ray obtained employment in a five-star hotel. He attributes his strong English skills to his schooling, and to having come from a large city. Ray married his wife in India. At the time of their marriage, Ray’s wife was working in a bank. She had earlier immigrated to Vancouver with her family. In 1992, six months after marrying his wife, Ray immigrated to Vancouver to be with her. He was in his late twenties at that time.

Three months after arriving in Vancouver, Ray started looking for work. Initially he wanted to find work in the hotel industry as this is where his experience was. Ray applied for one hotel position, but he quickly learned that the pay was not very good in this industry, with the starting wage at \$10-12 an hour. Ray’s wife knew some people in the construction industry. With this connection, Ray did not have to go through an interview and was simply told to show up for work the next day. Ray described the pay in this position as “okay” (\$12 an hour with no benefits); however, the position required too many hours (working six to seven days a week from 6 a.m. or 7 a.m. to 6 p.m.). He described the work as physically hard, especially compared to his past hotel work experience. Ray did not find this job suitable and

quit after nine to ten months without another job offer.

Based on recommendations from friends and his wife, Ray began looking into both the taxi and trucking industries. Through further conversations with friends, Ray decided that taxi driving was not for him. It was too dangerous, as you are by yourself at night. Trucking seemed like the better option. Approximately a week and a half after Ray quit his construction job, he found a newspaper advertisement hiring a driver for a food distribution company in Vancouver. Ray applied and had a short ten minute interview. He was asked if he had any experience driving, and he replied in the negative but explained that he really wanted to drive. Ray described the guy who interviewed him as not picky. After checking Ray's licence, he was offered the job. This company had seven of their own trucks, and Ray drove one of them. The company had approximately fifteen to eighteen staff, some of which were immigrants. Ray described this job as better than his construction job. He was paid \$16 an hour, and he worked Monday to Friday. The job also had full benefits which was great for his family. After a few months, Ray's wage increased to \$17.50 per hour.

Ray's wife suggested that Ray get his own truck and be his own boss. Ray bought a used five-ton delivery truck for \$12,000. He was able to put some money toward a down payment from his and his wife's savings, plus taking out a \$5,000 loan. Ray worked at the food distribution company for approximately a year and half when he decided to quit. He did not have any problems with the job, rather he had gotten experience driving on the roads in Vancouver, and felt comfortable driving his own truck.

In 1994, again through the newspaper, Ray saw that a freight company in the Lower Mainland was looking for an owner-operator driver. Ray applied and was interviewed for approximately thirty minutes. His experience and reference from the food distribution company helped him secure the job. In this position, Ray was making \$5,000 to \$6,000 gross a month, taking home approximately \$4,000 a month (after deducting diesel and insurance expenses). However, now Ray had to provide his own health benefits and pay his own taxes. Ray said he really enjoyed having his own truck as he was making better money, and working the same hours. In 1996/1997 Ray started looking for a new job as he heard that the company might be sold.

In 1997 Ray got his class one driver licence and took an airbrakes course. Through some people in the trucking industry, he heard that another freight carrier company was looking for a driver; however, he needed a newer truck to qualify. He was able to sell his five-ton truck for \$10,000. With this money, he put a down payment on a new, \$36,000 truck. Ray got the job with the new freight carrier company and he was making approximately \$6,000 take-home pay a month. He described this job as very good; he liked his boss and his work with this company, which included working in the warehouse and unloading the trucks. Ray described the diversity of people in this company, both immigrants (Chinese, Korean) and non-immigrants. Ray worked for this company for approximately six years.

In 2002 or 2003, the freight carrier company signed a contract with another general freight company to do their work in British Columbia. This contract was for one year; thereafter the general freight company decided to open their own warehouse in the Lower Mainland. The general freight company hired all of the old freight carrier company's owner-operator truck drivers (approximately 15-16 people), including Ray. With the switch, Ray sold his truck and leased a light haul truck for \$1,250 a month (on a five-year lease). Ray's pay increased to approximately \$8,000 take home. This increase occurred because the company paid Ray extra for certain kinds of deliveries, for instance, mall deliveries. Further he enjoyed cheaper diesel rates due to the size of the company. This company also paid half of his insurance.

In 2009, Ray was encouraged by a friend to switch to another trucking position with the railway. Ray stopped leasing and bought a bigger truck with a tractor that cost him \$62,000. Ray just told the manager he wanted to work for them, and was given the job. At this job, Ray hauls containers, drops them off for customers, and picks up empty containers (he does not go into the ports). Ray described this job as easy work. Ray is currently taking home approximately \$12,000 a month.

Ray continuously described his various trucking jobs as easy ("piece of cake"), suggesting that they are not even comparable to the amount of work he had to do when working in his construction job. He attributes his success in the trucking industry due to his hard work and honest interest of wanting to get into trucking.

5.2.7 Ron (trucking)

Ron immigrated in 1982 from India. His sister had immigrated in 1974 and sponsored his entire family (parents and siblings) to come to Canada. He was studying a Bachelor of Arts just before immigrating. After immigrating, as the oldest child in his family, he had to discontinue school and work to financially support the family. He did not have work experience in India beyond working on the family farm. His family history was in the transportation business, as his father was a trucker in India, so he always had an interest in being a trucker.

Ron first found work on farms in Abbotsford and Vancouver. The economy was down in 1982, so there were not many jobs. Ron decided to move to northern British Columbia. Without ever making use of an employment agency to find work, he got a job working on the railway as a Machine Operator. This was a seasonal position where he built and repaired tracks during summer. No skills or certification were needed for this job, rather, Ron was applying what he knew from working with machines on the family farm in India. Ron earned approximately \$15,000 to \$20,000 a year. He left this job in 1988.

Ron learned that some friends were driving trucks in Surrey, and he asked them about the pay and nature of the trucking industry. At first Ron drove with somebody, as he had no experience. Later, Ron found a company selling trucks with ready jobs. He paid a \$10,000 down payment for a \$40,000 truck, and obtained a loan for the rest of the truck. Ron's entire family supported him financially with this purchase, as there was a family background in this industry.

For the next twelve years, Ron worked for the same transportation company on highway and port routes. For the first several years, he brought containers to and from ports in Tacoma, Seattle, Vancouver, and Portland. For a few years he was paid by the trip. For every \$1 earned, the driver would get 70%, and the company would get 30%. He described this as a good job; the pay was slowly going up due to the union contract, but he did not like working away from his family and quit long haul driving in 1997.

He stayed with the same transportation company and switched to an in-town route. In this position he was paid hourly, which was better because he got paid while waiting for container pick-ups. He did this for two years. While working with this transportation company, Ron also volunteered as a union shop steward for eight years. Ron became the union shop steward because he could speak good English, and the other drivers favoured him.

In 2000, Ron learned from the president of the union of an in-town only job with a new transportation company. This company had a contract with the railway. He joined this company and delivered containers from the rail yard to the warehouse; then he either returned them to the yard, or took them to other customers. This was one of the rapidly disappearing hourly paid jobs (\$36 an hour). Ron does not think this job paid more than his previous company. He stayed with the company for a decade until the company lost the contract with the railway. Today, Ron is an owner-operator driver moving containers around the Lower Mainland.

5.3 Warehousing

The warehouse subsector includes jobs found in general warehouse and storage, grain elevators, and refrigerated warehouses. Warehouses are found at transport nodes (shipping terminals, railroads, airports) or easily assessed industrial land sites, and are owned or used by importers, exporters, retailers, wholesalers, manufacturers, transport companies, and Third/Fourth party logistics (3PL and 4PL) providers. Warehouses have changed over the years from traditional inventory storage facilities to highly specialized and efficient distribution centres with fully automated storage and retrieval systems. Warehouses come in different types and sizes to serve a variety of markets.

Employees in the warehousing subsector are diverse and include managerial, clerical, quality assurance, asset protection, IT support, and maintenance positions; while direct labour includes employees using cranes, forklift, power equipment, and inventory tags to unload, pack, unpack, receive, haul, store, and retrieve goods. In the port-logistics sector, jobs are dominated by blue-collar, physical work and can be found in the following settings:

- a. Cross Docking: where two or more shipping containers come in, are unpacked and their contents are mixed and repacked;
- b. Transloading: whereby commodities are loaded from rail (for example, lumber and grains) into containers, or from marine containers to domestic containers. Transloading is increasingly common in Metro Vancouver;
- c. Bonded warehouse: which includes customs brokers handling paper work on import and export; allows warehouse stocks to be released according to customers' demand to delay payment of customs duty; and
- d. Distribution Centres, which service retail outlets; including inventory management, operating automated storage, and retrieval systems.

The growth in container throughput in Vancouver in the past two decades was preceded by an important change in the regulations governing the handling of containerized products in warehouses. Prior to 1987, it was required that ILWU members be employed to stuff and destuff any containers in Vancouver that did not exclusively originate from, or that were destined for, a beneficial cargo owner. The change in the rules made warehousing cheaper and, in return, the ILWU pension fund received a per container payment. The removal of this so-called 'container clause' or 'beneficial cargo owners clause' encouraged the expansion of port-related warehousing activities in the BC Lower Mainland.

The warehouse subsector has been growing, and yet the share of jobs held by immigrants has not (yet) changed greatly. This finding is surprising: barriers to entry into the sector are low, and we found little evidence of strong ties in hiring practices. However, there are indications that the most recent census period (2006-2011) will show more rapid change in the immigrant share. Between 2001 and 2006, the share of immigrants in the warehousing subsector jumped from 21.1 to 26.8%.

Today, some warehouses in the BC Lower Mainland are unionized. The ILWU Canada-affiliated Retail Wholesale Union represents about 2,000 workers. The Teamsters Union also rep-

resents warehouse workers. The warehouse subsector, like the port and trucking subsectors, faces a high degree of variability due to seasonal and other changes. Hence, unions have bargained for seniority systems as a way of dealing with the employer's demand for numerical flexibility. The warehouse where Isabel works, for example, makes use of numerical flexibility. As with the port subsector, seniority-based work allocations may account, in part, for the slow change in the immigrant share of employment.

However, barriers to entry into the warehousing subsector are relatively low compared to the port subsector. Even those immigrants without good English language skills can find work in warehousing. Sally – now in the FTA subsector – spent several years working in a warehouse when it became apparent that her lack of English skills meant that she was not suited for customer service. Luke, now in the port subsector related a similar experience.

To start working in a warehouse, only basic certificates are required: knowledge of the Workplace Hazardous Materials Information System (WHMIS), Forklift Operators Certification, and Occupational First Aid (Level One). The entire suite of certificates can be acquired in two weeks through 'job club' programs offered by some Immigrant Services Agencies. A Surrey-based agency works closely with warehouse employers to place immigrants in jobs.

A longer, fourteen-week program is offered by the Light Warehouse Training Program at Douglas College. Although the focus of this program is on people with multiple barriers to employment (which could range from addictions to learning disabilities), some of the successful graduates of the program are immigrants. The program requires considerable resources, to be sure, but has two particular benefits for immigrants: first, the intense exposure to colloquial English, and second, an unpaid work experience placement that may lead to a job offer.

Yu got his warehousing job because he attended such a training course. He is now receiving cross-training in his union job, and echoes that this is a good job for someone with limited English. However, it should also be noted that he has been able to work night shifts – which is what is available to someone without seniority in his workplace - because his wife can care for their child. This underscores the idea that one possible reason why immigrants have not entered the warehousing subsector in greater numbers is that the hours are difficult for those with family commitments.

The statistical data suggests that working conditions in the warehouse subsector have deteriorated for non-immigrants; for example, earnings of non-immigrants fell, converging with the lower earnings of immigrants. Joe made reference to some of the tensions between immigrant and non-immigrant workers in his warehouse. While he echoed the sentiments about immigrants

being able to enter the warehousing subsector easily, he does not recommend it.

There are more skilled positions in the warehouse subsector which closely resemble some occupations in the FTA subsector. For these positions, specialized, often computer-related skills are important. Amy believes that she found her current job in warehousing because of the production and inventory management qualification she obtained while working in the first job she found in Canada. That first job began as a temporary warehouse position where she was then promoted in the internal labour market.

5.3.1 Amy (warehousing)

Amy is from a province in central China. She studied electrical engineering and worked initially as an assistant electrical engineer, then in marketing for different companies. By the time she immigrated, she was managing a small team, identifying clients, and developing what she referred to as “sales channels” within China. She enjoyed the work, the contact with the customers, and also noted that she had a good living (“I had an apartment and a car when most people in China at that time still had bicycles”) earning money on commission. Her job was exclusively within China and provided no opportunity to develop English skills or to travel outside the country. Although she did help to connect clients with vendors, production, and transport arrangements, she did not develop special skills outside of marketing.

Amy does not regret moving to Canada, but made it very clear that the transition has been difficult. Amy landed in Canada in 2005. She knew no one in Canada, except for a classmate who lived in Saskatchewan. She had \$2,000 when she arrived. When she came to Canada, she expected to find a job in customer service and sales. Amy feels she has the right personality, and does not get stressed if she has a difficult customer. However, when she had an interview with a department store to work as a customer service agent, it became obvious that her English was not good enough. Amy came to understand that she would not be able to get a job in customer service in Canada.

Amy joined a government-funded job-finding club on arrival. The club used the standard model of two-week’s training plus a caseworker. It helped her with key elements of resume preparation; Canadian resumes emphasize experience, but “since they don’t recognize our experience, it doesn’t matter too much.” Amy called her case manager once after she got her first temporary job. She thinks that the case manager was pleased because “they need a record”, but this was the last contact she had.

Amy has had two employers since coming to Canada in 2006. She was with the first employer for almost six years, and has now been with the new employer for about six months. She found the first job through events arising from the theft of her laptop at the airport on the day she arrived. As she needed to replace her laptop in order to continue searching online for work, she purchased a second-hand computer from another Chinese immigrant, located via a newspaper advertisement. This person worked at an athletic manufacturing company and told her that the company was looking for workers.

Her first job started in early 2006 as a three-month temporary position on minimum wage. The position was quality control: she would open imported items and use a data entry sheet to confirm that everything was correct. There were no skills required for this job beyond basic literacy. Her supervisor noted that she was good at her job, and she also helped fix a database glitch. This job allowed her to work on her English skills. When the data entry person left suddenly towards the end of her initial three-month term, she was offered the full-time position. Amy held various positions and was promoted. After promotion to team leader in her second year, she moved to inventory control. Amy held this position for four years. Benefits included a company-funded three-year course in Operations Management. In mid-2011 she became Certified in Production and Inventory Management (CPIM) after passing the required exams.

Amy was now ready to start looking for other jobs. Before this, she had not applied for any other jobs after she started

working for the athletic manufacturing company because she was not confident enough in her skills and English proficiency to pursue a customer service job, which is her preferred work: “When I came to Canada I had lots of confidence, but after six months I was very disappointed, my confidence was down. After three or four years my confidence started to come back.” Some people have given her help and advice, but in general she has not built much of a social network: she has a few friends, but no church, club or associational involvement. She is too busy with work and school – it takes her three times as long to read anything compared to an English-speaker.

So Amy started her job search in 2011, but there were limited job opportunities she could apply for. She sent out resumes and also listed her qualifications on LinkedIn, securing four interviews related to inventory control. Manufacturer A was looking at hiring a purchaser in the aircraft industry. The firm had made expansion plans in China. Despite a good interview, the firm decided to give the job to another candidate who was more familiar with the industry. The firm gave her the impression that they were apologetic for not hiring her. The interview with Manufacturer B did not go well and was not pursued further by the employer. With Logistics Company A, she advanced to the second interview, and the company even flew someone out from Toronto to interview her. But her chances were dashed when the company suddenly decided to hold back on the recruitment to see how they would re-organise.

Another position with Logistics Company B was not advertised publicly (as far as she knows). An employment agency identified her via her LinkedIn site and contacted her. They first interviewed her, and then invited her to apply for the position. This led to her current position where she has worked for the past six months. In her new position, Amy earns \$45,000, almost double her previous earnings. She feels she was successful with this position because her CPIM qualification was essential. Further it matched her previous experience in inventory control. In addition, the facility was only eight months old and she is their first inventory control employee. This facility has fewer than ten people in the office and about forty in the warehouse. Half of the warehouse workers are permanent, whilst the remainder are hired from labour agencies. The people who come from the labour agency are different every day; as long as they have certificates, the company does not care, even though these workers are less efficient. Amy is working hard to improve warehouse management and operations.

5.3.2 Joe (warehousing)

Joe is a 50-year-old immigrant from China. He has a Bachelor of Arts and seven years administrative experience in a warehouse in China. By the time he left this job, he had been promoted to become a supervisor of thirty people. He then pursued a job in city hall, a position he held for eight years. Joe is married; his wife worked in the import-export industry in China. They decided to immigrate to Canada to establish a similar business. They immigrated in the early 2000s; Joe came first, and two years later was followed by his family. While Joe was alone in Canada he used his Chinese connections to find temporary jobs and volunteer positions. He was supported by his wife, and he used this time to move around different places in Canada. Joe found his first full-time Canadian job in 2003 in a Chinese-managed organic products warehouse in Toronto. This job included shipping and delivery, and he could communicate in Chinese with people. He was in this job for four years before coming back to Vancouver.

They finally decided to reside in Vancouver in 2007 because of its weather, and also its shorter distance from China. Joe and his wife established the import-export business, but he continued to seek more stable work to support the family. After moving to Vancouver, he found a job in a winter sports equipment production and repair company via an internet search. This job lasted until February 2008, because it was a seasonal job. He was paid \$10 per hour. Unlike many other colleagues in this company who applied for Employment Insurance as they had worked enough hours, Joe moved on to another job after being laid-off at the end of the season. His boss had suggested he apply for a job in Surrey, because he wanted Joe to come back for the next winter season, and because he and Joe had become friends. He was recruited by a small company in Surrey as a forklift driver and warehouse worker.

Having experience in warehousing, Joe and his new boss came to conflict regarding the practices, rules, and policies for warehouse work. While Joe had more experience in warehousing and was concerned about safety issues, his boss, who was young and only had experience with small businesses, would not accept his advice with regard to safety. After this disagreement he was fired. At that time, this company had three employees (including him). He re-joined this company at the request of the boss in November 2008 and was there until 2011. While he was out of the above-

described position, Joe found a new job in a Chinese-owned and -managed warehouse in Richmond after searching for one week. This company had three full-time employees and one part-time employee. He was happy to leave this job when the opportunity to return to his former position in Surrey arose; in Richmond, he was expected to drive a gas-fueled forklift in a small warehouse. His pay was about \$13 per hour in both jobs.

In 2009, Joe had the opportunity to take a forklift training course at a forklift parts and repair company and received a certificate for this job. This was paid for by the Surrey company. However, increased business at the Surrey warehouse led to changes in the organisation of the work. Specifically, they had to separate the shipping and receiving of loads. All shipping work was done in the daytime, but whatever was received during the day was just left until it could be put on the shelves at night. Joe had to work the night shift, which was not good for his health.

While he was struggling with the night job, Joe found out that a friend had the opportunity to enter the recruitment process of a large warehouse company in Vancouver. Although his friend had failed, Joe was invited to apply for this job. Although Joe heard about this job from his friend, he later found the advertisement on the internet as well. His application resulted in an interview which included questions about his experience and about the procedures, tasks, and other issues in the warehouse.

After being hired he was first sent for training in forklift driving. He received an internal certificate for forklift driving. Since his employment, he has upgraded through three of the four categories of forklift driver. This has not resulted in an increase in his pay, which is about \$16 per hour for the evening shift (3 p.m. to 12 a.m.), or \$0.50 per hour less for the day shift. Joe is not happy with this pay, given the pace of work and long hours with insufficient breaks. He argues that, for this amount of work, he should be paid \$25 per hour. Joe has found the big warehouse company climate divided between immigrants - which tend to have good relations with each other - and non-immigrants, who seem to feel that immigrants have made it harder for them in securing jobs and earning higher pay. The non-immigrants are leaving the company whilst the number of immigrants is increasing.

Although Joe is not happy with this job, he is suspending any new job change decisions pending his daughter's university plans. Joe has found that language and communication are significant barriers in this career. Joe thinks that the warehouse job is an easy job to enter for immigrants because it does not require much proficiency in communication and English. It is also a good job in regards to safety and health in comparison to factory jobs, but it is still harmful in the long term. He advises younger people to go to school instead of entering this industry.

5.3.3 Yu (warehousing)

Yu was born in 1970 in Shenzhen, China. He studied Chinese culture, and upon graduation, he worked as a park administrator for over ten years. Yu immigrated to Canada in 2007 under the skilled worker category. His wife and daughter wanted to immigrate to Canada as they had previously toured Canada in 2004 and liked the comfortable life. It seemed a good place to raise their daughter.

Yu's wife arrived to Canada first, bought a house, and arranged other matters before the whole family arrived. She had a Canadian job offer from a bank prior to landing in Canada, having worked for an international bank in China. So Yu did not have to worry about family income and finances when he landed in Canada. Hence, he did not start searching for a job immediately and, instead, devoted his time to taking care of his then ten-year-old daughter, taking her to and fetching her from school and attending to daily chores like housework. Yu also did not bother to attend any English courses after he landed, as he felt those courses were too easy for him. This was because he had some English foundation from his university days. So he just improved on his conversational English over time by himself.

After over a year, Yu started to get bored as he did not need to spend as much time taking care of his daughter, who had gotten used to the new environment and could walk to school by herself. He chanced upon an advertisement in a newspaper for a warehouse course close to his home. He felt that a warehouse job should be an "easy" job, so he decided to apply for this course. Though he had liked his previous job in China, he knew it was impossible to get a

similar job in Canada. The warehouse course was short (four months) and led to an “easy” job unlike other courses like nursing and dental assistant, which led to jobs that were too “hard” for him. Another reason for liking this course is it required him to operate machines, which he enjoys, even though he did not have any prior experience.

He had a good conversation with the course director and chatted about many things, one of which was about their favourite soccer team. They also discussed a little about the warehouse course, and Yu was accepted into the program. He seemed to meet the course eligibility requirements easily.

So Yu found himself in a class of about twenty students comprised mainly of “white” guys. There were only two other immigrants: a Chinese (lady) and an Iranian. The course included tours of four warehouses. In one of the tours to a cold warehouse company, the course director asked his students if they would like to work there. Yu indicated his interest; the other company which they had earlier visited was only offering a part-time job. In his job application, Yu felt he got help from his course, since he was taught how to re-write his resume to suit the Canadian context. For instance, he learned that it was important to include his forklift (and other) certificates obtained from the course in his resume.

Yu recalled that he had a very short interview with his prospective supervisors. The interviewers did not ask many questions; they simply told him what was required on the job, and other information like the wages and benefits. When it was his turn, Yu asked them some questions about the company, and he also conveyed that he wanted a stable job. Yu got the job. He did not know why he was selected, but he concluded that the program director played a huge role in recommending him for this job. Another possible reason he was hired was that he was the only one in his class to apply to the company. He recalled that many of his classmates did not like the cold warehouse environment. Overall, Yu seemed sure that if he had not attended the course, he would not have gotten the job.

Yu started his first Canadian job as a warehouseman in November 2008 at a starting pay of \$14.75 per hour. Today, after three years, he is making \$22 per hour. He started with order picking, but now he does the whole range of warehouse duties. Most of his colleagues are Canadian born. Of the 33 people at his workplace, there are only a few immigrant workers. There are two sections in the warehouse: one is at zero degrees Celsius, and the other is minus 18. Because the job does not need much face-to-face contact with customers, Yu does not have language communication difficulties, as he converses only with his colleagues and boss. He shared that if he were to be promoted, the next level of job designation would be a supervisor or lead hand. He feels that it is difficult for him to get promoted, since this is based on seniority. Most supervisors have over fifteen years of experience, and many fellow warehousemen already have more than ten years of experience. Even if a senior retires, Yu is still a long ‘queue’ away from replacing that senior.

Yu recounted that on the first day of work, there were two other new employees who took the same introduction tour, but they did not turn up for work on the second day. During his time in the company, there were also other warehousemen with Canadian warehousing experience who were hired, but some of them also resigned. He attributed this to the non-family oriented afternoon shift (3 p.m.-11:30 p.m.), usually given to junior workers (himself included). On a typical workday, Yu gets to see his wife in the morning and has time to fetch his daughter from school; after that, he is unlikely to meet them until the next day.

At this moment, Yu thinks he will stay in this job, unless he finds another job that is higher paying. He has not attempted to look for another job and has no intentions to do so presently. This is probably because he finds that “the job is not so difficult, you are happy with your colleagues and they are helpful, why should you leave your job?” He considers his present salary “not bad though not high”. Yu also appreciates his company’s constant emphasis on employee safety, given that warehouse work can be dangerous, even fatal. Yu thinks job postings in his company are not applied for because outsiders think warehousemen positions are not good jobs. Though he knows many of his friends will not like the warehouse job, and none has ever asked Yu to introduce him or her to his company or industry, Yu is comfortable with his job in the warehouse setting and does not view this job as a “downgrade” from his prior job.

When asked if he thinks he can find a similarly “easy” job with the same or higher pay if he were to go back to school, Yu thinks that it is possible because he has friends from China who had completed one or two years of Canadian education, obtained office jobs in IT and engineering, and are drawing higher pay. However those friends also had relevant education and career experience in an office setting in China. Without Canadian education, he will not secure a better job than what he is currently doing.

Yu thinks that his company appreciates people who stay for many years, and at present, he is likely to do so. Yu’s wife

is currently doing quite well as an accounts manager.

Overall, Yu has settled down well in Canada, and found a job he is satisfied with, without any help from relatives. He has an uncle in Canada who is a doctor, and Yu is very close to him. His uncle's wife works as a clinic assistant. This uncle had no role in helping Yu's family to immigrate and also did not play any role in Yu's employment. However, he did advise Yu to work for a company with low turnover and long serving employees, as these are good indicators of a good company.

5.3.4 Isabel (warehousing and FTA)

In 1998, Isabel obtained a Bachelor of Business Administration degree in Turkey. Thereafter, she went to England for a year to learn English and be an *au pair*. In 1999, while in England, a major earthquake killed and injured members of Isabel's family. Her brother was directly involved in dealing with the aftermath of this earthquake. Upon completing all his family duties, he applied to immigrate to Canada as he needed to escape the painful memories. Isabel's brother desperately wanted Isabel to do the same, or at least move somewhere safer. Isabel describes her relationship with her brother as very close. They have only each other as siblings.

She left England, moved back to Turkey, and started looking for a job where she could use her English skills. Specifically she looked for jobs in the import/export sector, as these were the most common opportunities in which to use her English. After three months, Isabel found a job as a Traffic Specialist with the representative of numerous American companies sourcing textiles from Turkish manufacturers. Isabel feels that her English was a very important aspect to her getting this job. Approximately two-thirds of her job involved writing in English, and communicating with customers in the United States. She was the only person in the company who could speak English. She worked for this company for over five years until she decided to leave to visit her brother in Canada.

Isabel visited Canada as a tourist in 2005 and applied for immigration during this period. This was Isabel's first time in Canada, and she spent a year in Ontario, where her brother was, as well as visiting Vancouver.

Upon returning to Turkey, through networking, Isabel obtained a position as an office manager for a medical import company. She worked at this position for seven to eight months. Isabel quit this job because she felt she did not have the qualifications to handle the marketing aspect of the position. Next, Isabel obtained the position of head of international transportation at a transportation company in Istanbul. In this company, cars would come in on boats from the east (Japan) and needed to be transferred to trucks. Again, two-thirds of her job involved the use of English. Isabel worked for approximately one year and left this position when her immigration application to Canada was accepted.

Isabel, then in her early thirties, immigrated to Vancouver in 2008. She came to Vancouver because of the weather, as Ontario, where her brother lives, is too cold. Isabel had a friend in Vancouver; however, they were not close. Upon arriving at the airport, Isabel was provided with paperwork regarding settling down, looking for a job, finding a place to live, and so on. She described this information as very helpful.

Based on the information provided at the airport, early in 2009, Isabel went to visit a case manager at an employment services agency. She was advised to attend a job search club and was given with a list of service providers. She joined the job search program and found it very helpful. The first two weeks of the program were about observing how things work in Canada, learning the importance of networking, being proactive in speaking to key persons in a company, and how to make calls or visits to companies. Isabel described this process as very different to how things worked in Turkey. In Turkey if you call up a company owner, they will never speak to you. Isabel had informational interviews with about six different companies. These interviews were all with owners, either those in higher positions or management. They all gave her advice and provided her with different associations and names to look into.

At the job search club, she was told to send an e-mail to everyone she knew in the world saying that she had moved to Vancouver and was looking for job/contacts in Vancouver, Canada. Isabel did this. One of the people she emailed knew someone in a company in Vancouver and forwarded her resume. Isabel received a call from the Vancouver warehouse to which her friend had forwarded her resume. They were looking for a logistics coordinator. Isabel had

two interviews; they liked her background and she liked their approach. She attributes her success in this interview to three things: the head office of the company is in Turkey; her experience and background suited the position (combining knowledge of import/export operations and the procedures for different countries); and, the lucky timing of events.

In her first position she coordinated shipping within Canada and to the US. She was also responsible for handling shipment and logistics needs of the company's retail stores. Shipments are received weekly via air from Turkey. This position is an office job, though her office is located within a warehouse. The warehouse has nine full-time employees. Six are men, and three are women. Most of the people that work in the warehouse are immigrants. No other full-time employees were from Turkey; rather they are Chinese, Vietnamese, and Iranian. When the warehouse requires additional assistance, they hire six to seven part-time workers in addition to the full timers. This hiring is done through word of mouth not hiring agencies.

In June 2010, after a year and a half of working as a Logistics Coordinator Isabel was promoted to Warehouse Manager. With this promotion she still has her duties as a logistics coordinator. The promotion came over time, since Isabel had gotten more efficient with the logistics coordinator position; thus, she had time available. There is a 50/50 split between the duties of these two positions, and she explained that there is a very distinct separation between the two positions. One is office-bound; the other requires her to walk around the warehouse. However, Isabel explained how they were interconnected. Her Warehouse Manager duties include organizing the distribution of work, prioritizing work, evaluating employees, and determining how to make things better.

Isabel likes the job but she finds the job physically tiring due to the walking. She is unsure if she wants to continue working in the import/export, warehousing and logistics industry. However, she feels she has to because this is where her background, experience, and education are focused. Isabel discussed the idea of going back to school. She said she would love to study psychology and, more specifically, personal development subjects, but currently she does not have the economic resources for this.

5.4 Freight Transport Arrangement (FTA)

The FTA subsector describes those who act as intermediaries between shippers (cargo owners) and carriers (of all modes), including freight forwarders, marine shipping agents, and customs brokers. This is a highly urbanized and rapidly growing segment of the port-logistics industry. FTA companies organize the provision of transportation services to companies that need to import or export goods, or move goods within a country. The industry is currently undergoing rapid change with the emergence of third- and fourth-party logistics providers. Third-party logistics providers are usually outgrowths of freight forwarders that have expanded their range of services (such as transportation, warehousing, inventory management, etc.) to shippers by partnering with air and ocean carriers, trucking, and rail services. Fourth-party logistics providers are the latest business model providing comprehensive supply chain solutions, including consulting advice and information technology.

Freight forwarder, customs brokerage, and warehousing recruit people through a variety of channels, including headhunters, company and job search websites, or referrals. Membership in an industry association (such as the Purchasing Management Association of Canada or the Supply Chain and Logistics Association Canada) and/or industry certification (such as the Inter-

national Trade and Transportation Logistics Certificate, the CIFFA freight forwarding program or the Certified Customs Specialist Course) is widely used to signal employability. Courses are offered in the BC Lower Mainland by Brighton College, the British Columbia Institute of Technology (BCIT), and Vancouver Career College.

These characteristics of the FTA subsector suggest that qualifications and formal hiring channels would play a decisive role in pathways to employment. Our interviews revealed that formal recruitment channels are indeed widely used. However, this raises the possibility that, as in other sectors, the pre-immigration skills and experience of some immigrants may not be recognised. This would explain why immigrants in the FTA subsector are better educated than non-immigrants, but are concentrated in administrative occupations. John thinks that his previous experience was not explicitly recognised when he was hired, but clearly his employer has benefited from his functional abilities; he is performing increasingly complex analytical tasks without additional compensation.

The immigrant services agencies reported that their advice- and mentorship-based programs were somewhat appropriate for immigrants with skills and experiences in the FTA subsector. Programs such as Skills Connect provide soft skills courses to help immigrants acculturate in the Canadian workplace, mentorships, and job search assistance. However, they also reported that they advised immigrants seeking these positions to be willing instead to take ‘transitional’ positions in order to secure Canadian experience.

Education is by no means the only consideration in hiring in the FTA subsector. Our interviews indicate that jobs in the FTA subsector require other industry or sector-specific knowledge. It makes more sense to speak of a ‘logistics worker in...’ the resource, forestry, retailing, or manufacturing sector than of a ‘logistics worker’ per se. Sam, an immigrant who is still seeking a position in FTA, told us that he was the losing finalist for a production coordination and scheduling position because it was felt the other finalist had performed better on the ‘behavioural’ aspects of the job. We take this to mean that such positions require both technical (general) and interpersonal (specific) competencies that favour both non-immigrant and internal candidates when it comes to hiring.

For some FTA positions, the additional ‘job-specific’ attributes that are required may actually favour immigrants. For example, Sally’s story highlights the importance of being Mandarin-speaking in the freight-forwarding industry; she mentioned this in relation to two jobs. However, she still attributes her ability to secure employment in Canada in the sector to her local certification. Isabel’s job in a FTA came about because of her international connections: a friend back home passed her resume to a firm with a facility in Vancouver.

5.4.1 John (FTA)

John obtained a Bachelor of Civil Engineering in the Philippines and worked for a terminal operating firm. For the first five years John did operational and vessel checks, and he was then moved into a supervising position where he handled fifteen branches. Next, he moved into sales, market, and logistics research. For this position, John received some additional sales training. He held this position for fourteen years. The positions John held with this terminal operating firm were all unionized.

In total, John came to Canada with nineteen years of experience in shipping, logistics, container operations, and warehousing. John left the Philippines after his wife died and also because of the political situation. He was seeking a country with peace and order, as well as a place that could provide a future for his children. At the time of immigration, John was comfortable in the Philippines. He had a good job, and thus, seeking employment opportunities did not fuel his decision to immigrate.

John immigrated to Vancouver, Canada in 2010. He and his two children stayed at the home of his deceased wife's first cousin. One week after moving here, John started looking for a job in port logistics. John sent many applications online, including the Port Authority and major terminal operating firms; however, he received no response. John did not know anyone within this industry in Vancouver.

One month after being in Vancouver, a friend of John's helped him get a transitional job as a banquet server at a major hotel. This friend was a colleague that he used to work with in the Philippines. She had worked in the tourism industry in the Philippines and knew John from arranging port/cruise tours. She had immigrated to Vancouver three years before John. John applied online for the banquet server position, received a phone call, had an interview, and was offered the job. John had no previous experience in being a banquet server or working in the hotel industry. In this position, John made \$12.50 an hour. This job was good for John, as it allowed him to practice his English. After six months of work, John started to get bored and began applying for jobs again now that he had "Canadian experience."

After John quit his hotel job, he saw an advertisement in the newspaper for a program at a college that helps immigrants find employment. John began this program, which helped him with preparing resumes, interviews, and the job search. John used search engines provided by the program; he started looking for port logistics jobs, first, and then refined the search to logistics jobs. During this time John applied for many jobs.

One of the jobs he applied for online was with an environmental services firm. This was the first company to respond to his application since the hotel job. John had a telephone interview followed two weeks later by an in-person interview with the facility manager. During the interview John was asked questions about his logistics sector experience, including: knowledge of customs procedures; documentation related to shipment of cargo; information on environment protection agencies; and about Environment Canada. John had researched responses to such questions prior to the interview and was fully aware that the rules were different in Canada than the Philippines.

John was hired in 2011. The firm's head office is in the United States, and there are approximately 4,000 employees in North America with approximately twenty employees in the office where John works. This company handles waste and chemical management, disposal, and maintenance. The operation has four company drivers; the rest are hired through contracts. John does not think his company employs any immigrant drivers.

John's position is a facility shipping coordinator. His job responsibilities include handling outbound shipments, as well as dispatching, scheduling, planning, and supervision. More recently John has been given financial analysis tasks. This was not a part of his original job position; however, management saw that he had this skill. The company has offered John opportunities to upgrade his skills in health and safety as well as environmental management. John is interested in these opportunities.

John likes his job and has had no problems while working here. John admits that this work is not directly related to his past experience. Furthermore, his past education is not really related to the job. John does not find this job difficult, and he enjoys new opportunities, such as when his employer increasingly asks him to use his analytical skills. John makes close to \$20 an hour (\$40,000 annually), and he gets performance increases each year. John feels the strengths he brings to this job are his past experience. However, his language difficulties remain his weakness.

John does not foresee opportunities for upward advancement with his current employer. He said he would probably begin looking for a new job in a year or so, as by this point his current job will begin to get boring. He thinks that his experiences with this job will help him get a port job closer to his previous experience, and that the biggest barrier has been his lack of Canadian experience, which he is starting to overcome. Ultimately, John hopes to increase his salary.

5.4.2 Sally (FTA)

Sally is a 45-year-old Chinese immigrant. Sally's first job was with an import/export company where she was hired for a shipping and freight forwarding position to prepare documents for customs, such as letter of credits, and booking for shipping. After three years, she moved to the glassware department to work in a marketing and sales position. Sally had the chance to connect with many people in this position by participating in trade shows all across China. She enjoyed this job very much and stayed in this position for five years until she immigrated to Canada in 1995.

Sally immigrated to Canada, following her then-husband. Her first attempt to find a job in Canada was through an immigrant services agency. Sally was shocked to learn about the differences between finding a job in China and Canada. She was asked if she had a resume, but she did not know what a resume was at that time. The free job search program was very useful for her, as it explained culture, laws, employment standards, resumes, interviews and so on. Her case manager had weekend get-togethers, which helped her to improve her English-speaking and listening skills. She also made some Canadian friends this way, and joined a "Host program" which matched immigrants with a Canadian family. The family took her hiking and shopping, taught her where to find the "good deals," and assisted her in typing her resume, practicing for interviews, and even driving her to interview appointments. During this period, she also tried, without success, to find a job through some contacts she had from her prior work. Sally's husband was not comfortable with her new friends, and their marriage ended because of their increasingly separate lives. Separation forced Sally to put more energy into finding work. She remembers going for at least twenty interviews during this time. Sally attributes her lack of success to needing Canadian experience.

She finally found a job in a growing electronic store. She found out about this position through a newspaper advertisement. After two interviews, she was hired as a salesperson. Although Sally thought she had the skills for this position, she found communicating with customers very difficult. The company's human resources recognised Sally's potential and her problems and after two weeks suggested moving her to the warehouse department. Sally kept her job in the warehouse department for three years, and she received \$30,000 annually with some bonuses, life, and dental insurance. She describes this as good pay and an 'okay' job. Aside from some attempts in the first few months in her three-year career to find a job in shipping and freight forwarding (which she would have liked), thoughts about changing her job faded away thereafter.

As Sally's life became more established with this job, she started thinking of taking courses to improve her education. With the advice of her church friends, Sally entered an accounting program in BCIT. But soon she learned that, despite being good with numbers, she was not suited to accounting. The positive side of enrollment in BCIT was that she learned about an International Freight Forwarding Program. She enrolled for this program and attended classes after work. Sally enjoyed this course, because she was in contact with people working in the freight forwarding sector, and she was updating and Canadianizing her knowledge. This course included import/export logistics, documentation preparation, and ended with her obtaining certification recognised by the Canadian International Freight Forwarder's Association (CIFFA).

After completing the program, Sally decided to go on EI and started looking for freight forwarding jobs. She also became a Canadian citizen in 1999. After a vacation in China, her job search turned into some invitations to interviews, but none ended in recruitment. Sally found that her inability to use software (specific industry software as well as Word and Excel) played a central role in her failure. She decided to go back to school again to improve her office and computer skills.

Subsequently, she found a freight forwarding job through a job bank. She was invited to an interview, part of which was conducted in Mandarin. Sally found that everyone in the company either spoke Mandarin or Cantonese and that her Mandarin skills had an important role in her recruitment. Her duties in this company were twofold: arranging

shipping (to/from China) and assistance work for the manager. Her boss was very demanding and moody, and so she soon quit this job.

Sally's personal life took a turn while she was off work this time. She remarried and gave birth to a son. When her son was old enough to be sent to day care, Sally took a course at a local university on Employment Education Access for Women. This program was free and only for women, and it included some social and computer skills courses, as well as an assessment to determine what kinds of jobs one would be good at and enjoy. Sally learned that she was a people-person and that an accounting job was not for her. Sally applied for numerous jobs during this time period and had at least one unsuccessful interview with a freight transport company before responding to a newspaper advertisement that resulted in a job offer. Sally attributes her success at this position to her CIFFA certification from the BCIT program.

Sally's new job was with a customs broker based in Vancouver. Her duty was shipment coordination and, while most of the duties were conducted in English, often Mandarin-speaking customers were referred to her. Sally described this position and company as very busy. She was paid \$13 per hour, and she worked full-time. Sally was fired in the middle of 2010 for what she described as standing up against discrimination towards her and her ethnicity. She is still searching for a permanent job and has attended an immigrant services agency to refresh her skills.

5.4.3 Sam (call centre worker)

Sam is presently 43 years old. He was born in a small Indian ocean country and studied sanitary science at university. After graduation, he worked in waste water treatment. He did not like this career path so he went back to university and took a second degree, a BSc in textile technology. This degree covered comprehensively all of the supply chains of the textile industry beginning from farms to production, marketing, sales and "logistics". After graduation, he joined a textile mill as a production technician (for three years) and then as a woollen industry research and development technician (for two years).

Then in 2000, through networking and a friend's help, he moved to a well-established international sportswear company. This move was not a pay decision; it was for a better career opportunity. In his first seven years, as production coordinator, he handled production and logistics. His last three years were mainly in supply chain and logistics, taking orders from customers from France, negotiating suppliers on production capacity and prices and delivery time, and planning all the production. The company subcontracted to a freight forwarder company and worked with shipping lines. The company also worked with many forwarders, but the main transportation was done in-house, and Sam had to handle issues with the forwarders. Exports were sent to BRIC countries and France. He worked for this company for eleven years until he left for Canada.

Sam thought of immigrating to Canada ten years ago, but he and his wife only took action three years ago. He immigrated to gain experience away from the small island of his birth. This was despite having a good job and life. He also immigrated for religious reasons: he is Hindu, his wife is Muslim, and this caused difficulties at home.

Sam's immigration was assisted by his French-language ability. He landed in Montreal, but moved to Vancouver the following day; a friend advised him that the weather is not as cold as other places in Canada. Sam settled down in Vancouver in 2011. Through a friend, he was introduced to Immigrant Services Society of BC (ISSBC) soon after arrival. He started attending workshops on resume writing, interview skills, business English, and soft skills. He improved his resume writing and learned about job opportunities, labour market research, self-promotion, informational interviews and other soft skills in Canada. He searched for jobs primarily through web-based job sites like Craigslist, Monster, and Indeed.ca. He sent fifty to sixty resumes that resulted in about ten interviews, some on the phone, and others in person.

Sam came close to securing a position with a sportswear company. The company has about 400 employees in Canada and probably 100 in Vancouver with a small manufacturing facility focused on design. Their suppliers are mostly in Asia. There were two job positions which he applied for in this company; bi-lingual customer service and production coordinator. He lost out on the former position, because the other finalist for the position was more familiar with the customers, sector, and products and had done a lot of outdoor activity, which was in line with the company's products.

For this position, he had a thirty-minute phone interview and a one-hour in-person interview.

For the production coordinator position, he was interviewed and tested for two and a half hours, including having a meeting with most of the team to see how he would get along with them. This job involves co-ordinating between the buying and design department and ensuring that the production is done according to customer-approved sample. There is some scheduling work, but it does not form the core functions. Again, Sam lost out to the other finalist for the job. The company's feedback to him was that the other applicant performed better for the behavioural interview and textile sample assessment, though Sam was better at planning and scheduling. He was told to continue searching.

Sam focused his job search in the textile and related industry, as he wanted to concentrate his energy and time on companies or jobs that related to his field of experience. Though ISS advised him to open up his options by applying for logistics jobs in different sectors, his attempts did not receive any responses. He felt that not knowing anyone in the logistics industry in Vancouver, combined with his lack of Canadian experience, precluded him from job opportunities.

Sam is currently working as a bilingual customer survey officer at a call centre for a market research company that sought people with bilingual (English and French) expertise. This job was introduced by an ISSBC Job developer. He was offered the job very easily and started working there in late 2011. He works about 150 hours per month, calling customers to seek their feedback on cell phone repair services provided by two telecommunications companies. He is paid \$11.50 per hour and \$5 more per hour for French interviews. He earns roughly \$1,500 to \$1,600 per month. He is not seeking any career advancement in this job.

This job has helped him to improve his verbal communication skills – he is acquiring a North American accent - and recently the company tasked him with another portfolio to conduct research interviews. The job helps him pay his bills and gain Canadian work experience, and he will not leave this job until he finds another one that is related to his prior work experience.

Sam is currently toying with the idea of furthering his education in the field of supply chain management, as he believes that education in Canada is crucial to landing jobs. He is not keen to get his credentials evaluated here, as he thinks it will not help him get jobs. His friends also advised him that he has to go back to school. He feels that the logistics sector could be a good career path, and he is keen, but he feels he has not been successful with logistics jobs partly because he does not have sufficient knowledge of customs laws in Canada. Also, although he has knowledge of SAP and some logistics work experience, he does not have a certificate or diploma in logistics.

He has learned the following from his job search outcomes: 90% of his interviews were from Craigslist postings, and none came through direct contact, networking, and job fairs; and, his closest successes were in the textile industry. He feels that since his expertise in planning and scheduling are transferrable skills, he wants to widen his job search to include the food retail industry. This is especially since the textile industry in Vancouver is small. He also intends to attend more seminars (based on advice from a family friend) to broaden his industry knowledge. At present, he is going through the company listing of BC manufacturers and exporters found on the website to broaden his search.

5.4.4 Mary (work-seeker)

Mary is 34 years old. She was born in Egypt where she obtained a Bachelor of Arts degree from a university she described as one of the world's top 200 universities. Her major was English Language and Translation. Outside of her degree, Mary also has a diploma in International Transport and Logistics.

Mary worked at a maritime research consultancy in Egypt for twelve years. She described her employer as the leading maritime engineering and project management consultant in the Middle East. The company had outstanding experience in port infrastructure development to promote the maritime industry in Egypt, the Middle East, and Africa. Here she held positions of increased responsibility. She participated in the preparation of numerous tender documents for the construction of new ports, rehabilitation of existing terminals and berths, port infrastructure development, mobili-

zation of stevedoring equipment, and terms of references for container terminal operation.

Mary also took a training course in quality management systems provided by the Norwegian vessel classification society, DNV. With this certification, Mary became an internal quality auditor. Through this position she participated in the preparation of documents related to the system of quality. This position also included a number of administrative duties such as formatting and editing reports, plotting and applying minor corrections required on engineering drawings, and submitting monthly reports.

Mary immigrated to Canada in early 2011 with her husband and three children. She chose to immigrate to Vancouver because she thought it would be the most convenient place due to its good weather for her children, and because it is a huge port area. The fact that Vancouver was a port city interested Mary, because she had hoped she could find a job in the area where she had past employment experience. However, she has no friends, relatives, or even acquaintances in Vancouver.

Mary is currently not working. She has looked for work for several months without success. She applied for all types of postings and also to the marine companies but received no response. Mary thinks the main reason why she is unable to find employment is that she does not have any experience in Canada. This is what everyone says to her. She also noted that language skills could be another factor contributing to her lack of success, as she comes from Egypt where English is not spoken as a first language. Mary also does not have any educational certificates from Canada.

Mary has been to two employment resources centres. She spoke to case managers and employment counsellors and discussed her current situation; however she did not tap their resources. Both agencies advised her to broaden her job search areas and make it more generic; they regard it as difficult to break into the maritime industry.

Mary hopes to work in an administrative job in the maritime industry. She hopes to prove her skills, knowledge, and capabilities in this field and plans to achieve these goals by continuing to send her resume to the marine companies until she finds a good opportunity. She also plans to take some training courses such as the one she is beginning now (in public relations). When Mary finds a job, she plans to “work hard, work smart, listen, and learn from others whom are experts in the field”.

6 Conclusions

Table 5 summarizes the key dimensions of the supply, demand, and intermediation identified as relevant to each of the four subsectors of the port-logistics sector in Greater Vancouver, as well as summarising the pathways and outcomes identified. No single factor – supply, demand, or intermediation – can alone provide an adequate account of the observed patterns of immigrant employment. Rather, we have found it useful to focus on the interaction of these factors, and how they have played out over time in one place.

Immigrants to the Vancouver area have found it easier to enter some subsectors of the port-logistics labour market than others. All across the port-logistics sector, employment relations and hiring practices are shaped by the variable demand for transportation services and the employer’s desire for flexibility in employment. In the port and warehousing subsectors, the resulting formal and informal social regulation related to union seniority and strong social ties make it difficult for many immigrants to gain a sufficient foothold in these subsectors. There are, however, indications that this is changing in the warehousing subsector. Parts of this growing sector may be becoming immigrant employment niches at the same time that working conditions

in the sector appear to be deteriorating for non-immigrants.

Immigrant labour market outcomes lag behind those of non-immigrants in the two sub-sectors in which they have captured a greater share of employment, trucking and FTA. The trucking subsector labour market now resembles an immigrant niche, with many of the negative connotations associated with the term. This observation should not, however, detract from the considerable financial and personal investments made by those immigrants who have succeeded in this sector. The FTA subsector resembles more closely other advanced service sectors of the economy in which a combination of formal education and relatively specialized experience is required to secure employment. However, finding employment in the FTA subsector also depends on specific knowledge of markets, commodities, languages, and workplace cultures. Sometimes this works in the favour of immigrants, sometimes it works against them.

We also interviewed some immigrants who are still trying to enter the port-logistics industry. Mary and Sam's stories (and those of others we spoke to or heard about from immigrant services agencies) suggest that immigrants seeking work in the port-logistics sector face some of the same challenges as immigrants of all backgrounds in Canada; that their skills and experience are devalued, and that their lack of Canadian experience and networks traps them in a vicious cycle of no Canadian experience and professional contacts.

In the life-work stories presented above, we decided to include some, though by no means all, of the details of the lives of the immigrants we interviewed. This was a conscious choice, because it is important to understand how immigration and job-search are tied up with life events such as marriage, divorce, the birth of a child or their graduation, a serious injury, and the desire to be with family. These may be regarded as supply side factors and, indeed, one surprising finding of this research is that family circumstances seem to play a more prominent role in the pathways to employment of those we interviewed than formal education. But, we hope that these details also convey the humanity and aspirations of the respondents who so generously shared their stories with us.

Table 5 Immigrant labour market pathways and outcomes in port-logistics subsectors

		Port	Truck	Warehouse	FTA
Overall employment growth, 1991-2006		Declining	Declining or flat	Growing	Growing
Immigrants share of employment, 1991-2006		Flat	Growing	Flat	Growing
Demand		Numerical flexibility achieved through common labour pool in response to irregular demand (seasonal, weekly rotations, etc.); both skilled and unskilled jobs.	Flexibility through contracting out; demand for general skills with low entry barriers, though more regulated since 2000s.	Numerical, work time (irregular shifts) and contracting out flexibility; some increasing demand for IT skills and cross-training.	Combination of general trade and documentation skills, and knowledge of specific markets and/or commodities.
Supply		Union membership, internal training, and trade apprenticeships.	Requires truck ownership and licence, and permit for port-terminal moves.	Required basic certification (forklift driving, WHMIS, first aid).	Specialized certification or professional affiliation often required.
Pathways	Employer Recruitment Strategies	Periodic entry followed by long period to establish seniority. Easier recruitment and establishment of seniority for some skilled trades.	Relatively easy entry to those with requisite assets (licence, record, tutelage, truck for owner-operators).	Ongoing formal and informal recruitment, with minimum entry requirements.	Ongoing use of formal and internal ladder recruitment channels; high degree of specific skill match required.
	Role of Social Networks	Strong ties (sons, relatives).	Strong (family resources) and Weak (routes, repairs) ties.	Some indications of weak ties in job information, group hiring.	Relatively little indication of social networks in search.
	Role of intermediaries and training organizations	Minimal.	Minimal.	Provision of minimum entry requirement training.	Some job search assistance for immigrants with skills and experience.
Outcomes	Immigrant earnings gap	Small gap: average non-immigrant earnings overtook immigrants.	Large gap: immigrant earnings declined more than non-immigrants.	Small gap: declining earnings of non-immigrants converged with immigrant earnings.	Large gap: immigrant earnings growth lagged behind non-immigrant growth.
	Evidence of ethnic niches?	British/European immigrants retiring, replaced by more diverse, younger immigrants.	Three-fifths of immigrants of South Asian origin	Recent rapid recruitment of immigrants, visible minorities.	Three-fifths of immigrants of East Asian origin.
	Evidence of occupational segmentation?	Few differences between immigrant and non-immigrant occupation profile.	Immigrants over-represented in transport /manual occupations.	Immigrants slightly over-represented in transport / manual occupations.	Immigrants over-represented in management and administration.

References

- Atkinson, J. 1985. The changing corporation. In *New patterns of work*. Edited by D. Clutterbuck. Aldershot: Gower.
- Aydemir, A., and M. Skuterud. 2005. Explaining the Deteriorating Entry Earnings of Canada's Immigrant Cohorts, 1966-2000. *Canadian Journal of Economics* 38 (2):641-72.
- Bauder, H. 2003. 'Brain Abuse', or the Devaluation of Immigrant Labour in Canada. *Antipode* 35(4):619-717.
- . 2005. Habitus, Rules of the Labour Market and Employment Strategies of Immigrants in Vancouver, Canada. *Social and Cultural Geography* 6(1): 81-97.
- BCMEA, 2010. *Annual Report, 2010*. Vancouver: BC Maritime Employer's Association. Retrieved from: http://www.bcmea.com/pdfs/annual_report_2010.pdf Annual Report.
- BC Statistics, 2012. *Business Counts and Employment by Industry: British Columbia by Detailed NAICS Industry*. Victoria: BCStats. <http://www.bcstats.gov.bc.ca/StatisticsBySubject/BusinessIndustry/BusinessCountsEmploymentByIndustry.aspx>
- Behl, C. 2013. Personal communication.
- Bonacich, E, and J. B. Wilson. 2008. *Getting the Goods: Ports, Labor, and the Logistics Revolution*. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press.
- British Columbia and Canada, 2006. *Pacific Gateway Strategy Action Plan*. Victoria: Industry Advisory Group, Department of Transport, Province of British Columbia.
- Chiswick, B. R., and P. W. Miller. 2000. *The Complementarity of Language and Other Human Capital: Immigrant Earnings in Canada*. Vancouver: Research on Immigration and Integration in the Metropolis, Working Paper Series No. 00-08.

- Ellis, M, R. Wright, and V. Parks. 2007. Geography and the Immigrant Division of Labor. *Economic Geography* 83(3): 255-281.
- Ferrer, A., D. Green, and W.C. Riddell. 2006. The Effect of Literacy on Immigrant Earnings. *Journal of Human Resources* 41(Spring):380-410.
- Gill, H.S. 2012. Masculinity, Mobility and Transformation in Punjabi Cinema: From Putt Jattan De (Sons of Jat Farmers) to Munde UK De (Boys of UK). *South Asian Popular Culture* 10(2):109-122.
- Graham, S., and S. Marvin. 2001 *Splintering Urbanism: Networked Infrastructures, Technological Mobilities and the Urban Condition*, London, New York: Routledge.
- Granovetter, M. 1973. The Strength of Weak Ties, *American Journal of Sociology* 78(6): 1360-1380.
- . 1974. *Getting a Job: A Study of Contacts and Careers*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press
- Guo, S., and D.J. DeVoretz. 2005. *Chinese Immigrants in Vancouver: Quo Vadis?* Vancouver: Research on Immigration and Integration in the Metropolis, Working Paper Series No. 05-20.
- Hall, P.V., and A. J. Khan. 2008. Differences in Hi-Tech and Native-Born Immigrant Wages and Earnings across Canadian Cities. *The Canadian Geographer* 52(3): 271-290.
- Hall, P V. 2009. Container Ports, Local Benefits and Transportation Worker Earnings. *GeoJournal* 74: 67–83.
- Hall, P. V., and A. Clark. 2010. Maritime Ports and the Politics of Reconnection. In *Transforming Urban Waterfronts: Fixity and Flow*, edited by G. Desfor, J. Laidley, D. Schubert, and Q. Stevens, 17-34 Abingdon: Routledge.

Hall, P.V., and T. Sadouzai. 2010. The Value of 'Experience' and the Labour Market Entry of New Immigrants to Canada. *Canadian Public Policy* 36(2):181-198.

Herod, A. 2001. *Labor Geographies*. New York: Guilford Press.

Hesse, M. 2008. *The City as a Terminal. The Urban Context of Logistics and Freight Distribution*. Aldershot: Ashgate.

Hiebert, D. 1999. Local Geographies of Labor Market Segmentation: Montréal, Toronto, and Vancouver, 1991. *Economic Geography* 75: 4: 339–369.

———. 2000. *The Social Geography of Immigration and Urbanization in Canada: A Review and Interpretation*. Research on Immigration and Integration in the Metropolis (RIIM), Working Paper #00-12.

Hiebert, D., and R. Pendakur. 2003. *Who's Cooking? The Changing Ethnic Division of Labour in Canada*. Vancouver: Research on Immigration and Integration in the Metropolis, Working Paper Series No. 03-09.

Holmes, J. 1997. In Search of Competitive Efficiency: Labour Process Flexibility in Canadian Newsprint Mills. *Canadian Geographer* 41(1): 7-25.

HRSDC, 2012. *Temporary Foreign Worker Program, Labour Market Opinion Statistics, Annual Statistics 2008-2011*. Ottawa: Human Resources and Skills Development Canada

http://www.hrsdc.gc.ca/eng/workplaceskills/foreign_workers/stats/annual/table5aa.shtml.

Iskander, N., C. Riordan, and N. Lowe. 2012. Learning in Place: Immigrants' Spatial and Temporal Strategies for Occupational Advancement. *Economic Geography*.

Mata, F., and R. Pendakur. 1999. *Where do Immigrants Work? Tracking Industrial Location Propensities of 1960's Immigrants*. Vancouver: Research on Immigration and Integration in the

Metropolis, Working Paper Series No. 99-13

Matthews, R., R. Pendakur, and N. Young. 2009. Social Capital, Labour Markets, and Job-Finding in Urban and Rural Regions: Comparing Paths to Employment in Prosperous Cities and Stressed Rural Communities in Canada. *Sociological Review* 57(2): 306-330.

Peck, J. 1996. *Work-Place: The Social Regulation of Labor Markets*. London: Guildford.

Peoples, J., and W. K. Talley. 2004. Owner-Operator Truck Driver Earnings and Employment: Port Cities and Deregulation. In *Transportation Labor Issues and Regulatory Reform*, edited by J. Peoples and W. K. Talley. *Research in Transportation Economics vol 10*. Elsevier: Amsterdam.

Talley, W. K. 2004. Wage Differentials of Intermodal Transportation Carriers and Ports: Deregulation Versus Regulation. *Review of Network Economics* 3(2): 207-227.

Appendix A

Methods

This research was conducted by a team consisting of the Principal Investigator plus three graduate research assistants (GRA). Two of the GRAs were foreign male students; this seems to have helped a lot with on-site recruitment. The third was a female Canadian national with experience in government programming. We began by profiling the four subsectors using secondary sources and our knowledge of the port-logistics industry. From this we identified agencies and organizations which we could assume played a role in shaping the pathways into the sector and which might also be able to assist with recruiting immigrants to interview. We also developed a series of hypothetical pathways to employment as a step towards developing the interview guide.

The review of secondary sources included review of programs (federal, provincial) designed to assist work-seekers with employment search. Some of these programs are specifically designed for immigrants, but many are generally available to all. However, many programs that were available for all were offered via agencies focused on immigrants, hence they were customized to meet the specific needs of this target population. Other documents reviewed included contracts, position papers, annual reports, and other documents prepared by the employers (e.g., BCMEA); unions (e.g., ILWU, VCTA-CAW); and governmental and quasi-governmental organizations (e.g., the Asia-Pacific Gateway Skills Table).

We then interviewed representatives of immigrant services agencies, training organizations, and other key informants about their programs and services. Through these means we recruited about a third of our immigrant respondents, all within the warehousing and FTA subsectors. We tried recruiting via a blog for immigrants, however this delivered no leads. Onsite recruitment delivered most of the immigrant interviews, including all of those in the trucking and port subsectors. We posted a recruitment flyer at a couple of worksites and approached workers at their worksites (and truckers waiting to deliver/collect containers). Some immigrant interviews were also obtained when those we had interviewed asked their friends/ colleagues to contact us.

On-site recruitment proved most successful with truckers. We tried, with limited success, to recruit employers through on-site visits and telephone contacts.

In total, forty individuals representing immigrant workers, employers, unions, a training organization, and several immigrant services organizations were interviewed. The interviews were conducted between November 2011 and May 2012, typically with at least two team members present. Interviews lasted between one and two hours each. Interviews were conducted at SFU Surrey and Harbour Centre campuses; at workplaces, especially of agencies; in homes; coffee shops; and some were conducted in the vehicles of truckers as they waited to collect or

deliver loads. We compiled most of the immigrant interviews into work-life histories / stories, as summarised in Table A1.

The statistical data used in this study is taken from the 1991 to 2006 Population Census. We analyzed microdata at the SFU Research Data Center. This is the so-called long-form census, derived from the 20% of the population who were asked details about their immigration status, occupation and industry of employment, income, education, ethnic origin, as well as a series of standard demographic indicators (age, sex, marital status, etc.).

Table A1: Interviews Conducted

	Interviews converted into immigrant work-life stories	Other interviews
Trucking	Parry Jalal Kassim Chetana Marcus Ray Rom	Immigrant workers (2) Union member and employer (1) Union official (1)
Warehousing	Yu Amy Joe	Immigrant worker-seeker (1) Employer (1) Union official (1)
Port	Han Luke	Employer (1) Union member (1)
FTA	John Sally Isabel	Immigrant worker (1)
Other	Akshat (warehouse security guard) Mary (work-seeker) Sam (call centre worker)	Training institution (1) Industry association (1) Immigrant services (10 individuals from 5 agencies)

Note: names have been changed to protect the anonymity of respondents.

Geographically, we included all those working in the Vancouver, Abbotsford, and Chilliwack census (metropolitan) agglomerations, which essentially cover the entire BC Lower Mainland (the Lower Mainland is sometimes defined as two regional districts: all of the Greater Vancouver Regional District is included in our definition, as are the two core urban areas of the Fraser Valley Regional District).

We included only those who worked in the year prior to the census, and who earned between \$500 and \$500,000 in that year. We set these outer boundaries to avoid the distorting effect of people who worked only a very small number of hours, or whose income was somehow misreported; this reduced the recorded number of workers by about 5%.

Industry classification systems changed during this study period: until 2001, Statistics Canada used a system based on the Standard Industry Classification (SIC) system, and from 2001, it used the North American Industrial Classification (NAICS) system. In the microdata, 2001 is a bridge year, with an industry identified using both systems. In order to reduce the impact of this change on the reported results, we aligned the classification systems as best as possible, and also adjusted the 2006 (NAICS-based) counts by the ratio of the 2001 SIC to NAICS-based counts (see Table A2).

The change in classification was not significant in any port-logistics subsector, except for Freight Transport Arrangement where ‘logistics’ has emerged relatively recently to blur the boundaries between freight forwarding, brokerage, and specialized consulting. We adjusted the SIC-based definition of “Other Service Industries Incidental to Transportation” using selected occupations to create a comparable group to the NAICS-based subsector classification.

Table A2 Correspondence Table for Sector Classification

Sector	1991-2001 (SIC)	2001-2006 (NAICS)
Port	<p>“Water Transport Industries”.</p> <p>“Service Industries Incidental to Water Transport”.</p>	<p>“Water Transportation”.</p> <p>“Support activities for Water Transportation”.</p>
Trucking	<p>“Truck Transport Industries”.</p>	<p>“Truck Transportation”.</p> <p>“Support activities for Road Transportation”.</p>
Warehousing	<p>“Storage and Warehousing Industries”.</p>	<p>“Warehousing and Storage”.</p>
Freight Transport Arrangement	<p>“Other Service Industries Incidental to Transportation”, excluding those occupations related to highway, road, and bridge maintenance.</p> <p>“Management Consulting” and “Other Business Services”, including only those occupations related to transportation.</p> <p>All of those whose occupation is “Customs, ship and other brokers” and who are not otherwise included in water transport, trucking, or warehousing.</p>	<p>“Freight Transportation Arrangement”.</p> <p>“Other support activities for Transportation”.</p>
Port-logistics	<p>All of the above plus:</p> <p>“Rail Transport and Related Service Industries”</p>	<p>All of the above plus:</p> <p>“Rail Transportation”.</p> <p>“Support activities for Rail Transportation”.</p>

